

STATE OF MICHIGAN

MICHIGAN NATIONAL GUARD - AGENCY,

vs.

ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL  
VOLUME II

RENEE REED,

Appellant.

\_\_\_\_\_ /

MILITARY HEARING

BEFORE COLONEL KEVIN K. DAWKINS, HEARING EXAMINER

Camp Grayling, Michigan - Thursday, October 16, 2014

APPEARANCES:

For the Agency:

CPT DAVID J. BEDELLS, ESQ., (P55590)

Deputy General Counsel

Michigan Army & Air National Guard

3411 N. Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.

Lansing, Michigan 48906

517-481-8100

For the Appellant:

BEN BANCHS

Laborers' International Union of

North America

Business Manager, National Guard

District Council

P.O. Box 1794

Abita Springs, Louisiana 70420

985-249-2315

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Also Present:                   Renee Reed  
                                  SSG Steven Schultz, Assist. CPT Bedells  
                                  LTC Alice Niedergall  
                                  MAJ Allyn Johnson, Labor Relations  
                                  Specialist  
                                  James Sweat, President 2132 Local  
                                  Ja'net Vallotton, 2nd Chair to Mr.Banchs

RECORDED BY:                   CURTISS REPORTING  
                                  Post Office Box 6  
                                  Traverse City, Michigan 49685  
                                  (231) 941-8715  
                                  Teresa A. Sotuyo, CER #4812

1	TABLE OF CONTENTS	
2		
3	WITNESSES:	PAGE:
4		
5	MASTER SERGEANT TROY HERBLET	
6	Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	5
7	Examination by Hearing Examiner	35
8	Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	37
9	Redirect Examination by Captain Bedells	41
10	Recross Examination by Mr. Banchs	43
11	Redirect Examination by Captain Bedells	49
12	Recross Examination by Mr. Banchs	51
13		
14	CHIEF TODD WHITCHER	
15	Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	53
16	Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	73
17		
18	CHIEF SHARON WHITCHER	
19	Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	99
20	Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	121
21		
22	MASTER SERGEANT THAD COOPER	
23	Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	151
24	Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	178
25		

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE:
CHIEF JOEL MACK, JR.	
Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	204
Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	217
MAJOR BRIAN BURRELL	
Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	239
Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	246
CHIEF ROBERT FITZPATRICK	
Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	257
Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	260
Redirect Examination by Captain Bedells	263
Recross Examination by Mr. Banchs	265

EXHIBITS:	IDENTIFIED:	RECEIVED:
PX#1 - CV		

1 COURT REPORTER: We are on the record. The  
2 time is 4:15 p.m.

3 HEARING EXAMINER: Do you swear or affirm that  
4 the testimony you're about to give in this this case is  
5 the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so  
6 help you God?

7 MASTER SERGEANT HERBLET: Yes, sir.

8 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Further, you are  
9 advised that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
10 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
11 testifying in this case.

12 MASTER SERGEANT HERBLET: Yes, sir.

13 HEARING EXAMINER: And you may have a seat. Go  
14 ahead, Captain Bedells.

15 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

16 MASTER SERGEANT TROY HERBLET

17 (At 4:15 p.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

18 DIRECT EXAMINATION

19 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

20 Q Sir, would you please state your full name for the record?

21 A **Troy Don Herblet.**

22 Q And, Master Sergeant Herblet, you were here last week and  
23 testified in another matter; correct?

24 A **Yes, sir.**

25 Q Okay. Same investigation, I'm going to ask you questions

1 on that investigation, but it's pertaining to a different  
2 individual. Are you tracking?

3 **A Yes, sir.**

4 **Q** You know Master Sergeant Reed; correct?

5 **A Yes, I do, sir.**

6 **Q** Okay. And at one point were you not her supervisor?

7 **A Yes, I was.**

8 **Q** And what was the time frame where you were--where you were  
9 her supervisor if you recall?

10 **A I went back and looked at some of the old time and**  
11 **attendance worksheets. And it seemed like it was the first**  
12 **part of February 2012 when that was done.**

13 **Q** You mean when you were no longer her supervisor?

14 **A Yes; yes, sir.**

15 **Q** Okay. So and then when do you believe you first became her  
16 supervisor?

17 **A Somewhere around 2008, possibly 2009, but it'd be early in**  
18 **2009. My records only go back to like the first part of**  
19 **2009, and she was on there then.**

20 **Q** So roughly 2008, 2009 to February of 2012--

21 **A Yes.**

22 **Q** --you were Master Sergeant Reed's first-line supervisor;  
23 is that correct?

24 **A Yes, sir.**

25 **Q** Okay, great. And I'm going--and forgive me, because I'm

1 going to draw upon what we learned last week. Are you a  
2 wage leader? Is that your--

3 **A No, sir. Supervisor.**

4 Q What are you currently?

5 **A Wage supervisor.**

6 Q Wage supervisor. And how long have you been in that  
7 position?

8 **A Since 2006, August 2006.**

9 Q Okay. I would assume that during the time frame 2008, 2009  
10 roughly to February 2012, you interacted pretty regularly  
11 with Master Sergeant Reed. Is that fair to say?

12 **A Yes, sir.**

13 Q Because you were her supervisor?

14 **A Yes, sir.**

15 Q Was she a production controller during that time frame?

16 **A Yes, sir.**

17 Q Okay. And you were a wage supervisor; correct?

18 **A Yes, sir.**

19 Q How often would you say that you interacted with Master  
20 Sergeant Reed?

21 **A It depended on what was going on as far as the work flow  
22 and job orders, that kind of stuff, shop stock, parts, all  
23 that stuff. It just depended on what was going on.**

24 Q Well, describe for me, because if you haven't been able to  
25 tell from last week--most of these people have--I'm not

1 real familiar with how the technician--

2 **A Okay.**

3 **Q** --MATES program works over here. What is--what is the  
4 nature of your relationship? You know, explain what  
5 you--why you would meet and how did you interact with her?

6 **A Okay. Well, I was hired to run the maintenance shop, the**  
7 **wheels--old wheel shop is what they called it. And then**  
8 **due to not--there wasn't enough supervisors to manage all**  
9 **the sections, so they shuffled people around different**  
10 **sections. Smaller sections had--got assigned to different**  
11 **supervisors. But my main goal was to run the maintenance**  
12 **shop on the north end of the shop. And they were attached**  
13 **to me for that period of time, and I did their time and**  
14 **attendance and managed them and stuff.**

15 **Q** You say you did their time and attendance, so I'm  
16 presuming you supervised more than one person. Correct?

17 **A Yes, yes.**

18 **Q** Okay. And I think you did testify to this last week. But  
19 approximately how many people were you supervising, again,  
20 in this 2008, 2009, 2012--

21 **A Between 22 and 25 probably.**

22 **Q** So when you say you did their time and attendance, did you  
23 do Master Sergeant Reed's time and attendance?

24 **A Yes, sir.**

25 **Q** Did you do her leave slips?



1    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

2    Q    Okay. Did you do her evaluations?

3    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

4    Q    Were you ever--strike that. What did you think of Master  
5       Sergeant Reed in terms of her proficiency?

6    **A**    **She was very good.**

7    Q    Production controller?

8    **A**    **Yeah, yeah.**

9    Q    That seems to be the consensus.

10   **A**    **Yeah.**

11   Q    At some point, though, did Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
12       advise you, when you were in fact her supervisor that,  
13       "Hey, Master Sergeant Reed's going to report to me"?

14   **A**    **It went sort of like that. I'm not sure exactly how it**  
15       **worked. I know all of the sudden I was gone out of the**  
16       **picture and I ended up with another section. So it was--I**  
17       **don't know if it was something I did or if it was just**  
18       **time for me to take charge of the other section. So I**  
19       **ended up with the electronics and the armament section**  
20       **after I was done on them.**

21   Q    Okay. Well, that really doesn't answer my question. At one  
22       point, did Lieutenant Colonel Golnick tell you while she  
23       was--while you were her first-line supervisor, "Hey,  
24       Master Sergeant Herblet, she's going to report to me"?

25   **A**    **I don't remember him saying that, but I was told that I**

1           **just did the T&A, the time and attendance. So I took that**  
2           **as there was no supervision role there anymore.**

3    Q       But did she still--did her PD still fall under you as--

4    **A       Yes.**

5    Q       Okay. So her--so she's really still on the books, for lack  
6           of a better term--she continued to be one of your  
7           employees; correct?

8    **A       Yes.**

9    Q       You continued to be her first-line supervisor in other  
10          words; correct?

11   **A       Yes, sir.**

12   Q       But Lieutenant Colonel Golnick--well, strike that. So  
13          someone told you, but you don't know that it was  
14          Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

15   **A       It all happened so quick, it was only a period of a couple**  
16          **days between when they worked for me and then they were**  
17          **gone, and I--that was it. They fell under Colonel McNamara**  
18          **after that. It was only a couple-day period so--**

19   Q       Do you remember meeting with Staff Sergeant Schultz and I  
20          back in April?

21   **A       Yes, sir.**

22   Q       And you don't recall telling either of us that you were  
23          told by Master Sergeant--or by Lieutenant Colonel Golnick,  
24          "Hey, she reports to me"?

25   **A       I don't remember saying--**

1 Q And if you don't--okay.

2 A --"reports," but I knew that I was not--as far as  
3 supervision goes, I was not that guy. I don't know as far  
4 as reports--I was still doing the time and attendance.

5 Q Why would you do the time and attendance and not anything  
6 else that a supervisor was supposed to do?

7 A I don't know, sir.

8 Q Did you do it for anyone else? Did you--for any of those  
9 other 22 employees, did you do just the time and  
10 attendance?

11 A Well, I was also told with Smock also not to interfere  
12 with what he had going on so--

13 Q Okay. So for--so you were supervising Joe Smock at the  
14 same time--

15 A Yes.

16 Q --as well?

17 A Yeah.

18 Q So for two employees out of the 22 or so, you were told  
19 you're going to do just the time and attendance; is that  
20 correct?

21 A Yes, sir.

22 Q Okay. Who was going to do the other things that you should  
23 have been doing?

24 A Colonel Golnick was.

25 Q And what would those things be?

1    **A**       **Just day-to-day things is like--what the other individual**  
2           **was building maintenance and stuff that had to be done out**  
3           **at camp and run the cardboard recycling stuff and--**

4    **Q**       Well, what I'm getting at--that wasn't artfully drafted  
5           question.

6    **A**       **Okay.**

7    **Q**       Okay. Who was going to--who was going to approve Master  
8           Sergeant Smock's--well, strike that. It's irrelevant. Who  
9           was going to--who was going to approve Master Sergeant  
10          Reed's leave slips?

11   **A**       **Like I said, it was only a couple-day period, and I was--I**  
12          **was still doing the time and attendance until I handed it**  
13          **off to Colonel McNamara.**

14   **Q**       Was it--well, I thought you just testified--I thought you  
15          just testified that it was Lieutenant Colonel Golnick who  
16          you believed was going to do these other responsibilities?

17   **A**       **Right. But when--when I handed off that section and I was**  
18          **no longer the supervisor, I handed it to Colonel McNamara.**  
19          **He was then in charge of that section.**

20                           HEARING EXAMINER: I think I can help.

21                           CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Please do.

22                           HEARING EXAMINER: So you're talking about two  
23          different things. You're talking about Colonel Golnick  
24          coming to you when you officially on paper were  
25          supervising Master Sergeant Reed--and he coming to

1           you--this wasn't the shop moving out from under your  
2           supervision. This was this individual moving out from  
3           under your supervision?

4                         THE WITNESS:   Yes, sir.

5                         HEARING EXAMINER:   But you still had time and  
6           attendance?

7                         THE WITNESS:   Yes.

8                         HEARING EXAMINER:   Now, time and attendance  
9           means doing the timesheets, but it also means  
10          potentially--did you just do the administrative stuff for  
11          the time and attendance? Or did you actually approve leave  
12          from that point on when he said--when Golnick said, "I'm  
13          taking over"?

14                        THE WITNESS:   There was a period of time there  
15          that I remember doing leave slips. But then sometimes I  
16          didn't do them all because any supervisor was signing the  
17          leave slips so--I mean, I don't--didn't--can't say that I  
18          signed every leave slip that everybody in my section  
19          approved. Because I do the early shifts so I leave at  
20          2:30. If somebody wants to leave at 3:30, well, then  
21          somebody else has to approve it.

22                        HEARING EXAMINER:   So from the time Colonel  
23          Golnick relinquished you of responsibility for Master  
24          Sergeant Reed, between then and when you officially had  
25          that shop moved under Colonel McNamara, do you remember

1 approving any leave for Master Sergeant Reed?

2 THE WITNESS: Not really.

3 HEARING EXAMINER: I don't know if that helps.

4 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

5 Q It does help, but--it does help. Forgive my ignorance.

6 What I'm trying--what I'm trying to get at is, why was it  
7 that there were two employees, out of the 22 that you  
8 supervised, who you were only doing time and attendance  
9 for and then you continued with the remainder of those  
10 employees, the other 20 and presumably did everything for  
11 them, leave slips, everything?

12 A Yes, sir.

13 Q Okay. So the question becomes who told you that, as you  
14 testified, Joe Smock and Renee Reed, you don't supervise  
15 them anymore?

16 A Yes, sir, the boss did.

17 Q Who's the boss?

18 A Colonel Golnick.

19 Q Okay. And so for what--and again, forgive my--I don't  
20 understand this. Was that only for a two-day period?

21 A There was--I can't remember how many days it was, but it  
22 was right at the end of when I was done supervising those  
23 sections. When I was done supervising those sections,  
24 everything--I mean, it seemed like it was a couple days to  
25 me now, but it could have been longer.

1 Q I'm not holding you to--that's not what I meant.

2 A Okay.

3 Q But it wasn't a year?

4 A No.

5 Q Did it strike you as odd that--

6 A Yeah.

7 Q --the boss comes and says, "Hey, these two employees I'm  
8 going to deal with them"? Did that strike you as odd?

9 A Yes, sir.

10 Q Did you ask him why?

11 A No, sir.

12 Q Why not? Why didn't you ask him?

13 A Because I've dealt with him for years, and I know how he  
14 was. There's one--

15 Q How was he?

16 A There's one way to do things, and it's his way. And if he  
17 told you that, that's the way it was. And I learned that  
18 over time you don't argue with people like that, and he's  
19 the boss.

20 Q Okay. I can understand that. And I subscribe to that same  
21 philosophy. Why argue. In your mind, what was the reason?  
22 And it's speculation. I understand. You're speculating as  
23 to why Chris Golnick is doing this. But speculate for us  
24 or for the Hearing Examiner. Why did he do this?

25 A I don't know, sir. Just the way he was, I guess.

1 Q You never even hazarded a guess? It didn't bother you at  
2 all?

3 A **Well, I know how things happen in the shop sometimes like  
4 in the--explain this on the Smock side because--**

5 Q No. Let's not--

6 A **No, okay.**

7 Q I don't want--we're short on time.

8 A **Yeah, okay.**

9 Q So as it pertains to Master Sergeant Reed, you didn't even  
10 want to--didn't give it a second thought like, "okay,  
11 boss, if you want to--if you want to supervise her, that's  
12 fine"?

13 A **Yes, sir. But she didn't need any supervision because--I  
14 mean, it wasn't a big deal. She was there. She checked in.  
15 She was doing her job every day. It wasn't like--**

16 Q I get that, yeah. She was by all accounts a very good  
17 production controller. Now, at some point did Lieutenant  
18 Colonel Golnick tell you to change a technician evaluation  
19 that you had done for Master Sergeant Reed?

20 A **Yes, sir.**

21 Q Okay. Can you explain to the Hearing Examiner the  
22 circumstances surrounding this evaluation and Lieutenant  
23 Colonel Golnick's request to change it?

24 A **It was a miscommunication. I don't know if you're familiar  
25 with the new program, the TAA stuff.**



1 Q Master Sergeant, as you can tell, I'm not familiar--  
2 A Okay.  
3 Q --with a whole lot on the technician side.  
4 A We'd just went to a new program, and I was--I understood  
5 from the training we went to that everybody's rated at a  
6 3. That's totally successful. And then if they do somebody  
7 above and beyond, it's just like an NCOAR. You've got to  
8 substantiate how great this and that and the other thing  
9 is. Well, I took that as everybody's a three, but then I  
10 might--I evaluated her with a couple four's or something  
11 and he thought she deserved a five so--because there was a  
12 QSI pay raise. He wanted to get her a pay raise so she had  
13 to have a higher grade so--  
14 Q Okay. Was it--  
15 A Which I--and I didn't understand that at the time but she  
16 did--I thought she deserved it so.  
17 Q Okay. I think I--I think I get the drift here but let me  
18 go through it a little bit slower. Okay. At this point,  
19 when this happens, are you her first-line supervisor?  
20 A Yes, sir.  
21 Q I presume you are because you're the one who gave her--  
22 A Yes.  
23 Q --three's and four's correct?  
24 A Yes, sir.  
25 Q Do you recall approximately what year this occurred?

1    **A**    **No, I don't, sir. I could look--**

2    Q       Was it prior to the investigation?

3    **A**    **Oh, yeah.**

4    Q       It must have been because you--

5    **A**    **Yeah.**

6    Q       --you stopped being her supervisor in February 2012;

7       right?

8    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

9    Q       Right, okay. Do you recall where you were when

10       Lieutenant--well, strike that. How did you Lieutenant

11       Colonel advise you--Lieutenant Colonel Golnick advise you,

12       "Hey, I want to give Master Sergeant Reed a quality step

13       increase and we need to change her technician evaluation"?

14       In other words, email, telephone, in person?

15   **A**    **No. We were walking down the hallway actually.**

16   Q       Okay. At MATES?

17   **A**    **Yeah.**

18   Q       Do you recall what hallway you were walking down?

19   **A**    **Not really.**

20   Q       But at MATES in the hallway?

21   **A**    **Uh-huh.**

22   Q       And is that--was that the only conversation you had? In

23       other words, was that--that was his only intent when he

24       talked to you on this particular walk down the hallway is,

25       "Hey, Master Sergeant, I've got to talk to you about that

1 technician evaluation"?

2 **A He actually told me that for a QSI, which--I was supposed**  
3 **to do the QSI. But I didn't realize that it had to be all**  
4 **five's. So that he was just telling me I couldn't do that**  
5 **without having the five's for the step increase.**

6 HEARING EXAMINER: Can I get clarification  
7 here? Was it your intent to put her in for a QSI?

8 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

9 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay.

10 MR. BANCHS: If you don't understand the  
11 process, then it doesn't make sense.

12 HEARING EXAMINER: Yeah. So here's what he's  
13 saying. He wanted to give her--Sergeant Herblet wanted to  
14 give her a QSI. He didn't realize that he needed to give  
15 her a total five rating to get a QSI. He had written  
16 three's and four's, so Colonel Golnick was saying, hey, if  
17 you want to give her--if you want to give her a QSI,  
18 you're going to have to raise it to a five.

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. I got it.

20 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

21 Q Was it your intent to give anyone else QSIs during this  
22 same evaluation period?

23 **A I only had the--I only had two GS employees, and the other**  
24 **one was already maxed out.**

25 Q Who was it?

1    **A**     **Janet Fouts.**

2    Q     Okay. So she couldn't get a QSI?

3    **A**     **No.**

4    Q     Well, do you recall what numbers you gave her?

5    **A**     **I gave everybody about the same. Renee was higher than**

6           **Janet though because I had--my misinterpretation of the**

7           **system--**

8    Q     Right.

9    **A**     **--was everybody's a three in case you could substantiate**

10           **by numbers why they deserved a higher rating. So if they**

11           **were just ho-hum employees, they got three's.**

12   Q     And you had given--you had given presumably Janet ho-hum

13           three's; correct?

14   **A**     **Yes, sir.**

15   Q     But gave Master Sergeant Reed some four's?

16   **A**     **Yeah.**

17   Q     Because I'm not--I'm not clear on this. And you do recall

18           our meeting on 29 April 2014; right?

19   **A**     **It was a long time ago; yes, sir, I remember meeting with**

20           **you.**

21   Q     Yeah, yeah. And it's your testimony here today that it was

22           actually your intent to give her a QSI, not--

23   **A**     **Well, there was two--**

24   Q     --not Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's?

25   **A**     **There was two QSIs that--we've gone through two QSIs or**

1           so. I mean, I was going to give it to her, but I didn't  
2           give it to her. She got--they got put in by Colonel  
3           Golnick. It was my intent to give her a QSI, but I  
4           didn't--I'm not the one who gave it to her.

5    Q       Okay. And that's because of the misunderstanding of the  
6           rating?

7    A       **With the rating scheme, yes, or the--whatever you want to  
8           call it.**

9                           MR. BANCHS: Just for your clarification,  
10           Captain, you do understand that GS employees are the only  
11           ones who get QSIs?

12                          CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Yeah. I get it.

13                          MR. BANCHS: All right.

14   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

15   Q       What I'm missing--what I'm not clear on is when--we met  
16           back on April 29. So if you said something different on  
17           April 29 of 2014, it would--in other words, as to who the  
18           impetus for the QSI was, you're saying that--

19   A       **Colonel Golnick gave her the QSI, sir.**

20   Q       I get that. But what you're telling us here today is that  
21           if he hadn't given it and if you had had the--if you had  
22           understood the number scheme correctly, you would have  
23           given her the QSI; is that correct?

24   A       **One of the two, yes, sir. There was two QSIs over the  
25           period when I was the supervisor.**

1 Q Did she get a quality step increase on both occasions?

2 A **Yes.**

3 Q On two occasions?

4 A **Yes.**

5 Q Did you support the QSI on both occasions?

6 A **I supported them but I did not--I didn't put them in for  
7 them.**

8 Q Okay. How many did you put her in for?

9 A **I was going to put her in for one but that got done--**

10 Q Okay. So now we're getting to it. So you are clarifying  
11 it. Okay.

12 A **Yeah.**

13 Q So let's talk about--let's talk about the first QSI. Okay?

14 And I understand--I'm not going to hold you to dates. The  
15 first quality step increase that Master Sergeant Reed  
16 received when you were her supervisor, okay, did--you say  
17 you supported both of them. But--strike that. You didn't  
18 say you supported--did you believe she should have  
19 received the first quality step increase?

20 A **Yes, sir.**

21 Q Okay.

22 A **I didn't know anything about the QSI because I had just--I  
23 mean, I was new, and I didn't know that they could even  
24 get that. Because I've never had any GS employees.**

25 Q But what I'm--what I'm asking is you did--the first

1 instance in which she received a QSI and you're her  
2 supervisor--

3 **A Uh-huh.**

4 **Q** Okay? You put her in for it?

5 **A** **No. It was my--when I heard about the QSI, it was my idea,**  
6 **but I didn't--I mean, I would have done it if I knew how**  
7 **or if I did--but I didn't have to. I didn't do it.**

8 **Q** Then who initiated it if you didn't?

9 **A** **Colonel Golnick did.**

10 **Q** Because you say you didn't understand it?

11 **A** **It's not that I didn't understand it, it was because of**  
12 **the rating and everything else. And it was already taken**  
13 **care of by the time it come around.**

14 **Q** The QSI number two--

15 **A** **I didn't have anything to do with that.**

16 **Q** Well, that's where--

17 **A** **But did I think she deserved--**

18 **Q** That's what we're getting to.

19 **A** **Okay.**

20 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay? So the second--well,  
21 is this supposed to clarify it for me?

22 SERGEANT SCHULTZ: That's the QSI, sir.

23 THE WITNESS: Is there two? There is two;  
24 correct?

25 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. So the second--

1 MR. BANCHS: Are we introducing that into  
2 evidence by the way?

3 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No. I'm just--I think it's  
4 been given to me for clarification purposes. I'll show it  
5 to him if he needs--

6 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

7 Q If you need to refresh your recollection--but I want to  
8 ask you this question. The second quality step increase  
9 that Master Sergeant Reed received when you were her  
10 first-line supervisor, you just testified you don't know  
11 anything about that? Is that correct?

12 A **It might have been after the fact but I don't--I didn't**  
13 **initiate either one of them. I didn't do the paperwork for**  
14 **it. I might have signed it. Is that what you--**

15 Q Well, what I was getting at is you're her--you're her  
16 supervisor?

17 A **Uh-huh.**

18 Q Okay? In the normal course of the technician--the  
19 technician supervisor business, I presume it's the  
20 supervisor who says, "I think you're worthy of a quality  
21 step increase." Is that fair to say?

22 A **Yes. And that conversation did happen the first time.**

23 Q On the--right, okay.

24 A **Yeah.**

25 Q So what I'm--when I look at my notes from 29 April of this



1 year and our conversation, maybe they pertain to the  
2 second quality step increase that Master Sergeant Reed  
3 received when you were her supervisor. And you--you said  
4 that--you said that you had nothing to do with that  
5 quality step increase, which is essentially what you're  
6 saying here today. Okay? And that Lieutenant Colonel  
7 Golnick told you to change Master Sergeant Reed's  
8 technician evaluation?

9 **A Yes, sir.**

10 **Q** That was painful. My apologies. Okay. Did you ever observe  
11 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in Master Sergeant Reed's  
12 office?

13 **A Yes, sir.**

14 **Q** Okay. Would you observe--did you ever observe Lieutenant  
15 Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed eating together  
16 in Master Sergeant Reed's office?

17 **A Yes, sir.**

18 **Q** Did you observe them, if you recall, eating breakfast?

19 **A No, sir.**

20 **Q** If you recall, did you observe them eating lunch?

21 **A I avoided the area altogether actually, sir, but I mean, I**  
22 **know that they were--**

23 **Q** Well, you did observe them eating?

24 **A At 12:30. Yeah, at 12:30 you walked by there, yeah,**  
25 **they're eating lunch probably, yeah.**

1 Q Okay. If you walked by there?

2 A **Yeah.**

3 Q And at the same time you just testified you tried to avoid  
4 it. Why did you try to avoid it?

5 A **I didn't have any reason to go over there.**

6 Q Okay. But if you did find yourself over there, what do you  
7 think the chances were that you were going to observe the  
8 two of them eating around 12:30 in her office?

9 MR. BANCHS: Object. What are the chances?

10 HEARING EXAMINER: Well, ask how often.

11 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

12 Q Okay. How often--okay, fair enough. How often do you think  
13 you observed Master Sergeant Reed and Master Sergeant--or  
14 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick eating in Master Sergeant  
15 Reed's office?

16 A **I don't know.**

17 Q How many times? Let's just--let's put it that way.

18 A **No idea, sir.**

19 Q More than once?

20 A **Oh, yes, sir.**

21 Q Many more times than once?

22 A **Probably, yes, sir; yeah.**

23 Q Okay. Do you ever observe Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and  
24 Master Sergeant Reed working out in the gym together?

25 A **No, sir, because, like I said, I leave at 2:30, and they**

1           **work out at the end of the day. So I wouldn't have seen**  
2           **them.**

3    Q       What time did you start in the morning?

4    A       **I open up the shop at 5:30.**

5    Q       5:30 to 2:30 you worked?

6    A       **Yeah.**

7    Q       Okay. Did you--how did you perceive the relationship  
8           between Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant  
9           Reed?

10   A       **How did I perceive it?**

11   Q       Yeah.

12   A       **I thought it was a little strange.**

13   Q       How so?

14   A       **Just the amount of time and stuff as far as how much time**  
15           **was--they spent.**

16   Q       How much time would you estimate they spent together? And  
17           I understand you might lack the foundation because you  
18           said you tried to avoid it. Right?

19   A       **Right, sir; yeah.**

20   Q       Okay. So bearing in mind that you tried to avoid it and  
21           not be around there, and there's no reason for you to be  
22           there, how did you form an opinion that they spent an  
23           inordinate amount of time together?

24   A       **Just by every time you walked by there when you had to.**  
25           **When you have to walk by there, I mean, it's just--it's**

1           **not that big of a place.**

2    Q       Every time you walk by where?

3    **A       When you go by the office.**

4    Q       Whose office?

5    **A       Production control office, Sergeant Reed's office.**

6    Q       Okay. Every time you walked by Master Sergeant Reed's

7           office what?

8    **A       They--it seemed like Colonel Golnick was in there almost**

9           **every time. I wouldn't say every time but maybe--**

10   Q       Isn't it the case that if you were actually looking for

11           Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and he wasn't in his office,

12           where do you think you'd find him?

13   **A       Production control office.**

14   Q       And whose--whose office is that?

15   **A       Sergeant Reed's.**

16   Q       Right. Okay. Did you ever confront Master Sergeant Reed

17           about, you know, what you perceived?

18   **A       I didn't. I don't like that word, the "perceived" thing**

19           **because that's--when it was confronted that with the--at**

20           **the maintenance conference when somebody--Colonel Maddin**

21           **had come forward and said that somebody had a complaint**

22           **that the perception of an inappropriate relationship, it**

23           **was talked about then. But I didn't perceive that there**

24           **was anything like you're saying.**

25   Q       What do you mean you--what am I saying?

1    **A**    **I don't--**

2    Q    I'm not trying to say anything because I can't provide  
3        testimony. I'm asking questions. I'm not trying to say  
4        anything.

5    **A**    **There was a strange situation bit it wasn't--I mean,--to**  
6        **prove something was wrong, I couldn't--that wasn't me. I**  
7        **wasn't--I wasn't a witness to anything. I mean, it was**  
8        **strange, but it's not--**

9    Q    Right, yeah. And let me be clear since Sergeant Schultz  
10        just drew upon a point. I'm not trying to suggest there  
11        was anything sexual in this relationship at all if  
12        that's--if that's what you mean. But what I want to do is  
13        talk about perceptions. I want you to read what I--an  
14        unsworn--you provided a sworn statement in connection with  
15        the 15-6; correct?

16   **A**    **Yeah.**

17   Q    Okay. Just one or two?

18   **A**    **I don't remember. How long ago was that?**

19   Q    You wrote in--you wrote in your--this is an unsworn  
20        statement--

21   **A**    **There was not a formal counseling, yeah, which we just**  
22        **talked about--**

23   Q    What I'm saying is just your last sentence--your  
24        second-to-last sentence says, "As stated in the"--

25                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Ben, I'm at his first

1 unsworn statement as an attachment to your reply.

2 MR. BANCHS: Roger that.

3 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

4 Q But you wrote, "As stated in the attached document, I  
5 discussed perceptions of this nature"?

6 A Right.

7 Q So you don't like the term "perceptions" but--

8 A Right.

9 Q --you wrote the--you wrote the word "perceived"?

10 A Because that's what it what said, sir. Someone had the  
11 perception that there was an inappropriate relationship,  
12 so I explained from the--if you look in the SHARPs manual,  
13 the perception--if somebody has a perception it's like  
14 you've got to dig yourself out of a hole because somebody  
15 perceives something's going wrong--is what I explained by  
16 "perception."

17 Q Okay. So you did confront Master Sergeant Reed; correct?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And what did you tell her?

20 A Just like I just said, the perception is there and then  
21 the burden of proof is on you.

22 Q Is that all you told her?

23 A Yeah, because she got upset, and that was the end of the  
24 conversation.

25 Q How did she get upset? Did she yell at you?

1    **A**    **No.**

2    Q    Cry?

3    **A**    **Yeah. I don't remember--**

4    Q    Did she say anything when she was crying?

5    **A**    **"Nothing's going on," something along those lines.**

6    Q    Nothing going--I mean, how did you take that? I mean, she

7    told you this, "nothing's going on." Did you mean

8    like--did you interpret that to be nothing sexual is going

9    on?

10   **A**    **I don't know what she meant by saying that.**

11   Q    Okay. Or did you--did you--well you don't know what she

12   meant? Okay. I get it so--

13   **A**    **Well, that's--I would assume maybe that's what she**

14   **thought. But I don't know what she was thinking or what**

15   **she was--**

16   Q    And you didn't--you didn't draw any conclusions about a

17   sexual relationship going on at all, did you?

18   **A**    **No.**

19   Q    And in fact I want to tell you, Master Sergeant Herblet,

20   the IO, Colonel Doolittle, he doesn't suggest that there's

21   anything sexual. So what I want to do is dispense with

22   that altogether.

23   **A**    **Okay.**

24   Q    Okay? So that's not why Master Sergeant Reed was

25   terminated. Okay?

1   **A**    **Okay.**

2   **Q**    But you've characterized the relationship as strange, and  
3           what I'm trying to get at is what did you find strange  
4           about it? You testified that they spent an inordinate  
5           amount of time together and then when you went--when you  
6           had occasion--and you didn't all the time. But when you  
7           had occasion to go by her office, he was in there;  
8           correct?

9   **A**    **Yes, sir.**

10  **Q**    Did you talk to--you talked to Master Sergeant Reed about  
11           this relationship. Did you talk to Lieutenant Colonel  
12           Golnick about this relationship?

13  **A**    **No, sir.**

14  **Q**    And I gather that would be because, as you testified  
15           earlier, you just steered clear of that guy; right?

16  **A**    **Yeah; yes, sir.**

17  **Q**    I'm still not comfortable on this quality step increase  
18           stuff, but I'm going to let it go.

19                           HEARING EXAMINER: I have some questions I'm  
20           going to ask about that so--

21                           CAPTAIN BEDELLS: And I know you're the  
22           expert, sir, so that--

23                           HEARING EXAMINER: Well, that's--

24  BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

25  **Q**    So I'm going to leave it to the Hearing Examiner and spare



1           you my--and I appreciate--Master Sergeant Herblet, if I  
2           seemed impatient, it's my own--it's my own frustration in  
3           not understanding--

4   **A     Right.**

5   Q     --how this process works. So I didn't mean to be hostile  
6           or anything like that. I'm just frustrated because  
7           I--because I can't wrap my head around what we're talking  
8           about. Let me ask you this, though, in closing. You're  
9           still working there; right?

10 **A     Yes, sir.**

11 Q     At MATES?

12 **A     Yes, sir.**

13 Q     Okay. As a wage supervisor; correct?

14 **A     Yes, sir.**

15 Q     Right? And are you supervising Master Sergeant Reed's  
16           replacement?

17 **A     No, sir.**

18 Q     Who is if you know?

19 **A     It's--we had a whole other supervisor for that stuff now,  
20           Major Burrell.**

21 Q     Okay. Do you have--and do you know who her replacement is?

22 **A     Yes.**

23 Q     What's his--

24 **A     Ryan Bower.**

25 Q     Ryan Bower, okay. And do you interact with Ryan Bower at

1 all?

2 **A Not as much anymore as I used to. I used to when he worked**  
3 **for me, yes. But I don't that much anymore.**

4 **Q** Do you interact with Ryan Bower in his capacity as a  
5 production controller?

6 **A If I--when I have to, yes, sir.**

7 **Q** Okay. And I understand Master Sergeant Reed was an  
8 excellent production controller.

9 **A Uh-huh.**

10 **Q** With that in mind, I mean, how is MATES operating now that  
11 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed are no  
12 longer there?

13 **A It's a lot of different.**

14 **Q** How is it different?

15 **A It doesn't seem to be as well organized. Different things**  
16 **are--people got different ways of doing things, so**  
17 **they--you know, people doing things differently.**

18 **Q** Understandable. We had someone who testified earlier that  
19 actually things are better. And you say, no, things aren't  
20 better, so there's a little--

21 **A Well, not on the supervision side possibly. You can ask**  
22 **the other supervisors. But I don't think it's any better**  
23 **as far--on the supervision side as far as people making**  
24 **decisions that maybe sometimes one person should make a**  
25 **decision. I don't know. But instead of everybody making**



1 all a five or make it a total of a five to be able  
2 to--that was initially your thought to award Master  
3 Sergeant Reed with a QSI?

4 **A Can I back up and explain that a little bit better**  
5 **possibly?**

6 Q Sure.

7 **A I didn't know about the QSI process when I--was brought to**  
8 **my attention, I said, well, heck, yeah, that's a good**  
9 **idea.**

10 Q So you didn't even know there was such a thing as a QSI?

11 **A No, I did not.**

12 Q Got it.

13 **A Because I never--I was running a maintenance shop.**

14 Q Yeah.

15 **A We don't have any--**

16 Q Yeah.

17 **A --any GS employees out there. So I didn't know that. But**  
18 **when I found out that that was an available option, I said**  
19 **yeah, I agree. And then I had to change the rating because**  
20 **it didn't go hand in hand with the stuff so--**

21 Q Okay. The other QSI, was that before or after the QSI you  
22 were just talking about?

23 **A I don't--I'm not sure, probably after. Was there two of**  
24 **them? You've got the record. Can we look? I don't know if**  
25 **there was two. It seems like there was. I mean,--**

1 Q I'm trying to remember--did you say you supported two  
2 QSIs?

3 A I only knew--when it was brought to my attention that that  
4 was a program or a way to--

5 Q Right.

6 A --incentive program, I agreed with that, right, but I did  
7 not do the QSI because it was done--

8 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Well, my question, sir, is  
9 who brought it to his attention. If he didn't know about  
10 it, who--

11 THE WITNESS: Colonel Golnick did, sir.

12 BY HEARING EXAMINER:

13 Q Okay. I do understand what happened with the one QSI that  
14 you were--you were involved in. I guess the other one--you  
15 didn't know--you didn't--

16 A I don't remember the dates, and I don't even--you know,  
17 I'd have to look into it.

18 Q Okay. You didn't initiate it--

19 A Unh-unh.

20 Q --you didn't write it? You're not even sure that it even  
21 happened is what you're testifying here?

22 A Right.

23 HEARING EXAMINER: I'm satisfied. Ben,  
24 you're--

25 CROSS-EXAMINATION

1 BY MR. BANCHS:

2 Q I want to make something clear, because we keep talking  
3 about two QSIs. And you did say earlier that--you did say  
4 earlier that you supported two QSIs.

5 A **Yes.**

6 Q Are you talking about the QSI with Janet Fouts that you  
7 supported?

8 A **No.**

9 Q Or you supported two QSIs on behalf of Mrs. Reed?

10 A **Mrs. Reed.**

11 Q Okay. So it's two separate QSIs?

12 A **If there was two, I would have agreed with both of them,  
13 yes.**

14 Q And when you say you supported, you felt that she deserved  
15 them?

16 A **Yes, sir.**

17 Q Okay. And you also spoke about a QSI specifically about  
18 Janet Fouts?

19 A **I was told she maxed out on the time already. So, I mean,  
20 she couldn't--she wasn't even eligible for one.**

21 Q She wasn't--she wasn't eligible for a QSI at that time?

22 A **Right.**

23 Q Because there's a time frame in between--

24 A **Exactly.**

25 Q --QSIs when you're eligible to receive another QSI?

1    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

2    Q    But you were aware that she had also received a QSI?

3    **A**    **I didn't know she received one.**

4    Q    Okay. But you were aware that she--she was not eligible  
5       for a QSI at that time because--

6    **A**    **Right.**

7    Q    --there had not been enough time that had elapsed from the  
8       last one?

9    **A**    **That's the way I believe--**

10   Q    Because it's a very small time period?

11   **A**    **Right.**

12                   MR. BANCHS: Is that better, sir?

13                   HEARING EXAMINER: It's getting better.

14 BY MR. BANCHS:

15   Q    Okay. Now, at the time that you became aware of the QSI  
16       process, you were her--do you remember what year this was?

17   **A**    **No, I don't. I'm sorry.**

18   Q    Well, you know, if we need clarification, then we can just  
19       go to the technician record. Because if QSIs were awarded,  
20       then they're going to be in there. You're a wage leader or  
21       a wage supervisor, sir?

22   **A**    **Wage supervisor.**

23   Q    So you're much more familiar with the wage side of the  
24       house than you would be with the GS side of the house;  
25       right?

1    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

2    Q    And as you understand it, what is a QSI as you understand  
3        it?

4    **A**    **It's an incentive award.**

5    Q    Right. But what happens when somebody receives a QSI? It's  
6        a quality step increase--

7    **A**    **They get--they get a pay increase.**

8    Q    --which means that they advance--

9    **A**    **Pay rate, yeah.**

10   Q    Yes, sir. And they advance in their--so if they're a WGS9  
11        and they get--well, 9 is step three, and they get a QSI,  
12        they would go--

13   **A**    **So they get step four, yeah.**

14   Q    Right. They would advance quicker than they normally would  
15        have?

16   **A**    **Yes, sir.**

17   Q    Which the equivalent on the GS side of the house would be  
18        if you're a WG10, step three, you get advanced to a WG10  
19        step four?

20   **A**    **Right.**

21   Q    Because of special--maybe you were an outstanding employee  
22        at the time?

23   **A**    **You have ten steps on the GS side.**

24   Q    That's correct, yeah. You have more steps, ten versus  
25        five. And you felt that she merited the QSIs?



1   **A**    **Yes, sir.**

2                               MR. BANCHS:  Okay.  I want to give you time to  
3                               do--

4                               HEARING EXAMINER:  Let's go off the record for  
5                               a just a minute just to talk about administratively what  
6                               happened.

7                               COURT REPORTER:  The time is 4:52 p.m., and  
8                               we're going off the record.

9                               (Off the record)

10                              COURT REPORTER:  We are back on the record.  
11                              The time is 4:57 p.m.

12                              HEARING EXAMINER:  For clarification, we've  
13                              just reviewed the personnel file for Master Sergeant Reed.  
14                              And for the record, in 2010, Master Sergeant Herblet  
15                              initiated via a Standard Form 52--initiated a quality step  
16                              increase.  In 2011, there was also a Standard Form 52,  
17                              initiated by Colonel Golnick which was also approved,  
18                              awarding a QSI for Master Sergeant Reed.  And now I'll turn  
19                              it back over to Captain Bedells.

20                              CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Thank you, sir.

21                              REDIRECT EXAMINATION

22   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

23   Q        Okay.  Master Sergeant Herblet, the first SF-52 bears your  
24                              signature as initiating; correct?

25   **A**    **Yes, sir.**

1 Q But you've testified previously that you weren't even  
2 aware of the QSI program; correct?

3 A **Yes, sir.**

4 Q So at some point you did become aware of the QSI program;  
5 correct?

6 A **Yes, sir.**

7 Q And who told you that--who told you that Master Sergeant  
8 Reed should be awarded a QSI and thereby prompting you to  
9 fill out the SF-52?

10 A **Lieutenant Colonel Golnick.**

11 Q Okay. Now I want to move to the second one. Okay? And I've  
12 already forgotten the date, sir, of the second one.

13 MR. BANCHS: 2011.

14 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

15 Q 2011, you were--you continued to be Master Sergeant Reed's  
16 supervisor--first-line supervisor in 2011; correct?

17 A **Yes, sir.**

18 Q And there's a second SF-52 for a QSI in that year;  
19 correct?

20 A **Yes, sir.**

21 Q And we can show you the document. That does not bear your  
22 signature as the initiator; correct?

23 A **No, sir.**

24 Q Okay. Were you aware of that at all?

25 A **I don't remember off the top of my head, sir.**

1 Q But you were her first-line supervisor?

2 A **Yeah.**

3 Q Should you not have been aware of a--of a request for a  
4 quality step increase of an employee who was--who worked  
5 under you?

6 A **Yes, sir.**

7 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. That's it.

8 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Mr. Banchs?

9 MR. BANCHS: Yes, sir.

10 RE-CROSS-EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. BANCHS:

12 Q I think what the Captain is trying to ask you in regards  
13 to the first QSI--and if this is not what he's trying to  
14 ask you, then you can correct me. Were you coerced to put  
15 Sergeant Reed in for a QSI?

16 A **No, sir.**

17 Q Okay. And even though you say you didn't know--you were  
18 not aware about the second one, you did state earlier that  
19 supported--that you would be in support of both of them?

20 A **Yes, sir.**

21 Q Because you thought that she deserved them?

22 A **Yes, sir.**

23 Q Would that be accurate?

24 A **Yes, sir.**

25 Q And it's been testified not only by you but by others here

1           that she--and even Captain Bedells has stipulated that she  
2           by all intents and purposes was a very good PC, that she  
3           was very good at her job.

4   **A       Yes, sir.**

5   Q       Much has been made about the fact that Colonel Golnick  
6           came to you at some point in time and said that--that  
7           Master Sergeant Reed "reports to me." He approached you  
8           and said, "From this point forward, Master Sergeant Reed  
9           reports to me."

10 **A       Okay, sir.**

11 Q       That was the right--that's what you said earlier? At some  
12          point in time you relinquished--

13 **A       Yes, sir.**

14 Q       --supervisory duties--

15 **A       Yeah.**

16 Q       --over her at the direction of Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

17 **A       Yes, sir.**

18 Q       I'm not really clear on this. You said that that only  
19          lasted for a certain amount of time because eventually  
20          Colonel McNamara became her first-line supervisor?

21 **A       Right.**

22 Q       Okay. Was Sergeant Reed--and I know Sergeant Smock's thing  
23          has been brought up as well. Were Sergeant Reed and  
24          Sergeant Smock the only two people who Colonel Golnick was  
25          supervising at that time? Or was he supervising other

1 individuals as well?

2 **A I don't--I don't believe any--I didn't believe anything**  
3 **there. I don't know. I mean, it was just done--the whole**  
4 **section was gone.**

5 Q Right. So I mean, when you relinquished--when you  
6 relinquished supervisory duties over Mrs. Reed and Mr.  
7 Smock, did you relinquish supervisory duties over other  
8 individuals as well?

9 **A Yes. All three of the sections.**

10 Q You said that she didn't need supervision. Can you explain  
11 that to me, sir?

12 **A She'd come to work everyday and did her job.**

13 Q I don't want to get too far into the weeds, but as a GS9  
14 employee, to your understanding, what is the level that  
15 that individual requires?

16 **A Not very much.**

17 Q Not very much. So the supervisory chain is more of an  
18 administrative--

19 **A Yes.**

20 Q --than it would be so much as actual supervision, you  
21 know, on top of them; right?

22 **A Yes, sir.**

23 Q And that would be different than per se maybe like WG6 or  
24 a WG8--

25 **A Yes.**

1 Q --mechanic; right?

2 A **Absolutely.**

3 Q So even though as a wage--and as you progress especially  
4 on the--on the white collar side of the house, on the  
5 general schedule side of the house, those position  
6 descriptions are--the GS9, GS11 and higher, the higher you  
7 go in the GSA scale, the less and less supervision you  
8 actually need?

9 A **Yes, sir.**

10 Q Okay. I want to be clear on this. Did you--I hate to go  
11 back to the QSI but did you say that you gave Janet Fouts  
12 a QSI or that you were aware that she had received one in  
13 the past?

14 A **I had no idea with her. I thought she was maxed out on her  
15 steps so she wasn't really eligible for one.**

16 Q Oh, you mean like she was--

17 A **Already a 10.**

18 Q --at step 10?

19 A **Yes.**

20 Q Oh, I got you. Okay.

21 A **Okay.**

22 Q All right. Now, it is in the record and Sergeant Fouts did  
23 testify. I believe it was right before you. She did  
24 testify that she at one point had received a QSI in the  
25 past.

1    **A**     **Okay.**

2    Q     Would that surprise you?

3    **A**     **No.**

4    Q     Now, as far as you observing Sergeant Reed and Colonel  
5         Golnick eating breakfast and lunch, you're a supervisor as  
6         well; correct, sir?

7    **A**     **Yes.**

8    Q     Do you--do you eat lunch or breakfast with your  
9         subordinates?

10   **A**     **Yes.**

11   Q     Have you ever helped any of your subordinates or anybody  
12         that you work with that might be higher or lower ranking  
13         with any projects, you know, not at work?

14   **A**     **Yes, sir.**

15   Q     Like can you give me an example?

16   **A**     **Cutting firewood, stacking hay, and anything like that.**

17   Q     And this is with all manner of ranks; right?

18   **A**     **Yes, not even with people that work at the shop but, I**  
19         **mean, just to do something--**

20   Q     Okay. Is there anything strange about that?

21   **A**     **No, sir.**

22   Q     Would you say that socializing or helping each other  
23         outside of works--outside of work here at the MATES in the  
24         Grayling area, is that something that's commonplace?

25   **A**     **Yes, sir.**

1 Q Have you personally socialized with Sergeant--you know  
2 what, I'm going--I won't ask that question because  
3 you--because you state in your unsworn statement that you  
4 were--in fact when you--when you talked to Sergeant Reed  
5 about the perception that she was having an inappropriate  
6 relationship with Colonel Golnick that you talked to her  
7 and that it was not a formal counseling. It was at the NCO  
8 club at Fort Custer.

9 A **Uh-huh.**

10 Q So was that more as friends--

11 A **Yes, sir.**

12 Q --than it was as a supervisor-subordinate type  
13 relationship?

14 A **Yes, sir.**

15 Q The last thing I want to touch on, sir, is that you said  
16 that things are not necessarily better now that the  
17 changes at MATES have taken place. And I think you said  
18 that sometimes you do need just one person to make the  
19 decisions. And just touching on that point, sir,  
20 what--allegations have been made that the MATES was in a  
21 bad way because of Colonel Golnick and whatever alleged  
22 relationship he was having with Sergeant Reed and just  
23 with other clicks and stuff like that within the MATES. Do  
24 you--how long have you been there, sir?

25 A **Since '91.**



1 Q Do you recall any time since '91 up until the point where  
2 Colonel Golnick retired, because of the investigation,  
3 that the MATES did not meet their mission requirements,  
4 that you failed an inspection?

5 A **No, sir.**

6 Q What was the track history of the--just in general, were  
7 you guys known as getting the job done?

8 A **Yes. We still do.**

9 Q Okay. It's just a little bit different?

10 A **Yeah.**

11 Q Sir, I'll leave you with this, and I know I asked you this  
12 same question when--when you testified last week. If  
13 Sergeant Reed were to be reinstated, how would you feel  
14 about that?

15 A **It'd be a good thing.**

16 Q Would you have any issues with her coming back to work?

17 A **No.**

18 Q That's all I've got at this time. Thank you, sir.

19 A **All right.**

20 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells, do you  
21 want to redirect?

22 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Yes, sir.

23 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

24 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

25 Q I think it was taken off course here. You testified that

1           you confronted Master Sergeant Reed about--and this was  
2           the whole debate about perception. Okay? So I won't use  
3           the term "perception" because you don't like that term.  
4           But you confronted her about something with respect to the  
5           relationship she had with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick;  
6           correct?

7   **A       Yes, sir.**

8   **Q       And what--as best you can recall, what did you tell her?**

9   **A       Just like--just as I stated. But it was--some of the**  
10           **allegation was made and--**

11   **Q       I'm not asking about the allegation.**

12   **A       I didn't make the allegation.**

13   **Q       I know you didn't--**

14   **A       Okay.**

15   **Q       --Master Sergeant. But what I'm asking you--I know you**  
16           **didn't make the allegation. You've been crystal clear on**  
17           **that point. What I'm asking you is what specifically do**  
18           **you recall telling Master Sergeant Reed when you**  
19           **confronted her about the relationship she had with**  
20           **Lieutenant Colonel Golnick? You characterized it as**  
21           **strange yourself. So what did you tell her?**

22   **A       I talked about the perception thing, the SHARP training**  
23           **and everything else. If somebody perceives that's**  
24           **something's wrong, then you're pretty much at risk--you've**  
25           **got to prove that you're not--**

1 Q Okay. And my recollection is she cried when you told her  
2 this.

3 A Yes.

4 Q Did anything change after this?

5 A As far as?

6 Q It continued to be a strange relationship in your--if you  
7 recall?

8 A Well, I was--I wasn't the supervisor after that so--

9 Q Okay. But did the relationship continue to be strange? It  
10 continued--you're telling me nothing changed? You  
11 characterized the relationship--

12 A Correct.

13 Q --as strange.

14 A Right.

15 Q You're saying nothing changed so--

16 A Okay.

17 Q --it continues to be strange; correct?

18 A Okay, yeah.

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. No further questions.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: Recross?

21 MR. BANCHS: Just one clarification.

22 RE-CROSS-EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. BANCHS:

24 Q Was your concern about their relationship--it is in his  
25 written sworn statement in the record. You explained to

1 her about perceptions. And if someone perceived that there  
2 was something inappropriate going on, that it was--that  
3 she would have to prove that it wasn't going on?

4 **A Right.**

5 **Q** So your--you were concerned for her?

6 **A Yes, sir.**

7 MR. BANCHS: That's all I've got.

8 HEARING EXAMINER: I'll remind you that you  
9 remain under oath and that you are subject to recall to  
10 this hearing until such time that it has been adjourned.  
11 Again, I will remind you not to discuss your testimony  
12 with anyone. And with that, thanks for your time.

13 THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

14 (At 5:08 p.m., witness excused)

15 HEARING EXAMINER: Is your next witness ready?

16 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Chief Todd Witcher.

17 HEARING EXAMINER: Anybody need a break?

18 MR. BANCHS: Would you like a break, sir?

19 HEARING EXAMINER: I'm okay.

20 MR. BANCHS: Okay. No, we're--I'm good.

21 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Everybody's good at my end.

22 HEARING EXAMINER: You guys need Herblet back?

23 MR. BANCHS: I don't think so. Do you?

24 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No.

25 HEARING EXAMINER: He can go. If you'd raise

1 your right hand, please, do you swear or affirm that the  
2 testimony you're about to give in this case is the truth,  
3 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help you  
4 God?

5 CHIEF WHITCHER: Yes.

6 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
7 that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
8 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
9 testifying in this case.

10 CHIEF WHITCHER: Yes.

11 HEARING EXAMINER: You may have a seat.  
12 Captain Bedells?

13 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

14 CHIEF TODD WHITCHER

15 (At 5:11 p.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

16 DIRECT EXAMINATION

17 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

18 Q Chief, will you please state your full name for the  
19 record?

20 A **Todd David Whitcher.**

21 Q Chief, to refresh my recollection, what is your current  
22 job title at MATES?

23 A **I'm an inspector in the quality control section.**

24 Q Okay. And although the Hearing Examiner, Colonel Dawkins,  
25 has been gracious that we don't have to establish a

1 foundation for your testimony, I just want to--I want to  
2 be clear. You currently work at MATES; right?

3 **A Yes.**

4 **Q** And you've worked there since when?

5 **A Since 2000.**

6 **Q** Okay. And having worked there since 2000, have you had  
7 occasion to work with Master Sergeant Reed?

8 **A Yes.**

9 **Q** In what capacity would you work with Master Sergeant Reed?

10 **A For a while, I was a temporary wage leader, and then the**  
11 **rest of the time just had a desk job, orders or whatever.**

12 **Q** Okay. When you were a temporary wage leader, how is it  
13 that you would interact with Master Sergeant Reed?

14 **A Getting job orders, closing job orders, adding tasks,**  
15 **mostly in that capacity.**

16 **Q** And when you were a wage leader, what years was that?

17 **A 2011.**

18 **Q** To current?

19 **A No, until--it was the beginning of 2011 until December**  
20 **2011.**

21 **Q** Oh, okay. So basically just one year?

22 **A Yes.**

23 **Q** And how--during that year, how often would you interact  
24 with Master Sergeant Reed per week? Let's say on a weekly  
25 basis. How often would you interact with her?

1    **A**    **A couple times a day.**

2    Q    A couple times a day. And is it the case that you had to,  
3       you know, physically meet with her? Or did you exchange  
4       emails? How did this work?

5    **A**    **Occasionally physically meet with her, other times just**  
6       **picking up and dropping off job orders.**

7    Q    Where would you pick up or drop off the job orders?

8    **A**    **They were on bins on the wall inside her office.**

9    Q    Inside her office? Okay.

10   **A**   **For the new job orders.**

11   Q    Okay. So you would have to pick up or drop off a job order  
12       in a bin inside her office a couple times a day?

13   **A**    **Usually, yes.**

14   Q    Did you work four days a week or five days a week when you  
15       were a--

16   **A**    **At the time I was working five days a week.**

17   Q    So when you--so almost every day, say approximately two  
18       times a day, you had to pick up or drop off a job order?

19   **A**    **Yes.**

20   Q    In her office?

21   **A**    **Yes.**

22   Q    Okay. Now, you know there's been allegations made with  
23       respect to a relationship she had with--that Master  
24       Sergeant Reed had with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick;  
25       correct?

1    **A**    **Yes.**

2    Q    And one of the allegations is that--is that they spent an  
3       inordinate amount of time together; correct?

4    **A**    **Yes.**

5    Q    Did you observe these two individuals spending an  
6       inordinate amount of time inasmuch as you were in her  
7       office two times a day five days a week for about a year?

8    **A**    **He was usually there.**

9    Q    Okay.

10   **A**    **Most every time.**

11   Q    I can't recall how I asked the question but it was  
12       objected to, so let me ask you this. When you say  
13       "usually"--I think it was "what were the chances" was  
14       objected to. What percentage of the time would you say  
15       Lieutenant Colonel Golnick spent inside Master Sergeant  
16       Reed's office?

17   **A**    **Seventy-five, 80 percent of the time.**

18   Q    Of the day is what I mean.

19   **A**    **Of the day.**

20   Q    Okay. And you know this because you were in her office a  
21       couple times a day five days a week; correct?

22   **A**    **Yes.**

23   Q    Now, that's 2011?

24   **A**    **Yes, it was.**

25   Q    Okay. At some point you're not the temporary wage leader,



1           you're in the current position you're in now?

2   **A     Yes.**

3   Q     Which is what?

4   **A     Inspector.**

5   Q     Inspector, right. Quality control inspector; right?

6   **A     Yes.**

7   Q     It's coming back to me. So you're a QC inspector now. And

8           that was about the end of 2011 you became the QC

9           inspector?

10 **A     End of 2012. I was in the welding shop in between.**

11 Q     Welding shop in between. Okay. When you were in the

12           welding shop, did you have an opportunity to work with

13           Master Sergeant Reed?

14 **A     Not on a regular basis.**

15 Q     Okay. How about when you're a QC inspector?

16 **A     Occasionally but not as much as when I was a wage leader.**

17 Q     And the QC inspector would be from the end of 2012--

18 **A     To present.**

19 Q     --to present, but of course she's been gone since April or

20           something of 2013; correct?

21 **A     Something like that.**

22 Q     --2014? Okay. So for the year 2013, you would interact

23           with her as a QC inspector; correct?

24 **A     Occasionally but not as much.**

25 Q     What would be not as much? Once a week?

1    **A**       **Maybe once a week, occasionally twice a week maybe.**

2    Q        Okay. Were you still picking up and dropping off job  
3            orders in the bin?

4    **A**       **Sometimes adding tasks to job orders or picking up job  
5            orders.**

6    Q        So there was about a year in there, 2012, where you were  
7            in the welding shop and you didn't have interaction with  
8            her; correct?

9    **A**       **No, I wouldn't--**

10   Q        When you started interacting with Master Sergeant Reed  
11            again as the QC inspector, did you find Lieutenant Colonel  
12            Golnick in her office still?

13   **A**       **Most times, yes.**

14   Q        When you would go in there?

15   **A**       **Yes.**

16   Q        But again it wasn't as frequent?

17   **A**       **I didn't go in there as frequent, no.**

18   Q        Right. So is your testimony that you believe that  
19            Lieutenant Colonel Golnick was in her--in Master Sergeant  
20            Reed's office 70 percent of the time based on that year  
21            when you were a temporary wage leader?

22   **A**       **During that time, yes.**

23   Q        Okay. I mean, have you heard other accounts of Lieutenant  
24            Colonel Golnick being in her office?

25   **A**       **I've heard it from other people, yes.**

1 Q Okay. People who might have a better foundation upon which  
2 to make that; right? Because by your own admission, in  
3 2012, you didn't interact with her. Right?

4 A **Not very much, no.**

5 Q And in 2013, although you interacted, it was--it wasn't  
6 quite as frequent; correct?

7 A **Right.**

8 Q But your--is it your testimony that it was pretty routine  
9 that he would be in her office--

10 A **Oh, yeah.**

11 Q --when you went in to do something?

12 A **He was there, yes.**

13 Q Okay. Well, even though you might not have had direct  
14 interaction with Master Sergeant Reed--and I get that,  
15 because maybe your jobs don't--there's no reason to  
16 interact. Did you have occasion to walk by her office at  
17 least?

18 A **Going to PT or going back to the vault to inspect weapons,  
19 whatever, yeah, I'd walk by there.**

20 Q And is it your testimony that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
21 would usually be in there when you walked by to go to the  
22 vault or do PT?

23 A **Most times, yes.**

24 Q Okay. Could you hear him in there?

25 A **Yeah, you could hear him.**

1 Q Was the door usually opened?

2 A **Yeah, during the day the door was open; yes.**

3 Q Did the fact that you found Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in  
4 Master Sergeant Reed's office pretty frequently, according  
5 to your testimony, did that strike you as odd in any  
6 respect?

7 A **Yes.**

8 Q In other words, was there a reason maybe you didn't know  
9 about why Lieutenant Colonel Golnick--

10 A **There could be.**

11 Q --was in Master Sergeant Reed's office 70 percent of the  
12 time?

13 A **There could be.**

14 Q Okay. Can you think of one as you sit here right now?

15 A **Not really, no.**

16 Q Who did--did you know who Master Sergeant Reed's  
17 first-line supervisor was?

18 A **Lieutenant Colonel McNamara. I don't know when he became  
19 supervisor.**

20 Q Who was your first-line supervisor?

21 A **When I was in inspection, Lieutenant Colonel McNamara.**

22 **When I would have asked as in the welding shop, it would  
23 have been first Chief Dale and then Chief Fitzpatrick.**

24 Q Okay. And when you were QC inspector, Lieutenant Colonel  
25 McNamara was your first-line supervisor; correct?

1    **A**    **Yes.**

2    Q    And your testimony is you believe that at some point  
3    Lieutenant Colonel McNamara was Master Sergeant Reed's  
4    first-line supervisor; correct?

5    **A**    **Yes.**

6    Q    How often would you interact with Lieutenant Colonel  
7    McNamara inasmuch as he was your supervisor?

8    **A**    **We worked in the same office, so daily.**

9    Q    Okay. Did you spend a great deal of time in his office? Or  
10   did he spend a great deal in--well, did you have separate  
11   offices, or were you in the same office?

12   **A**    **One big office. He had a little cubicle in the corner.**

13   Q    So it's fair to say you were kind of in the same office;  
14   right?

15   **A**    **Yes.**

16   Q    Okay. But did Lieutenant Colonel McNamara spend an amount  
17   of time in Master Sergeant Reed's office?

18   **A**    **Some, going over there to check on whatever, time or--**

19   Q    As much time as Lieutenant Colonel Golnick spent in her  
20   office?

21   **A**    **No.**

22   Q    Now, did you have any trepidation or were you--were you  
23   put out by the fact that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick seemed  
24   to be in Master Sergeant Reed's office, according to your  
25   testimony, like 70 percent of the time?

1    **A**    **It seemed a little odd, yes.**

2    Q    Well, did it affect your--did it affect your work?

3    **A**    **Sometimes. Sometimes you couldn't interrupt him to do**  
4        **something you needed to do.**

5    Q    Well, how did--give me an example how it--not a particular  
6        example but an example of how it might affect your work.

7    **A**    **If you had a question maybe for Master Sergeant Reed, he**  
8        **usually wouldn't let you interrupt or ask. And he would**  
9        **just keep talking and ignore you until you left.**

10   Q    So what'd you do? Go out in the hall and wait until he  
11       left?

12   **A**    **Either that or go have Lieutenant Colonel McNamara or**  
13        **Master Sergeant Cooper go ask.**

14   Q    Okay. And you thought that they might be able to get the  
15       question you had answered better than you could?

16   **A**    **I figured, yes.**

17   Q    Did you ever observe Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master  
18       Sergeant Reed eat together?

19   **A**    **At lunchtime they would eat.**

20   Q    Where did you observe them eat?

21   **A**    **Usually in her office.**

22   Q    How often do you think you observed them eating?

23   **A**    **I don't know if it was daily or not, at least a couple**  
24        **times a week. I didn't go by there always during lunch**  
25        **so--**

1 Q Right. Why would you; right? How about the gym? How  
2 often--did you observe them working out ever together?

3 **A I did PT at a different time, but I know they did PT at**  
4 **the same time, yes.**

5 Q How do you--how do you know this? Did other people tell  
6 you?

7 **A Other people tell me and seeing them getting ready for PT**  
8 **but--**

9 Q Did you ever see any reference to Master Sergeant Reed in  
10 that gym?

11 **A Just through secondhand word, not myself.**

12 Q Well, what did you hear through secondhand word?

13 **A That the new PT room was named the R3 for Renee Reed Room.**

14 Q Okay. But you never saw any sign to that effect?

15 **A Well, it was written above the door, but when I seen it, I**  
16 **didn't know what it meant.**

17 Q But you did see it written about the door?

18 **A Yes.**

19 Q Who wrote it; do you know?

20 **A I didn't see who wrote it, no.**

21 Q Okay. Is that--maybe it's just because she works out a  
22 lot?

23 **A It could be.**

24 Q Super-fit maybe?

25 **A Maybe.**

1 Q Like in honor of her being so fit, we're going to name it  
2 the Renee Reed--okay. Now, how about any nicknames?  
3 There's been some testimony here, Chief, about nicknames  
4 people might have been given. And I don't--have you heard  
5 anything to that effect?

6 **A Yeah. I heard a lot of nicknames about a lot of people**  
7 **but--**

8 Q You ever heard about a nickname for Master Sergeant Reed?

9 **A Yes.**

10 Q What did you hear?

11 **A Princess.**

12 Q Okay. Did people call that to her face?

13 **A I don't believe so, no.**

14 Q Did you?

15 **A Call it to her face?**

16 Q Yeah.

17 **A No.**

18 Q Well, what--do you have any idea or understanding of  
19 what's behind that nickname? I mean, she's not wearing a  
20 tiara or anything like that?

21 **A No. I believe it was because that's how Colonel Golnick**  
22 **seen her was his little Princess but--**

23 Q Did you ever confront him about it?

24 **A No.**

25 Q Did you ever--you never talked to Lieutenant Colonel



1 Golnick about him spending so much time in her office?

2 **A No.**

3 Q Why not?

4 **A Not my place. What am I going to say? He's the shop  
5 superintendent, Lieutenant Colonel.**

6 Q How about Master Sergeant Reed? Did you ever tell Master  
7 Sergeant Reed, "hey, you know"--

8 **A I never did, no.**

9 Q Well, let me finish my question. Did you ever talk to her  
10 like, "hey, I need job--I need to get job orders and drop,  
11 you know, job orders off, and I need to talk to you. And  
12 it doesn't work when Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's in  
13 there"? Did you ever have that conversation with her?

14 **A No.**

15 Q Anything like that with her?

16 **A I have overheard her say before, "Good, the boss isn't  
17 here today. Maybe I can get something done." But that was  
18 it.**

19 Q You've heard her say that?

20 **A Yes.**

21 Q In her office?

22 **A In her office.**

23 Q Presumably when you were dropping off a job order or  
24 picking one up; right?

25 **A Just going through, yes.**

- 1 Q Did you ever hear of Lieutenant Colonel Golnick doing any  
2 special favors for Master Sergeant Reed?
- 3 A **Like as in?**
- 4 Q I don't know. I don't want to suggest anything. If you  
5 never heard anything, just say, "no, I've never heard  
6 any"--
- 7 A **I heard that he give her time off awards but I can't--**
- 8 Q Who'd you hear that from?
- 9 A **From my work partner, Master Sergeant Cooper.**
- 10 Q Well, is the--I mean, Chief, I've got to tell you,  
11 everyone has testified that--everyone so far has testified  
12 that she was a more than capable production controller.
- 13 A **She was very proficient.**
- 14 Q And you get time off awards for being a good worker;  
15 correct?
- 16 A **Yes.**
- 17 Q So isn't it possible that she was getting time off awards  
18 for being a pretty standup production controller?
- 19 A **It could be.**
- 20 Q Okay. But that said, is that not the context in which you  
21 heard her receiving time off awards?
- 22 A **No.**
- 23 Q So what is the context in which you heard her receiving  
24 time off awards?
- 25 A **Master Sergeant Cooper said that he overheard her say**

1           **that, "I've got a vacation coming up. I better hit the**  
2           **boss up for some comp time.**

3    Q       Okay. Is comp time the same as a time off award?

4    A       **Yeah, sort of. It's time earned for working weekends or**  
5           **after hours.**

6                       MR. BANCHS:    Could I object? Just I'm  
7           objecting to his testimony because they're not the same.  
8           Just for the record, they're not the same.

9                       CAPTAIN BEDELLS:   Okay. Well, you can  
10          enlighten us, because I don't know to disagree anyway.

11   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

12   Q       So anyway, Chief--and listen. If you understand it's  
13          how--my question is how you understand it. If someone's  
14          going to clarify it for the record, then that's fine. And  
15          he might--

16   A       **Time off award is different than comp time. Comp time is**  
17          **for work weekends or after hours. And a time off award is**  
18          **just award given for whatever reason, performance.**

19   Q       But the context in which you heard it was through Master  
20          Sergeant Cooper; correct? And he told you what again?

21   A       **That he overheard her say, "I need to hit the boss up for**  
22          **some comp time because I've got vacation coming up."**

23   Q       Okay. Is that typically how it works if you need comp  
24          time--

25   A       **No.**

1 Q --you go to your boss? How does it typically work?

2 A **Typically, if they're going to need people to work a**  
3 **weekend, they put a list up. And you put your name on it**  
4 **if you want to work. Or they'll ask around who wants to**  
5 **work this weekend.**

6 Q Well, is it possible she goes to the boss and says, "Hey,  
7 boss, put my name on the list"?

8 A **Very possible.**

9 Q Okay. Have you done that, like put your name on a list for  
10 comp time?

11 A **Yeah.**

12 Q Did you ever hear of Lieutenant Colonel Golnick building  
13 anything at Master Sergeant Reed's house?

14 A **I heard that they stained her mother's deck or something,**  
15 **took the day off together and stained a deck.**

16 Q Did you personally observe it?

17 A **No.**

18 Q Okay. Did you personally observe the deck at any point?

19 A **No.**

20 Q Did you ask Master Sergeant Reed about it?

21 A **No.**

22 Q Ask Lieutenant Colonel Golnick about it?

23 A **No.**

24 Q And I gather it's the same reason for not asking

25 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick, who are you to ask; right?

1    **A**    **Right.**

2    **Q**    Okay. How about--how about Master Sergeant Reed's use of  
3           Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's NTV? Did you ever hear any  
4           allegations to the effect that--

5    **A**    **Yes.**

6    **Q**    --she was getting preferential treatment?

7    **A**    **Yes.**

8    **Q**    What did you hear and from whom did you hear it?

9    **A**    **Well, I saw her take it on a drill weekend. In fact,**  
10           **February was the last time when we were on drill weekend**  
11           **she come in to take his personal NTV.**

12   **Q**    When was it?

13   **A**    **February.**

14   **Q**    Of this year?

15   **A**    **Of this year was the last time.**

16   **Q**    Okay. So February of 2014, it's your testimony that you  
17           saw yourself Master Sergeant Reed use Lieutenant Colonel  
18           Golnick's NTV to go to drill?

19   **A**    **Yes.**

20   **Q**    Do you know if she might have been authorized to take that  
21           NTV to that particular drill?

22   **A**    **Could have been. I don't know what authorization it would**  
23           **be. You're supposed to report to your normal place of**  
24           **assemblage and then take GOV from there.**

25   **Q**    Where did you see her take--or how do you know she took--

- 1    **A**        **She come into the MATES--**
- 2    Q        --Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's NTV?
- 3    **A**        **She come into the MATES when we were on drill weekend to**
- 4            **get it in the morning.**
- 5    Q        Okay. Was this a Saturday morning?
- 6    **A**        **Saturday morning, yeah.**
- 7    Q        And you were there?
- 8    **A**        **Yes, on drill.**
- 9    Q        Why were you at--is that where you drill, at MATES?
- 10   **A**       **Yes.**
- 11   Q        Okay. And do you know where Master Sergeant Reed drills?
- 12   **A**        **272nd at the time.**
- 13   Q        Which is where?
- 14   **A**        **Jackson.**
- 15   Q        So you testified that that's the last time you observed
- 16            her. Are there other instances in which you've observed
- 17            Master Sergeant Reed use Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's NTV
- 18            for--I don't know--for lack of a better term--unofficial
- 19            business?
- 20   **A**        **I seen her come in a couple times on drill weekend, same**
- 21            **scenario, come and use it, take it on a Saturday morning,**
- 22            **leave to go to drill.**
- 23   Q        Okay. Do you recall when those instances occurred?
- 24   **A**        **Periodic throughout the year.**
- 25   Q        Prior to February 2014 though; correct?

1   **A**    **Yes.**

2   Q       At one point I believe you testified Lieutenant Colonel  
3       McNamara was both your supervisor and Master Sergeant  
4       Reed's supervisor. Is that correct?

5   **A**    **Yes.**

6   Q       When you submitted a leave slip, to whom would you submit  
7       a leave slip when Lieutenant Colonel McNamara was your  
8       supervisor?

9   **A**    **To Lieutenant Colonel McNamara.**

10  Q       To your knowledge, do you know who Master Sergeant Reed  
11       submitted leave slips to, if you know?

12  **A**    **She's supposed to submit it to Lieutenant Colonel**  
13       **McNamara.**

14  Q       Do you know if she submitted to someone else, or do you  
15       have no knowledge?

16  **A**    **Sometimes she would just give it to Lieutenant Colonel**  
17       **Golnick.**

18  Q       How do you know that?

19  **A**    **Because Lieutenant Colonel McNamara would complain about**  
20       **it.**

21  Q       Okay. Because he's her first-line supervisor and he should  
22       review the leave slip; correct?

23  **A**    **Yes.**

24  Q       Okay. We've heard--well, the previous witness described  
25       the relationship from his perspective between Lieutenant

1 Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed as strange. Okay?  
2 How would you describe the relationship in your words  
3 between Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant  
4 Reed?

5 **A It was a little uncomfortable if you were in there at the**  
6 **same time with them.**

7 **Q** How was it uncomfortable?

8 **A It just felt like you'd interrupted in the middle**  
9 **of--walked into somebody's living room or something. I've**  
10 **seen him stand behind her before and reach around**  
11 **underneath her arms and help her type on a keyboard. To**  
12 **me--**

13 **Q** That made you uncomfortable?

14 **A That's inappropriate to me.**

15 **Q** Did it make you feel uncomfortable?

16 **A Yes.**

17 **Q** I know it's inappropriate. But did it make you feel  
18 uncomfortable?

19 **A Yes.**

20 **Q** Okay. Did you say anything?

21 **A No.**

22 **Q** What did you do?

23 **A I left.**

24 **Q** Did this relationship that the two of them had--and it  
25 seems to have manifested itself in her office for the most



1 part. Did it in your opinion affect the workplace, the  
2 efficiency of MATES?

3 **A To some extent, yes.**

4 Q How so?

5 **A A lot of times people didn't want to go over there to be**  
6 **around it. So job orders and stuff weren't getting done or**  
7 **opened or whatever.**

8 Q And the boss--he's been referred to as the boss and the  
9 King. He's been referred to as all sorts of things. He's  
10 spending, according to you, 70 percent of his time in the  
11 production controller's office; right?

12 **A Yes.**

13 Q I mean, would that have an effect on the operation?

14 **A Evidently he wasn't taking care of his own job running the**  
15 **whole facility.**

16 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. I have no further  
17 questions.

18 HEARING EXAMINER: Mr. Banchs?

19 MR. BANCHS: Really?

20 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Yeah.

21 CROSS-EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. BANCHS:

23 Q Sir, you've testified today that Sergeant Reed was a very  
24 capable PC and she got the job done?

25 **A Yes, she was.**

1 Q But then you've also testified that Colonel Golnick was in  
2 her office--today you said anywhere from 75 to 85 percent  
3 of the time. In your written testimony you said that he  
4 spends 90 percent of his day in her office. So there are  
5 variations in your testimony.

6 **A Yeah.**

7 Q So was she still getting her job done even though he was  
8 in her office?

9 **A Most of the time, yes.**

10 Q Okay. So how was it a distraction then?

11 **A Distraction for him. He wasn't doing his job.**

12 Q Okay. Well, we're not talking about Colonel Golnick. We're  
13 talking about Ms. Reed.

14 **A Well, apparently she's a real good production controller,  
15 because she was overcoming it.**

16 Q You just testified that you observed Colonel Golnick with  
17 his arms around her typing on her keyboard. Is there a  
18 reason that you left that out of your sworn testimony?

19 **A I didn't think about it when I wrote it.**

20 Q You were a temp wage leader in 2011, and that allowed you  
21 to interact with Ms. Reed a couple of times per day?

22 **A Usually.**

23 Q And for that period, you would drop off and pick up job  
24 orders in her office five days a week. And you said that  
25 Colonel Golnick was usually there 75 to 80 percent of the

1 day and that that seemed odd to you. Would there be a  
2 job-related reason that the superintendent of the MATES  
3 facility would have to interact with his production  
4 controller? I mean, if you as a wage leader have to  
5 interact with the production controller in the course of  
6 your duties as a wage leader and you're nowhere near the  
7 top of the MATES facility, would there be a reason for the  
8 superintendent to interact with the production controller?

9 **A No. That's why you have supervisors and wage leaders**  
10 **underneath him.**

11 Q So he has no reason at all?

12 **A He might have to go down there occasionally but not all**  
13 **day long.**

14 Q And what would that occasion be?

15 **A I don't know what the occasion might be because he should**  
16 **go through her supervisor.**

17 Q What does a production controller do? You know, you don't  
18 have to give me the exact position description, but what  
19 are her duties and the duties that, according to you and  
20 others have testified that she does extremely well? What  
21 does a production controller do?

22 **A Processes job orders, tasks, man-hour accounting.**

23 Q So in a sense, she's--she is in charge of keeping track  
24 that you guys are doing what you're supposed to be doing,  
25 right, as far as like repairs and stuff like that?

1    **A       Correct.**

2    Q       And you think that that's not something that the  
3            superintendent would be interested to know?

4    **A       He could probably have it emailed to him or pull an 06**  
5            **report or an 18 or off the computer himself.**

6    Q       Well, maybe he's a hands-on leader, no pun intended.

7    **A       Then he could hands-on the SAMS box and pull those**  
8            **reports.**

9    Q       Okay. But I mean, you know, would it be--would it be out  
10           of the norm for a superintendent of a facility to go to  
11           their production controller and say, "I want the numbers  
12           on how maintenance is running this week or month or even  
13           day"?

14   **A       That would take 10, 15 minutes for her to pull that report**  
15           **and email it to him.**

16   Q       Okay. But he could certainly also go in person and ask for  
17           these reports; correct?

18   **A       Sure could but it's going to take him 75 percent of the**  
19           **day to explain that?**

20   Q       Well, let me ask you this, because, you know, there's been  
21           witnesses before you that have also testified to the  
22           fact--or at least to their perception that the MATES was  
23           running at less than 100 percent under the Golnick reign,  
24           since he's be deemed King here. And now ever since he was  
25           dethroned that the MATES is running much better. Is that

1 accurate?

2 **A I'd say so, yeah.**

3 Q Well, can you point me--where could I find these  
4 deficiencies? Was there an inspection that was conducted  
5 while Colonel Golnick was in charge of the MATES that you  
6 guys failed? Did you guys not meet your production numbers  
7 at any given point in time? Did any customers ever  
8 complain?

9 **A I guess you'd have to ask the people that are running the**  
10 **MATES now to pull those.**

11 Q Were you ever aware of any inspections that you guys  
12 failed?

13 **A No.**

14 Q In regards to the allegations of misuse of GSAs and items  
15 like that, were there ever any FLIPLs conducted, any other  
16 15-6 investigations aside from the one that Colonel  
17 Doolittle conducted that you're aware of?

18 **A Not that I know of, no.**

19 Q So other than Colonel Golnick being in the office of his  
20 production controller--the tip-top production controller,  
21 the MATES was running at least average if not better than  
22 average?

23 **A I have no idea what the percentages were.**

24 Q Okay. Well, you're pretty sure that it's somewhere between  
25 75 and 90 percent the amount of time that he spent in her

1 office?

2 **A That I am sure of, yes.**

3 Q So if in your guesstimation, sir--at what percentage was  
4 the MATES running, from a zero to 100 percent?

5 **A Probably about 50 percent.**

6 Q Fifty percent? So an "F"?

7 **A Yeah.**

8 Q But yet there are--you guys did not fail any inspections.  
9 You guys were meeting all your--

10 **A The only inspections we're in is the CLRT inspection,  
11 which is an administrative inspection to see if all  
12 administrative tasks are being done.**

13 Q Okay. Fair enough. Now, wouldn't a superintendent have  
14 oversight of the administrative side of the house as well?

15 **A Should have.**

16 Q Did you guys do good on the CLRT?

17 **A I don't know what the numbers were.**

18 Q Well, let me tell you, I've been in the military 23 years.  
19 And whenever you--is a CLRT a major inspection?

20 **A Yes, it is.**

21 Q When you fail a major inspection, you're going to get  
22 briefed about it?

23 **A Probably.**

24 Q Did you get briefed about failing a CLRT?

25 **A We never got briefed either way.**

1 Q Okay. Well, what I'm saying, sir, is that bad news travels  
2 quicker than good news. Did you hear about failing the  
3 CLRT?

4 **A No.**

5 Q Okay. You testified that you did not have much interaction  
6 during the period of 2012 when you were a welder, but as a  
7 quality control inspector, from the end of 2012 to the  
8 present, you have occasional interaction. But then you've  
9 also testified that Colonel Golnick is in her office  
10 anywhere from 75 to 90 percent of the time. So you only  
11 interact with--you know, based on your testimony, you only  
12 interact with Ms. Reed once or twice a week?

13 **A Probably.**

14 Q So your percentages of how much Colonel Golnick spends in  
15 Mrs. Reed's office is based on what other people are  
16 saying?

17 **A Or myself walking by.**

18 Q Okay. But you say that you only interact with her once or  
19 twice a week?

20 **A Didn't have to interact with her to walk by.**

21 Q So how often do you walk by her office?

22 **A Going back to the vault to do inspection of weapons, maybe  
23 once or twice a week.**

24 Q And Golnick was in her office, according to you, most  
25 times?

1    **A**    **Most of the times, yes.**

2    Q    And you said you could hear him and that the door was open  
3        during the day?

4    **A**    **During the day.**

5    Q    Is there a reason you differentiated between day and  
6        night?

7    **A**    **During lunchtime sometimes they'd close the door to have  
8        lunch.**

9    Q    Okay. You're the first witness that's testified to that.  
10       You're aware of that; right?

11   **A**    **Okay.**

12   Q    But you said that it was during--door open during the day.  
13       Did you just mean during the day like during the workday?

14   **A**    **During the workday.**

15   Q    Not at night; right?

16   **A**    **I don't know about night. I wasn't there.**

17   Q    Well, nobody's there at night. Do you guys have a night  
18       shift?

19   **A**    **No.**

20   Q    Okay. You heard accounts from others, I guess, about  
21       Colonel Golnick being in her office a lot. Can you tell me  
22       who these others were?

23   **A**    **That's Cooper, Mr. Mack, Major Burrell, Chief Miller,  
24       Lieutenant Colonel McNamara.**

25   Q    Chief Dean Miller?



1    **A**    **Yes.**

2    Q    Sir, you're a supervisor now; right?

3    **A**    **No.**

4    Q    You're not--you're a what?

5    **A**    **Quality control inspector.**

6    Q    You're a quality--oh, okay.

7    **A**    **Yeah.**

8    Q    Well, maybe I'll go back to--but you are a Warrant

9       Officer?

10   **A**    **Yes.**

11   Q    And do you serve with noncommissioned officers?

12   **A**    **Yes, I do.**

13   Q    Do you eat lunch with your fellow noncommissioned

14       officers?

15   **A**    **We only do it on the weekends and not usually, no.**

16   Q    So who do you eat lunch with at work?

17   **A**    **Usually the other officers.**

18   Q    Other Warrant Officers?

19   **A**    **Yes.**

20   Q    You were in the same office as Colonel McNamara. Did you

21       ever eat lunch with him?

22   **A**    **No.**

23   Q    Did you guys ever goof off? When I mean you guys, I mean

24       you and Sergeant Cooper and Colonel McNamara. Did you guys

25       ever goof off in the office?

1    **A**     **No, not that I can recall.**

2    Q     So there was nothing of a joking nature that would ever go  
3           on?

4    **A**     **Occasionally.**

5    Q     Like what? Give me an example. I'm curious.

6    **A**     **I don't recall any.**

7    Q     I've visited you guys in this facility, I think, two years  
8           ago. And I met Colonel McNamara, and I actually was in you  
9           all's office. Do you remember the leave excuse wheel that  
10          you guys had in the office?

11   **A**     **That's gone.**

12   Q     But it was there.

13                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Object to relevancy. I don't  
14                    know how this is relevant so--

15                    MR. BANCHS: I'm just trying to establish that  
16                    the atmosphere at MATES was much more familiar, and it was  
17                    prevalent throughout the facility than what the  
18                    allegations are that it was strictly between Colonel  
19                    Golnick and Mrs. Reed.

20                    HEARING EXAMINER: I'll hear it.

21                    THE WITNESS: There was a wheel in there, yes,  
22                    but once I came in there, I got rid of it.

23   BY MR. BANCHS:

24   Q     So you got rid of it?

25   **A**     **Yes.**

1 Q And you told--you told Colonel McNamara to get rid of it?

2 A **No.**

3 Q Okay. So was he okay with you getting rid of it? Because  
4 let me tell you--and here's why I'm telling you. This is  
5 firsthand knowledge he was very proud of that leave wheel,  
6 and he showed it to me.

7 A **Yes, he was.**

8 Q So would you say that--that--I don't want to say less than  
9 professional but the lax interactions that was between  
10 lower ranking individuals and higher ranking  
11 officers--because Colonel McNamara was a Lieutenant  
12 Colonel--that was something normal that happened at the  
13 MATES?

14 A **Occasionally, yes.**

15 Q Okay. So why was the interactions between Colonel Golnick  
16 and Ms. Reed so much different than maybe your  
17 interactions with Colonel McNamara?

18 A **Because it was just the two of them all the time.**

19 Q So what if--so is there a difference just because you guys  
20 are both males, and she's a female and he's a male?

21 A **No.**

22 Q Okay. Again, you interacted with Colonel McNamara probably  
23 just as much as she did with Colonel Golnick. Any--

24 A **He was my direct supervisor. But he--**

25 Q He was still a higher ranking officer?

1    **A**    **Yes.**

2    Q    Okay. So nothing wrong with that. Something wrong with

3        this?

4    **A**    **Yes.**

5    Q    The reference you made to the Renee Reed Room, was that an

6        official sign that was put over the exercise room?

7    **A**    **No, just abbreviation.**

8    Q    And was it a handwritten note that somebody stuck up

9        there?

10   **A**    **It was written in black marker on the board.**

11   Q    On which--paint a picture for me. There's a door.

12   **A**    **Above the door somebody wrote "R3."**

13   Q    On?

14   **A**    **On the wood.**

15   Q    On the wood?

16   **A**    **The siding.**

17   Q    With permanent marker?

18   **A**    **Permanent marker.**

19   Q    Okay. Was Ms. Reed in there often?

20   **A**    **Probably just as often as anybody else, three hours a week**

21        **for PT.**

22   Q    I have not verified this, but according to her, she tells

23        me that she gets 290s on her physical fitness tests. Is

24        that pretty good?

25   **A**    **Yeah.**

1 Q So would that be a reason for her to be in the exercise  
2 room at the approved times often?

3 A **Sure.**

4 Q Okay. And if somebody else had been in the room a lot and  
5 they named the room after them, would that be anything of  
6 concern?

7 A **No concern to me.**

8 Q But I failed my physical fitness test one time and they  
9 would joke that I was on the run for lunch bunch. Should I  
10 take that as offensive?

11 A **If you failed your PT test, you need to be on the run for  
12 lunch bunch.**

13 Q But it was--it's all in good humor and joking; correct?

14 A **Yes.**

15 Q I mean, the having three R's over the exercise room, does  
16 that in itself mean that there's an inappropriate  
17 relationship going on between anybody?

18 A **Not really, no.**

19 Q Okay. And I think you--I think you just testified earlier  
20 that nicknames are prevalent throughout the MATES. And  
21 they're prevalent throughout the military; correct?

22 A **Yes.**

23 Q We all have nicknames.

24 A **Okay.**

25 Q I mean, yeah, I mean, even when you go through basic, if

1           you do something dumb or maybe out of place, you're going  
2           to get nicknamed something. So is it out of the ordinary  
3           for somebody to be called maybe a Princess even if  
4           it's--even if it's mean-spirited or to call the boss the  
5           King? And sometimes we call the boss way meaner things  
6           that they don't know about.

7   **A       Probably.**

8   Q       But that doesn't necessarily indicate that there's an  
9           inappropriate relationship would you say?

10 **A       Not always.**

11 Q       Okay. Now, concerning the time off awards, you said that  
12          you heard from Sergeant Cooper--what exactly did you hear  
13          from Sergeant Cooper concerning the time off awards in  
14          regards to Mrs. Reed?

15 **A       Just what I said earlier.**

16 Q       Can you refresh my memory, sir?

17 **A       That he overheard Master Sergeant Reed say, "I've got  
18          vacation coming up. I need to hit the boss up for time off  
19          award--or comp time."**

20 Q       And he heard this firsthand, or was he--

21 **A       He said he heard it firsthand.**

22 Q       He'd heard it firsthand. Now, in your experience, is that  
23          how time off awards work?

24 **A       No.**

25 Q       And you did already testify that she was a very capable

1 production controller?

2 **A Yes.**

3 Q So would she merit time off awards in your mind?

4 **A Probably.**

5 Q Let's see. And the last--never mind. I won't--I won't--I  
6 won't ask you that. And then I just want to clarify as far  
7 as the comp time weekends, you've testified that the folks  
8 that are--that come in on the weekends to do comp time,  
9 there is a list that's usually put up?

10 **A Usually put up for volunteers, yes.**

11 Q For volunteers. And so if you want to work extra comp  
12 time, because you want to build up your reserve or  
13 whatever you want to call it, then you have that  
14 opportunity? That opportunity is given fairly across the  
15 board?

16 **A It is now, yes.**

17 Q Okay. All right. Well let's expand on that. What do you  
18 mean now?

19 **A Didn't use to be. When Colonel Golnick was there, it was  
20 only a select few people.**

21 Q You didn't testify that before. You testified that you  
22 just put your name on the list. You weren't clear. So  
23 you're saying that now that's the way it works. Before--

24 **A Yeah.**

25 Q So how did it work before?

1    **A**       **Just a few select people would be asked if they wanted to**  
2       **work comp.**

3    Q       And who were those few select people?

4    **A**       **Master Sergeant Reed was one of them. Usually Mr. Miller.**

5    Q       Dean Miller?

6    **A**       **Yes. I don't know who all it was.**

7    Q       So who changed the comp time, the--how you guys do comp  
8       time weekends now that--

9    **A**       **When the interim superintendent came in, he changed it.**

10   Q       And does Chief Miller support that policy? Because he's  
11       the number two now; correct?

12   **A**       **Yes, he does.**

13   Q       All right. Did you ever work a comp time weekend, or have  
14       you ever worked a comp time weekend?

15   **A**       **I have, yes.**

16   Q       When?

17   **A**       **This summer.**

18   Q       This summer?

19   **A**       **Yes.**

20   Q       And before this summer?

21   **A**       **Before that, it was probably seven or eight years.**

22   Q       Okay. So at what point in time did the policy change then?  
23       Because you testified that when Colonel Golnick--

24   **A**       **It was February of 2014.**

25   Q       No, no. When Colonel Golnick was there, you said that it



1 was only a select few people. But Colonel Golnick was  
2 there seven years ago; correct?

3 **A Yes.**

4 Q So when did he--and seven years ago, was it volunteer as  
5 well?

6 **A Yes.**

7 Q So when did that policy change?

8 **A I don't know when the exact date was. Just sometime in**  
9 **there.**

10 Q So anytime between 2007 and February of 2014 this year,  
11 when he retired--

12 **A Yes.**

13 Q --he changed that policy?

14 **A (No verbal response)**

15 Q Have you ever used an NTV, sir, or GSA to go to drill?

16 **A No.**

17 Q Never?

18 **A Never.**

19 Q An NTV?

20 **A No.**

21 Q Are you familiar with the reg that governs use of NTVs?

22 **A AR 58-1, yes.**

23 Q What is the state policy though?

24 **A State policy is superseded by AR policy.**

25 Q Negative, sir. You have a State SOP?

1    **A**     **Yes, we do.**

2                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  You're arguing with the  
3                    witness.  Okay?  I mean, Ben, you don't argue with the  
4                    witness.  You're asking him a question.  He's answered.  If  
5                    you--

6                    MR. BANCHS:  Is there an objection?

7                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Yeah, I am objecting.  You're  
8                    arguing with the witness.  Show him the document, okay, and  
9                    he can make his own conclusion.  But your point of view is  
10                   not evidence.

11                   MR. BANCHS:  I will--if you allow me to, I  
12                   will get that and I will point out that he was arguing  
13                   with Sergeant Herblet.  So--and I didn't say anything so  
14                   I'll--if you'll allow me the same latitude that I gave  
15                   you, I will get to where I'm going.

16                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Okay.  I'm not going to let  
17                   you argue but you can show him the document.

18                   MR. BANCHS:  Okay.  I'll rephrase.

19    BY MR. BANCHS:

20    Q     Are you aware that the State SOP is the government--is the  
21           governing reg here in the State of Michigan?

22    **A**     **State SOPs are superseded by ARs.  ARs are the final**  
23           **authority.**

24    Q     Okay.  Then I'll ask you this.

25    **A**     **When they contradict, the AR takes precedence.**

1 Q Okay. Well, then thank you very much. Does the SOP  
2 contradict the AR?

3 **A I don't know what it is verbatim.**

4 Q No, because the SOP would be based on the AR. So either  
5 the AR or the SOP, okay--does the AR allow National Guard  
6 members, whether they're technicians or MDA, to use an NTV  
7 for official purposes?

8 **A For official purposes, yes.**

9 Q And what would be--

10 **A From their normal place of assemblage where they report.**

11 Q Listen and follow my question here. Where is it  
12 that--where in the regulations, whether it's the AR or the  
13 SOP, is what your referencing it's only from their place  
14 of assemblage?

15 **A AR DA-1 Chapter 4.**

16 Q Okay.

17 **A It's also in Chapter 2.**

18 Q We've had testimony here and we have sign-out logs of  
19 numerous MATES employees, not just Ms. Reed--

20 **A That's a GSA sign-out roster.**

21 Q Right. And we also have the NTV and we--

22 **A NTVs were dispatched on a 30-day dispatch.**

23 Q Okay. Can you let--

24 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Chief, listen to his  
25 question.

1 MR. BANCHS: You can object to him too if you  
2 like.

3 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No. I just want you to  
4 listen to his question before you answer.

5 BY MR. BANCHS:

6 Q We have had testimony from numerous--I won't say  
7 numerous--a number of your coworkers that they--they have  
8 also admitted to using NTVs to drive from MATES to  
9 their--to their drilling location.

10 **A Okay.**

11 Q Whether it's Lansing, whether it's wherever else you guys  
12 drill. Okay? So are those folks also--

13 HEARING EXAMINER: Who?

14 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: We've heard testimony here  
15 today from numerous people?

16 MR. BANCHS: Master Sergeant Fouts said she  
17 drove an NTV to drill, absolutely.

18 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I don't recall that  
19 testimony. I don't recall her testifying that way. And you  
20 said "numerous" people, and I don't even recall one. I  
21 thought maybe you were referring to people in your  
22 rebuttal. I don't recall--

23 MR. BANCHS: Okay. We've had at least one  
24 other witness testify that she used an NTV to go to drill.

25 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I'll object to that. I don't

1 even remember it once.

2 HEARING EXAMINER: Yeah, I don't--

3 CAPTAIN BEDELLES: But subject to that  
4 objection I mean he--I don't recall one person saying they  
5 used an NTV or GSA.

6 MR. BANCHS: Well, I'll ask it a different  
7 way, and I'll have subsequent witnesses rebut what I think  
8 his answer is going to be.

9 BY MR. BANCHS:

10 Q Do you know of any MATES employees other than Mrs. Reed  
11 that have driven an NTV to drill?

12 A **Not to drill, no.**

13 Q Never?

14 A **Not to drill.**

15 Q Okay. To what?

16 A **Official functions, technician--**

17 Q Like?

18 A **They have to run parts or go get something.**

19 Q Would Ms. Reed have any occasion to bring an NTV to drill  
20 or to AT?

21 A **If she's transporting parts or something like that, then  
22 yes, it's authorized.**

23 Q Would it be possible that another person in a leadership  
24 role requested that she drive an NTV to either drill or  
25 AT?

1    **A**     **Sure, possible.**

2    Q     And if I were to show you that, which I will in a second,  
3         then would that--would that make sense to you? Would that  
4         make sense about her driving an NTV to drill or AT?

5    **A**     **Depends on what the reason was.**

6    Q     This is going to be Major Ruby's statement. Sir, this  
7         is--this statement--this sworn statement was provided in  
8         support of our rebuttal for Mrs. Reed's case that was  
9         provided by Major Ruby. If you don't mind reading that--

10   **A**     **Transporting parts, yes, that would be authorized.**

11   Q     Okay. But he clearly says here, the second sentence,  
12         "During IDT weekends, I only witnessed Master Sergeant  
13         Reed using an NTV at the Jackson Armory once. But she did  
14         drive an NTV during an IDT weekend."

15   **A**     **Yes.**

16   Q     So it is possible that the times that you heard of Mrs.  
17         Reed driving an NTV to drill or AT was for official  
18         purposes?

19   **A**     **It could be.**

20   Q     Thank you. That's all I was trying to get at. I think  
21         there was one other thing that was in your statement, sir,  
22         that I wanted to ask you about. You testified--I'm sorry.  
23         You didn't testify. You provided a sworn statement, and  
24         Colonel (sic) Bedells did not ask you about this, so this  
25         is a new line of questioning.

1 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I wish.  
2 MR. BANCHS: What?  
3 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: That's what I need to be,  
4 Colonel.  
5 MR. BANCHS: Did I say "Colonel"?  
6 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: You did.  
7 MR. BANCHS: Man--  
8 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I know.  
9 MR. BANCHS: I meant King. That's what I  
10 meant.  
11 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: You can make it happen.  
12 MR. BANCHS: It doesn't rhyme though.  
13 BY MR. BANCHS:  
14 Q You provided a sworn statement that Master Sergeant Reed  
15 in 2011 decided that she didn't like her DA photo, so  
16 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick escorted her to Lansing to  
17 personally ensure that she be allowed to retake the photo  
18 even though the policy states one photo every five years?  
19 A **Yes.**  
20 Q Okay. Were you--were you on that trip?  
21 A **No.**  
22 Q And where did you hear this from?  
23 A **From her and Colonel Golnick when they were talking about**  
24 **it before they left the shop.**  
25 Q So Master Sergeant Reed--you heard firsthand from them

1 talking about going--going or coming back from?

2 **A Going to.**

3 Q Going to. Okay. One more thing. Sir, if I was to tell you  
4 that there are individuals that have provided either  
5 unsworn testimony, sworn testimony that they did not feel  
6 there was an inappropriate relationship going on between  
7 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Mrs. Reed, would you have  
8 an issue with those statements?

9 **A Everybody had their own personal opinion.**

10 Q Okay. Would you have an issue with a statement if that  
11 individual was the person who has now been promoted to the  
12 second--to the--what is Colonel McNamara's old  
13 position--Chief Dean--

14 **A Colonel McNamara was the quality control supervisor. Chief  
15 Miller is the shop foreman.**

16 Q Chief Miller is the new shop foreman?

17 **A Yes.**

18 Q Well, Chief Miller, who is--that is the number two  
19 position; correct?

20 **A Yes.**

21 Q Okay. Chief Miller provided sworn testimony--or a sworn  
22 written statement that he did not believe there was an  
23 inappropriate relationship going on.

24 **A That's his personal opinion.**

25 MR. BANCHS: It's his personal opinion? I



1 don't have anything else, sir.

2 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

3 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No, sir.

4 HEARING EXAMINER: Just for the record, Mr.

5 Banchs, I think you indicated that there was not sworn

6 testimony regarding Chief Witcher observing Colonel

7 Golnick reaching around Master Sergeant Reed. And actually

8 that is in his sworn testimony.

9 MR. BANCHS: In his?

10 HEARING EXAMINER: Uh-huh.

11 MR. BANCHS: Where is it at, if you don't

12 mind, sir?

13 HEARING EXAMINER: Have you got his sworn

14 statement?

15 MR. BANCHS: I've got his up, yeah.

16 HEARING EXAMINER: It'd be the one, two,

17 three, four--fifth line down.

18 MR. BANCHS: Oh, yeah. Okay. My bad.

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: See, I didn't even object.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: I'm just trying to keep the

21 record straight.

22 MR. BANCHS: Good catch.

23 HEARING EXAMINER: And if you want to--if you

24 want to cross on that--

25 MR. BANCHS: Let me just look at one thing,

1           sir. Yeah, yeah. Sorry. I don't have any more questions at  
2           this time.

3                         HEARING EXAMINER: Chief, I remind you that  
4           you remain under oath and that you are subject to recall  
5           to this hearing until such time that it has been  
6           adjourned.

7                         THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

8                         HEARING EXAMINER: I will remind you not to  
9           discuss your testimony with anyone.

10                        THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

11                        HEARING EXAMINER: With that, you're free to  
12          go. Thanks for your time. Let's go off the record.

13                        COURT REPORTER: It is 5:58 p.m., and we are  
14          off the record.

15                                 (At 5:58 p.m., witness excused)

16                                 (Off the record)

17                        HEARING EXAMINER: We are on the record.

18                        COURT REPORTER: We're on the record. The time  
19          is 6:09 p.m.

20                        HEARING EXAMINER: Raise your right hand,  
21          please. Do you swear or affirm that the testimony you're  
22          about to give in this case is the truth, the whole truth,  
23          and nothing but the truth so help you God?

24                                 CHIEF SHARON WHITCHER: I do.

25                        HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised

1           that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
2           interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
3           testifying in this case. And with that, you can have a  
4           seat. And I will turn it over to Captain Bedells.

5                           CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

6                           CHIEF SHARON WHITCHER

7           (At 6:09 p.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

8                           DIRECT EXAMINATION

9 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

10 Q       Chief, would you please state your full name for the  
11       record?

12 A       **Sharon May Whitcher.**

13 Q       Okay. Chief, we've listened to some testimony--well, let  
14       me back up. You testified last week in the Smock file--in  
15       the Smock hearing; correct?

16 A       **Correct, sir.**

17 Q       And you understand that although we're talking about the  
18       same AR 15-6 here today, we're talking about the  
19       termination of Master Sergeant Reed; correct?

20 A       **Correct, sir.**

21 Q       You understand that? Okay. So I'm going to limit my  
22       questions to the issues that deal with Master Sergeant  
23       Reed's termination. Understood?

24 A       **Yes, sir.**

25 Q       And if you don't understand a question by myself or the

1           Hearing Examiner or Mr. Banchs, then ask us to rephrase it  
2           and state, "I don't understand." And you have to answer  
3           with a verbal response. Okay? "Yes" or "no," "I don't  
4           understand"--because a shake of the head or a nod or  
5           something that you don't say clearly won't be reflected in  
6           the record. Do you understand that?

7   **A       I do, sir.**

8   Q       Okay. With that said, we've heard testimony here today  
9           regarding the relationship between Master Sergeant Reed  
10          and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick. And my question to you is  
11          how would you characterize that relationship?

12 **A       More than professional.**

13 Q       Well, what do you mean by "more than professional"?

14 **A       Fraternization.**

15 Q       Now, we've heard it described as--we've heard it described  
16          as inappropriate, strange, and uncomfortable. Do you agree  
17          with those--

18 **A       I do, sir.**

19 Q       --analyses of the relationship? Okay. Do you agree?

20 **A       I do, sir.**

21 Q       Okay. What--and you testified more than professional or  
22          fraternization. What leads you to characterize the  
23          relationship between Master Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant  
24          Colonel Golnick in those words?

25 **A       Can I take just a minute to reread this though really**

1           **quick before we get going too fast?**

2    Q       And this is what?

3    A       **My statements regarding--**

4    Q       Oh, yeah, absolutely. We would have furnished it--that  
5           earlier if we had known you had to--go ahead. Take your  
6           time and read it.

7    A       **Thank you, sir.**

8                       HEARING EXAMINER: We can go off the record  
9           for just a couple minutes.

10                      COURT REPORTER: We are going off the record.  
11           The time is 6:12 p.m.

12                      (Off the record)

13                      HEARING EXAMINER: Go back on.

14                      COURT REPORTER: We're back on the record. The  
15           time is 6:16 p.m.

16   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

17   Q       Okay. You've--now having had an opportunity to review your  
18           sworn statement, okay, I'm going to ask you how would  
19           you--you've already characterized the relationship. Why do  
20           you describe the relationship as you perceived it between  
21           Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed as  
22           more than professional or bordering on fraternization?

23   A       **Between the amount of time that they spent together, the**  
24           **breaks, the doing the PT together, the eating their**  
25           **lunches together, meeting in between the regular duty day,**

1           **I mean it just seemed like they were just chronically all**  
2           **the time together. No other person received that much**  
3           **extra attention.**

4    Q       When you say chronically together all the time, we've  
5           heard any from 70 percent of the time to seven and  
6           one-half hours of an eight-hour day. What did you  
7           personally observe? Not what you heard, but what  
8           would--what did you personally observe these two share--

9    **A       At least--at least--**

10   Q       --in terms of--

11   **A       --a couple hours a day.**

12   Q       So you can--you can say with personal knowledge that  
13           Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed spent  
14           at least two hours a day together?

15   **A       Yes, sir.**

16   Q       Okay. Now, I understand that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
17           was the shop superintendent. Correct?

18   **A       Yes, sir.**

19   Q       And Master Sergeant--Master Sergeant Reed was the  
20           production controller; correct?

21   **A       Correct, sir.**

22   Q       And, incidentally, what if--what if any opinion do you  
23           have regarding Master Sergeant Reed's abilities as a  
24           production controller?

25   **A       She's good at her job.**

1 Q So if she's good at her job, why would her  
2 supervisor--well, was Lieutenant Colonel Golnick her  
3 supervisor to your knowledge?

4 A **Yeah.**

5 Q Why would her supervisor be in her office two hours a day?

6 A **Didn't appear to be work-related. It seemed to be more on  
7 the--like the brotherly-sisterly, more of like--I don't  
8 know how to say it--like personal time and not really  
9 business time.**

10 Q So not work-related?

11 A **Not work.**

12 Q So at least the two hours that you observed--and is that  
13 per day?

14 A **On average, yes, sir.**

15 Q Okay. Now, how did you formulate this opinion? I mean,  
16 we've dispensed with some formalities of the Court. But I  
17 have to tell you, I mean, there has to be a foundation.  
18 How did you--how did you come to know that Lieutenant  
19 Colonel Golnick is spending on average two hours a day  
20 each day in Master Sergeant Fouts's--or Master Sergeant  
21 Reed's office?

22 A **You could--you could hear them. The hallways are not, you  
23 know, soundproof. You could hear them like if I was  
24 sitting at the computer on this side of the cages, you  
25 could hear the joking and the laughter coming through.**

1           When I had to get parts from the parts barn, I'd have--one  
2           of the parts people, we'd go out down that aisleway to  
3           exit the building and into the parts barn. And there they  
4           would be. I mean, it seemed like every time you turned  
5           around, that's what you would see.

6    Q       Okay. And when you say "that's what you would see"--

7    A       Them together, sir.

8    Q       In whose office?

9    A       Whether it was in her office or they were in the hallway  
10          or you could hear them even laughing coming from his  
11          office from time to time.

12   Q       Okay. And where is your office? Do you work in an office?

13   A       I do not, sir. I work out in the bays.

14   Q       When you--when you arrived at this--at this opinion that  
15          they were spending about two hours a day together, where  
16          were you working within the MATES facility?

17   A       Primarily I work in the bays because I'm an auto  
18          technician. But there is occasions throughout the day  
19          where you go and you use the computer, you go and take the  
20          garbage out to the garbage dumpster, you go get the parts  
21          that you need, you go get paperwork that you need. So  
22          there's many occasions throughout the day to be throughout  
23          the entire building.

24   Q       You're a auto mechanic; correct?

25   A       I think the--heavy surface maintenance.



1 Q Yeah, we went over this. Heavy surface maintenance, okay.  
2 Did you have occasion in that capacity to go into Master  
3 Sergeant Reed's office?

4 A **On occasions, yes, to get paperwork.**

5 Q What kind of paperwork?

6 A **Job orders to change statuses, to get new job orders, to  
7 update or request an add task.**

8 Q Would you drop off a completed job order in her office?

9 A **Typically not a completed one. That would go through my  
10 wage leader.**

11 Q Okay. Just when I thought I was getting the hang of all  
12 this stuff. Okay. So you would pick up new job orders from  
13 Master Sergeant Reed; correct?

14 A **Yes, like if--if the wage leaders weren't available or on  
15 certain instances if they were in meetings and you had to  
16 go get another job order, yes, you would go in.**

17 Q And how often in a week would you have to enter Master  
18 Sergeant Reed's office to get a job order?

19 A **I'd probably say roughly--well, it varied because some  
20 weeks it seemed like it was way more than others and other  
21 weeks not so much so. But on average, I would say about  
22 once a week.**

23 Q So once a week you have to go in to Master Sergeant Reed's  
24 office to pick up a job order; correct?

25 A **Or do the other--you know, amend the task or--but job**

1           **order related, yes.**

2    Q       Okay. And understanding sometimes it might be you don't go  
3           in there at all?

4    **A       Correct.**

5    Q       And other times maybe it's twice a week; correct?

6    **A       Correct.**

7    Q       So what was your experience with respect to whether you  
8           found Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in her office or didn't  
9           find Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in her office when you  
10          went to get a job order? That's poorly worded.

11   **A       I guess I'm not--**

12   Q       I know. It was no sooner out of my mouth than I--

13                       MR. BANCHS: I object just for objection  
14          purposes.

15                       THE WITNESS: I guess I'm a little confused on  
16          this one.

17   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

18   Q       When you went to get a job order, did you ever find  
19          Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in her Master Sergeant Reed's  
20          office?

21   **A       Yes, on multiple occasions, sir.**

22   Q       Would you characterize it as in most instances when you  
23          went in to get a job order he was in there? Or half the  
24          time or rarely?

25   **A       I would say 75 percent of the time.**

1 Q Okay. So if you were going in there once a week and you  
2 went in the there for a month, three out of the four times  
3 you're going to find--it's your testimony you'd find  
4 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in there?

5 A **Yes, sir.**

6 Q Correct? And did that have any affect on your picking up a  
7 job order?

8 A **It made it very uncomfortable.**

9 Q How so?

10 A **Because it was--there was just the vibe that you were**  
11 **interrupting their personal time, and it was just really**  
12 **awkward. I mean, you could hear them laughing and joking,**  
13 **and as soon as you walked in, it would be like, you know,**  
14 **like stop all conversations. And it was just awkward.**

15 Q Well, did you know whether they were talking about  
16 work-related matters or--

17 A **I can't imagine work-related matters would be that funny,**  
18 **sir.**

19 Q So they were laughing?

20 A **Yes, sir.**

21 Q Are you suggesting that what goes on at MATES isn't funny?

22 A **Not most times, sir.**

23 Q Okay. Did you ever observe Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and  
24 Master Sergeant Reed eating together?

25 A **Yes, sir, on multiple occasions.**

1 Q Where did you observe them eating together?

2 A **In her office.**

3 Q Now, you've already testified that you found yourself in  
4 her office maybe once--on average once a week for  
5 job-related--

6 A **Correct.**

7 Q --matters; correct? Okay. How often did you observe  
8 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed eating  
9 in her office?

10 A **You mean like as far as the frequency or like an actual  
11 total number?**

12 Q Well, yeah, I can't get a total number. Let's say in a  
13 given week, how often did you observe Lieutenant Colonel  
14 Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed eating lunch in her  
15 office?

16 A **I'd say at least a couple times a week.**

17 Q Okay. And did you ever observe them eating breakfast in  
18 her office?

19 A **Not so much breakfast. I think there was at least one time  
20 that I can remember a breakfast but--**

21 Q Did you ever hear any accounts from other people within  
22 MATES about how often they ate lunch or breakfast  
23 together?

24 A **Yeah. There's several topics of discussion on that through  
25 the MATES facility. It just struck a lot of people as odd.**

1 Q Can you tell the Hearing Examiner here today the other  
2 accounts you might have heard about, you know, with  
3 respect to frequency or whatnot?

4 A **It just seemed like it was almost like a shop joke that,**  
5 **"Oh, they're doing it again. They're in there carrying on**  
6 **and having lunch" and just--it just seemed to be--just**  
7 **like hallway talk.**

8 Q Now, there's also been some testimony--and I believe you  
9 provided some--a statement in your sworn statement about  
10 Master Sergeant Reed's use of Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's  
11 NTV. Is that correct?

12 A **Yes.**

13 Q Okay. Can you tell the Hearing Examiner why you chose to  
14 include that account in your statement to the  
15 investigating officer?

16 A **Well, I'm trying to find it so maybe I can remember what**  
17 **spurred that memory but--**

18 Q Well, do you remember reading it as you just reviewed it a  
19 few minutes ago?

20 A **I'm sorry?**

21 Q Do you remember reading it when you just reviewed it a  
22 minute ago, or do you have to review it further?

23 A **No. I just wanted to find it there real quick. Yeah,**  
24 **she--she used the GSA during an AT period for AT 2012**  
25 **during--**

1                   MR. BANCHS: I'm sorry. If I may interrupt, is  
2                   it in your statement?

3                   THE WITNESS: It's in the statement, sir.

4                   MR. BANCHS: Where is it?

5                   HEARING EXAMINER: It's about halfway down the  
6                   first page, a little further than--the second paragraph.

7                   MR. BANCHS: I got it. Okay. Thanks.

8 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

9 Q                Go ahead, Chief.

10 A               I'm sorry. What--oh, that the vehicles--okay. At AT 2012  
11                she definitely had the GSA out there for that. And then  
12                shortly after I made my transfer from the 1071st as a  
13                Warrant Officer candidate, and I was drilling down in  
14                Jackson. She had the--one of the vehicles down there as  
15                well. It was one of the white ones.

16 Q                Okay. And I mean, was your conclusion that this was  
17                somehow an improper use of an NTV?

18 A                Yeah, because quite typically when other people had asked  
19                to use NTVs for similar purposes, they were denied. So it  
20                just seemed funny that--

21 Q                Whom did they ask--

22 A                There is--

23 Q                --these other people?

24 A                I'm not sure who they asked for the use of the vehicle.  
25                But typically all--

- 1 Q Well, who denied it?
- 2 A **Lieutenant Colonel Golnick.**
- 3 Q Okay. So it's your testimony that other people would ask
- 4 to use an NTV to, what, go to drill week or to go to AT?
- 5 A **AT or drills.**
- 6 Q What drills?
- 7 A **Sometimes they had stuff to take down to the unit or**
- 8 **whatever.**
- 9 Q Right. And they were denied?
- 10 A **And they were denied.**
- 11 Q Did you ever ask Lieutenant Colonel--did you ever ask to
- 12 use an NTV?
- 13 A **No, sir, well, not for drill or AT. I did have use of an**
- 14 **NTV to go to the Girl Tech Seminars in Traverse City once**
- 15 **a year.**
- 16 Q The what?
- 17 A **They're called Girl Tech Seminars. I speak to a group of**
- 18 **high school girls. They're about 220--**
- 19 Q Oh, great, okay. About technology stuff?
- 20 A **Non-traditional career fields for women. Then they shoot**
- 21 **me up for being both a soldier and a mechanic.**
- 22 Q Okay. And you were permitted to use an NTV on that
- 23 occasion?
- 24 A **Yes.**
- 25 Q Any other instances?

1    **A**    **Not that I can think of.**

2    Q    Now, I presume you were authorized to use that NTV and it  
3        was otherwise permitted. Correct?

4    **A**    **Correct, sir.**

5    Q    I mean, otherwise you wouldn't ask; right?

6    **A**    **Right.**

7    Q    You wouldn't ask to use an NTV to, say, go to the grocery  
8        store; right?

9    **A**    **No.**

10   Q    So is it possible that when you personally observed Master  
11        Sergeant Reed using an NTV that it was authorized and  
12        permissible?

13   **A**    **Well, I'm sure it was authorized by Lieutenant Colonel**  
14        **Golnick. But like when she would have the vehicle and her**  
15        **and Sergeant First Class Couterier would have it for the**  
16        **entire drill weekend, none of the rest of us were allowed**  
17        **to drive around for drill weekend in a GSA or an NTV.**

18   Q    Where did you observe this? What drill weekend were--

19   **A**    **Oh, I saw it out to the MATES on several occasions. Like I**  
20        **said, the one down in Jackson. So, yeah, it's more than**  
21        **once.**

22   Q    Okay. Well, let's take those separately. So a drill  
23        weekend at MATES; correct?

24   **A**    **Couple of them, yes.**

25   Q    You observed--you observed Master Sergeant Reed driving an



1 NTV; is that correct?

2 **A With Sergeant First Class Couterier, yes.**

3 Q Was that on her way to drill weekend or during the weekend  
4 she was drilling at MATES?

5 **A During the weekend. She was up there giving additional  
6 training to some of the 1071st folks. And she actually got  
7 good reviews for the training that she gave that weekend.  
8 But, again, she was still using the vehicle.**

9 Q And as far as you're concerned, that was--it might have  
10 been authorized but was an impermissible use of an NTV?

11 **A Yes, sir.**

12 Q Okay. Now, secondly you talked about Jackson. Is that--

13 **A Yes.**

14 Q --what you said, the 272nd?

15 **A Well, I had transferred from the 1071st to the 1461st,  
16 which is like the childhood version--well, they're like  
17 the parent unit, and I'm the unit below. We were all  
18 drilling out of that armory that weekend.**

19 Q Jackson? And is it your testimony that you observed Master  
20 Sergeant Reed driving an NTV in Jackson during that drill  
21 weekend?

22 **A To that drill weekend, yes, sir.**

23 Q To that drill weekend? Okay. I again presume that you  
24 think it was probably authorized by Lieutenant Colonel  
25 Golnick?

1    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

2    Q    Do you think it was a proper use of an NTV?

3    **A**    **No, sir.**

4    Q    And why do you--why do you believe it not to be a proper  
5        use of an NTV?

6    **A**    **Because none of us, especially those of us with higher  
7        rank, should ever use equipment for our own personal  
8        saving of our gas funding when especially the lower  
9        enlisted are having a harder time with money. And they  
10       don't ever get to drive around in a government vehicle to  
11       save their gas money. And it just doesn't set the right  
12       tone for leadership.**

13   Q    Okay. Is it possible that--well, strike that. Did you--you  
14        didn't ride down with Master Sergeant Reed, did you?

15   **A**    **No, sir.**

16   Q    You drove yourself?

17   **A**    **I did.**

18   Q    Okay. Did you guys ever talk about ride sharing like,  
19        "Hey, I'm going to drill the same weekend. Let's"--

20   **A**    **No, sir.**

21   Q    Okay. Did you confront Master Sergeant Reed about it?

22   **A**    **No, sir.**

23   Q    So did you ask her, "hey, why did you take that NTV down"?

24   **A**    **I never asked her, sir.**

25   Q    Is it possible that it was both authorized and maybe there

1 was a permissible use or a permissible reason for her to  
2 take that NTV down?

3 **A Probably a slight chance.**

4 **Q** Have you ever used an NTV to go to drill?

5 **A No, sir.**

6 **Q** Have you ever used an NTV to go to AT?

7 **A No, sir.**

8 **Q** But you have used an NTV to go to Girl Tech?

9 **A Yes, sir.**

10 **Q** Okay. And who did you ask--who did you have to ask for  
11 permission to do that?

12 **A That usually starts with the Girl--with the people setting  
13 up the seminar. They write down to Lansing to whoever the  
14 head guy is because like--even though it's not a  
15 recruiting, it's still a good, like, PR stunt for the  
16 military to have somebody there to speak to this amount of  
17 girls in one time. So then it gets fed up from there to  
18 the MATES with the authorization that, yes, I can go on  
19 technician time.**

20 **Q** Who authorized it?

21 **A Somebody down in Lansing.**

22 **Q** Okay. Not Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

23 **A In the end, he was the shop supervisor, but it was  
24 approved actually probably above his level, and I got use  
25 of the vehicle.**

1 Q Did you ever observe Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master  
2 Sergeant Reed walking around the MATES facility?

3 A On multiple occasions, yes, sir. I saw them several times  
4 coming out through the courtyard and walking out through  
5 the--like the tank parking lot. And then they'd come back  
6 and I saw them out into the--on the other side of the  
7 MATES going through like what used to be called Deadline  
8 Row. And it's just not proper looking when she's a  
9 computer operator and she inputs all these jobs orders  
10 into--there's really no reason for her to be out looking  
11 at vehicles and taking walks. It just doesn't come off  
12 as--

13 Q Where were you--you said you've observed this several  
14 times?

15 A Yes, sir.

16 Q Okay. Do you recall were you generally in the same place  
17 when you made this observation? Or were you in different  
18 places?

19 A Well, like the time I saw them going through the  
20 courtyard, they were going out of the courtyard, and I was  
21 coming in. So I mean, it's the same--

22 Q Did you ask them like, "Hey, what are you guys doing out  
23 here"?

24 A No.

25 Q Why not? I mean, if it struck you as odd, why wouldn't you

1 say, "Hey, what are you two doing out here"?

2 **A Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and I don't really have a**  
3 **speaking relationship after I filed an EEO complaint on**  
4 **him, sir.**

5 Q Okay. I was going to ask some questions on that, but I  
6 won't. What about--what about Master Sergeant Reed? You  
7 didn't file an EEO complaint against her, did you?

8 **A No, sir.**

9 Q Could you have asked her like, "Hey"--

10 **A No, sir, because--**

11 Q --"Master Sergeant Reed what are you guys doing out  
12 there"?

13 **A About the time I filed the EEO complaint against**  
14 **Lieutenant Colonel Golnick, I started getting harassment**  
15 **via Master Sergeant Reed in the bathroom area. My stuff**  
16 **was always in her way, so she'd always move my towel from**  
17 **here to there or my coveralls from here to there. She**  
18 **moved the benches. If I was in there at this bench, she**  
19 **would have a fit, so I'd have to use the next--the other**  
20 **bench the next day. And I could never be--I could never**  
21 **pick the right bench, so there's always just a lot more**  
22 **tensions. And so there was no open line of communications,**  
23 **sir.**

24 Q Speaking of the gym, did you ever see them--did you ever  
25 see Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed

1 work out together?

2 **A Yes, sir. There was a lot of times I'd go to my--do my**  
3 **workout, and they would be in the fitness room. It'd be**  
4 **very uncomfortable, so I would opt to go outside and do my**  
5 **fitness outside.**

6 Q How was it uncomfortable?

7 **A Same like going into the office where she was working. It**  
8 **was just--there was just a vibe that you know you were not**  
9 **welcome there.**

10 Q Okay. And was this something that you say frequently  
11 occurred, the two of them working out together?

12 **A Quite frequently, sir.**

13 Q Did you ever work out with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

14 **A No, sir.**

15 Q Did you ever work out with Master Sergeant Reed?

16 **A No, sir.**

17 Q Did you ever eat breakfast with Lieutenant Colonel  
18 Golnick?

19 **A No, sir.**

20 Q Did you ever eat breakfast with Master Sergeant Reed in  
21 her office?

22 **A No, sir.**

23 Q Did you ever eat lunch with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

24 **A No, sir.**

25 Q Did you ever eat lunch with Master Sergeant Reed in her

1 office?

2 **A No, sir.**

3 Q You've already testified you were never granted an NTV to  
4 go to drill or an AT; correct?

5 **A Correct, sir.**

6 Q Do you think that Master Sergeant Reed benefited in any  
7 respect from the relationship she had with Lieutenant  
8 Colonel Golnick?

9 **A Oh, I believe so, sir.**

10 Q Okay. And is that because you believe Lieutenant Colonel  
11 Golnick to be her first-line supervisor; correct? Or is  
12 that correct?

13 **A Yes, sir.**

14 Q Would you be surprised if I told you that Lieutenant  
15 Colonel Golnick was not her first-line supervisor?

16 **A No, it would not surprise me. But there was a lot of times  
17 where even if he wasn't, she took--she'd take her leave  
18 slips directly to him and bypass who it should have went  
19 to, so it was kind of a moot point so--**

20 Q Well, when you speak of these instances of her bypassing  
21 her first-line supervisor, on those occasions who did you  
22 believe her first-line supervisor to be?

23 **A I think it was supposed to be Troy Herblet at the time.  
24 That whole section kind of kept evolving around who was  
25 their leader at the time. It was a work in progress.**

1 Q And you've testified you believe that she benefited from  
2 the relationship. In what respects? How do you believe  
3 Master Sergeant Reed benefited from her relationship with  
4 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

5 A Well, there was a couple times that, you know, if you're  
6 walking down through the hallway and you could hear her  
7 talking and stuff, there'd be the oddball comments of  
8 something to the effect that, "Well, I'm getting low on  
9 leave. I guess it's time to ask for another time off  
10 award." And, sure enough, a while later there would be a  
11 time off award.

12 Q Well, how do you--

13 A Or there would be comp weekends that nobody else--

14 Q Chief, stop. Did you personally hear this?

15 A I heard that comment, yes, sir.

16 Q You personally heard it?

17 A Yes.

18 Q From Master Sergeant Reed?

19 A Coming out of her mouth, yes.

20 Q And how did you confirm that she actually received--are  
21 you sure it was time off award and maybe not comp time?

22 A It was probably both, sir, because she got comp time as  
23 well.

24 Q Well, how do you know she--I mean, this seems like a  
25 personal matter. Like how would you know if I got--



1    **A**       Well, because like if you got a time off award, sir,  
2               there's usually like a shop meeting and then Lieutenant  
3               Colonel Golnick would come out and present the time off  
4               awards to Master Sergeant Reed, Joe Smock, and whoever  
5               else was getting the time off awards. So it wasn't kept  
6               secret who got the time off awards. The information was  
7               put out in shop meetings.

8    **Q**       Okay. Did you ever receive a time off award from  
9               Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

10   **A**       **No, sir.**

11   **Q**       How about comp time?

12   **A**       **A couple times, sir.**

13                        CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. I have no further  
14                        questions at this time.

15                        HEARING EXAMINER: Mr. Banchs?

16                        MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

17                                        CROSS-EXAMINATION

18   BY MR. BANCHS:

19   **Q**       Ma'am, how long--refresh my memory. How long was  
20               Lieutenant Colonel Golnick supervising--the superintendent  
21               of the MATES?

22   **A**       **A long time, sir.**

23   **Q**       And it's your testimony--and I'll start with this. I  
24               wasn't going to start with this, but I need to start with  
25               this. It's your testimony that you never received a time

1 off award?

2 **A I received team time off awards, yes.**

3 Q Okay. From?

4 **A The whole team was put in for it, so they--they get**  
5 **approved as a team time off award.**

6 Q Now, the--when Colonel Doolittle did his investigation, he  
7 requested a printout from HRO of everybody that received a  
8 time off award at the MATES since 2007. Do you know that  
9 the record shows that you received a total of 104 hours of  
10 time off awards between the--

11 **A How many of those were team time off awards?**

12 Q I don't know. It wasn't broken down like that. But I can  
13 tell you that between 2007 and 2013, you received 104  
14 hours worth of time off awards. And in 2013 you received  
15 14 hours, at least as of August 2013, when the  
16 investigation started. And in 2012 you received 20.

17 **A Time--they were team time off awards.**

18 Q I understand that. But before that time off award can make  
19 it up to HRO, it has to be approved by Colonel Golnick at  
20 the MATES level?

21 **A It goes through a PC council, yes, sir.**

22 Q Okay. Which Colonel Golnick's a part of?

23 **A Yes, sir.**

24 Q So Colonel Golnick in a sense did agree with awarding you  
25 a time off award at least--

1    **A**       **In a sense, yes, as team-based, not in an individual.**

2    Q        Okay. And what I also find interesting is that you say  
3            that when Colonel Golnick--Colonel Golnick would actually  
4            have meetings and present--or a time off awards  
5            presentation was made by Colonel Golnick is what you just  
6            said right before the--

7    **A**       **Correct.**

8    Q        --questions got turned over to me. So this was not being  
9            done secretively?

10   **A**       **No, it was not secretive.**

11   Q        Okay. And by all intents and purposes, if based on your  
12            testimony and the testimony of even your husband and those  
13            prior to you, everybody so far has said that Mrs. Reed was  
14            an outstanding PC.

15   **A**       **She is a good PC.**

16   Q        So then if she received a time off award, would it not  
17            have been merited?

18   **A**       **Possibly.**

19   Q        Okay. Were your time off awards merited?

20   **A**       **As a team-based award, yes, they were, sir.**

21   Q        How do you know that hers weren't team time off awards?

22   **A**       **I don't know that all of them were, but when she's called  
23            up individually, it leads one to believe that it was an  
24            individual time off award, sir.**

25   Q        Okay. So is your--is your issue with the fact that she was

1 recognized publically, however you weren't even though you  
2 did receive a time off award?

3 **A I'm not tracking where you're going.**

4 **Q** When you say that she was called up--when you said that  
5 she was called up and she received a time off award--

6 **A Yes, sir.**

7 **Q** I'll ask it a different way. In 2012, Mrs. Reed received  
8 24 hours worth of time off award. And you received 20  
9 hours, so she only received four more hours than you did  
10 in 2012. So I'm assuming that in 2012, she was recognized  
11 publically for receiving a time off award, and you  
12 weren't?

13 **A With what you're saying, yes, that would be an accurate  
14 picture.**

15 **Q** Okay. Is your--I hate to use this word. But is your beef  
16 more that she was recognized publically and you weren't  
17 even though you got a time off award just--

18 **A No.**

19 **Q** --just like she did?

20 **A No.**

21 **Q** So what is the issue then?

22 **A The issue is that when you can hear comments being made  
23 about, "I'm getting low on annual leave. It's time to ask  
24 for a time off award," and then she gets one, there is an  
25 issue there.**

1 Q Well, then you recall--do you recall when she might have  
2 made that statement? Because you just testified that you  
3 actually heard her make that statement.

4 A **She did make that statement.**

5 Q So did you--you said you heard her though?

6 A **Uh-huh.**

7 Q Okay. Because you didn't say that in your sworn written  
8 statement. You just--you just said that that statement was  
9 made. But I don't think you necessarily said that you  
10 heard it.

11 A **I wrote it as the common expression similar to "I am  
12 getting low on leave, so I guess I better ask for a time  
13 off award." Yes, I wrote that.**

14 Q Right. And before--I don't want to--I don't want to get  
15 this wrong. You didn't hear that from anybody else?

16 A **No, sir.**

17 Q So her getting 24 versus your 20 strikes you as odd?

18 A **No, it doesn't.**

19 Q Okay. When you say that the relationship was more than  
20 professional, you used the word "fraternization," which is  
21 a legal term. But then you said the amount--and it was  
22 because of the amount of time, the breaks, the lunches,  
23 and the PT, at least a couple of hours a day on average.  
24 Colonel Golnick was the superintendent of the facility;  
25 correct?

1    **A**     **Correct, sir.**

2    Q     And Sergeant Reed was the production controller?

3    **A**     **Correct, sir.**

4    Q     Would there be a reason for the superintendent to spend a  
5         couple of hours a day with his production controller?

6    **A**     **He never did with any of the previous ones, sir.**

7    Q     Okay. But I'm not asking you what he did with the previous  
8         ones. Would there be anything out of the ordinary for the  
9         superintendent to spend a couple of hours per day, based  
10        on your testimony, with his production controller--

11   **A**     **I guess I'm not--**

12   Q     --whether it was male or female?

13   **A**     **I guess I'm not following.**

14   Q     Well, I'll ask it a different way. What is the job of the  
15         production controller?

16   **A**     **Handles the bulk of the paperwork dealing with all the job  
17         orders for the MATES facility.**

18   Q     And what is the reason for that? What is she--she tracks;  
19         right? She tracks production?

20   **A**     **Correct.**

21   Q     And those--those numbers are sent higher up; correct?

22   **A**     **Excuse me. Yes, sir.**

23   Q     Do you need a drink?

24   **A**     **Oh, I have a drink. I think it's making me hiccup.**

25   Q     So she tracks the production that the MATES is doing;

1 correct?

2 **A Correct.**

3 Q And those numbers are sent higher up?

4 **A Yes.**

5 Q And if production is not where it needs to be, then who's  
6 going to answer for that? Who do you think would answer?

7 **A For the shop production or her production, sir?**

8 Q The MATES production. We've already established that she  
9 does a great job as a PC.

10 **A She does.**

11 Q So I'm not talking about her job performance. I'm saying  
12 the numbers that she tracks is how many vehicles you guys  
13 are fixing. I'm just going to boil it down to the most  
14 basic level.

15 **A Okay.**

16 Q So if you guys--if she--what she's tracking is your  
17 performance basically? You as a mechanic collectively, not  
18 just you individually. So if you guys aren't fixing your  
19 vehicles, those numbers are going up higher than MATES;  
20 correct?

21 **A Yes, sir.**

22 Q So the SMO's office per se?

23 **A Sure, sir.**

24 Q So if the MATES is not meeting their production numbers,  
25 who is the SMO going to call? Is he going to call Sergeant

1 Reed, or are they going to call Colonel Golnick?

2 **A** I understand your question, but the thought processes here  
3 aren't really necessarily following yours. Because if  
4 we're getting team-based time off awards, there wouldn't  
5 be a reason for us to be showing low production to be  
6 creating this kind of scenario that--

7 **Q** I'm sorry. I--

8 **A** --that you're describing.

9 **Q** Maybe I wasn't--I wasn't clear, ma'am. I'm not talking  
10 about the time off awards anymore.

11 **A** I know but you're talking about a low production and that  
12 report having to go higher and then the SMO--but if we  
13 were at low production, we wouldn't have been getting the  
14 team time off awards. So there wouldn't have been that  
15 issue.

16 **Q** Well, let's take it by the numbers. Okay? Sergeant Reed  
17 tracks maintenance production; correct?

18 **A** Yes.

19 **Q** And she--and she has nothing to do with that. She's just a  
20 messenger; right? So if production is on par, she's going  
21 to report that; correct?

22 **A** Correct.

23 **Q** And if production is not on par, she's also going to  
24 report that--

25 **A** Correct.



1 Q --right? Now, would there be any reason for the  
2 maintenance superintendent to want to know what the status  
3 of production is in his facility?

4 A **Well, yes, but it should not take no couple hours a day to**  
5 **read them reports. Those reports are mostly sent**  
6 **electronically. So he should be able to receive them in**  
7 **his office, look them up, and there's the answers right**  
8 **there in front of him.**

9 Q Is there any regulation that requires that he only receive  
10 the reports via email or whatever?

11 A **No; no, sir.**

12 Q So he certainly could walk over--

13 A **Well, that's his--**

14 Q --to her office?

15 A **That's his prerogative, yes, sir.**

16 Q And request those numbers verbally per se; right?

17 A **It's his prerogative, sir.**

18 Q And would he have a reason to know what those production  
19 numbers are?

20 A **He should know what those production numbers are. He's the**  
21 **head honcho of the shop.**

22 Q Okay. So I know we went the long way around, but there  
23 would be a reason--a work-related reason for Colonel  
24 Golnick to be in Sergeant Reed's office?

25 A **And, again, I can't see where they'd be that funny to be**

1           **creating a bunch of laughter and carrying on but maybe--**

2    Q       We can get to the laughter in a second. I just want a  
3           "yes" or "no" answer, ma'am.

4    **A       Yes, there is an occasion.**

5    Q       Great, now speaking of the laughter--and I know that maybe  
6           the question that Captain Bedells asked you was  
7           rhetorical. But you--you replied to his question about  
8           MATES not being fun to work--or something like that. And  
9           you said, "I can't imagine work-related matters were that  
10          funny." Do you recall making that statement?

11   **A       Yeah.**

12   Q       So does nobody at the MATES facility cut up, laugh, or  
13          goof off other than Colonel Golnick and Sergeant Reed?

14   **A       Oh, no. We all cut at different times.**

15   Q       So why would it be strange or why would it be obtuse for  
16          Sergeant Reed and Colonel Golnick to carry on maybe in a  
17          jokingly way?

18   **A       The frequency of it, sir.**

19   Q       Okay. But still, so the other folks at MATES, do they only  
20          joke around on Mondays?

21   **A       Not for hours a day, no, sir.**

22   Q       But you--you've already testified that there--he's only in  
23          her office maybe two hours a day.

24   **A       Maybe a couple, yes.**

25   Q       Is there a requirement anywhere that says you have to be

1           serious at all times?

2   **A    No, but you're supposed to be able to come into work and**  
3           **be at your workstation at the opening time, and you're**  
4           **expected to do a full day's job for a full day's wage.**

5   Q    Okay. You testified that in addition to the breaks, the  
6           lunches, and PT that they would meet in between duty days.  
7           And I'm assuming you meant off duty. Right?

8   **A    No. I didn't ever say--I didn't say anything about after**  
9           **duty.**

10 Q    Well, you said between--you said meetings between the duty  
11           day. Or did you mean like--what did you mean when you said  
12           that? I mean, I wrote it verbatim.

13 **A    Can you--can you read a little bit more and refresh my**  
14           **memory on what that conversation was at that time?**

15 Q    When you were asked how much time they spent together by  
16           Colonel (sic) Bedells--and I'm paraphrasing here to some  
17           extent. You said that at least a couple of hours a day on  
18           average. Does that sound familiar?

19 **A    Uh-huh.**

20 Q    Okay. And the he asked you well, when would those--when  
21           would that take place? And you said that it would--it was  
22           usually or sometime during break time or breaks, lunches,  
23           PT. And you said "meetings between the duty day." Did you  
24           mean like during the duty day or like after hours?

25 **A    During the duty day.**

- 1 Q All right. Then never mind my question. Because I was  
2 going to ask you about them, you know, hanging out  
3 socially after work. I'll ask it then. Are you aware of  
4 them hanging out socially after work?
- 5 A **No, sir.**
- 6 Q You're not?
- 7 A **Well, they're--hearsay of different--a couple different**  
8 **stories. But it's just--**
- 9 Q Okay. Well, hearsay is definitely admissible here as much  
10 as I hate it.
- 11 A **I mean, I heard from Ryan Bower about how Chris**  
12 **Golnick--or Lieutenant Colonel Golnick took them out to a**  
13 **strip club when they were on--at a conference I've--but**  
14 **I--I can't verify any of that.**
- 15 Q So you don't know that for a fact? That was just--
- 16 A **No, sir. It was--**
- 17 Q --shop talk?
- 18 A **--just stories, yes.**
- 19 Q So it could--it might not be a true story?
- 20 A **It might not be.**
- 21 Q What about--what about hanging out at the Two Track Bar?
- 22 A **The Two Track?**
- 23 Q Uh-huh. No?
- 24 A **I don't frequent that, sir.**
- 25 Q Not you, just--

1    **A**    **No but--**

2    **Q**    --heard stories about it? Okay. Did you ever hear anything  
3           about Colonel Golnick assisting Sergeant Reed's mother  
4           with staining a deck at her property?

5    **A**    **I do remember hearing something about a deck, but I don't**  
6           **know whose it was.**

7    **Q**    Okay. So you didn't know--you don't know whether it was  
8           Sergeant Reed or not?

9    **A**    **I don't know whether it was hers or her mother's or--**

10   **Q**    You also said that one of the things that you found--I  
11           don't want to mis-portray this. But maybe if I remember  
12           correctly, you mentioned that no other person received  
13           that much attention. You said that she was good at her  
14           job.

15   **A**    **Yeah.**

16   **Q**    You thought that Golnick was her supervisor, that their  
17           relationship was brotherly-sisterly?

18   **A**    **Like the fraternization thing. You know, it's--it's more**  
19           **friendly than a working relationship.**

20   **Q**    Well, fraternization is a very specific term, and it's  
21           defined in the reg, so I want to stay away from that word.  
22           Because fraternization and being brotherly-sisterly is not  
23           the same thing. So when you say brother-sisterly--

24   **A**    **Still more than a professional relationship, sir.**

25   **Q**    Okay. Fine. Fair enough. And you said that you could hear

1           conversations through the walls?

2   **A       Well, when I'm in the hallways, yes.**

3   Q       Again, was it--it was not work related, the--

4   **A       It didn't appear to be, sir.**

5   Q       --conversations they were having? It didn't appear to be,  
6           but could it have been even if they were just joking about  
7           it?

8   **A       Slight chance.**

9   Q       Okay. So you don't know exactly what the topic of their  
10           conversation was?

11  **A       I did not keep a log of it, sir.**

12  Q       Well, you're just assuming that they were not work-related  
13           because they were--they were kind of laughing about  
14           things?

15  **A       That'd be a fair statement, sir.**

16  Q       Okay. Good. You said that when you would walk in the  
17           office, when you had occasion to walk in the office, that  
18           three out of four times that the conversations were--or  
19           the situation was not work-related. You also said that you  
20           were uncomfortable because of the vibe. But did that  
21           prevent you specifically from doing your job? And the  
22           reason I ask is because we've already established that  
23           Sergeant Reed is a really good employee. So regardless of  
24           what the conversations were going on between her and  
25           Colonel Golnick, according to you and everybody else that

1 has testified so far, she was still getting her job done.  
2 So were you being prevented in any way from getting your  
3 job done?

4 **A Not in the end, sir.**

5 Q Not in the end?

6 **A No, sir.**

7 Q What does that mean, not in the end?

8 **A Well, it's like when you--there was one occasion**  
9 **especially here even after the investigation started. Ryan**  
10 **Bower and I had went out to get some parts from the parts**  
11 **building. And we came back in and we had to do something.**  
12 **And Chris Golnick--or I'm sorry--Lieutenant Colonel**  
13 **Golnick came out of a room. He was all red-faced, had been**  
14 **laughing, and she was kind of like monkeying with her**  
15 **shirt. It's just very awkward. In the end, yes, I did**  
16 **complete my mission. But getting the rest of the stuff**  
17 **done so I could continue on my way, it didn't expedite the**  
18 **process by no means.**

19 Q Now, were you ever aware--so I guess the short answer is  
20 that even with this going on, you still were getting your  
21 job done?

22 **A I was, sir.**

23 Q And were you aware of anybody else that was not--that was  
24 not able to get their job done because of this alleged  
25 inappropriate relationship? Anybody else at the MATES?

1    **A       I guess I'm not following the full line here.**

2    Q       You got--we'll just stick with you. You got--you were able  
3       to get your job done in spite of these challenges that  
4       you're alleging?

5    **A       Yes.**

6    Q       And you're not aware of anybody else who was prevented  
7       from doing their job because of these--these goings on?

8    **A       We were all--I'm sure everybody overcame that issue, yes,  
9       sir.**

10   Q       So while Colonel Golnick was in charge, even though he was  
11       spending a large amount of time in Sergeant Reed's office,  
12       did the MATES at any point in time that you're aware of,  
13       whether it was you or just collectively, ever not  
14       accomplish their mission?

15   **A       We--I've already stated we accomplished our mission, yes.  
16       We got our time off awards--team-based time off awards.**

17   Q       So you passed your inspections? You were able to service  
18       your customers?

19   **A       Oh, please don't--please don't ask--don't mention an  
20       inspection, sir, but yes, we did please our customers.**

21   Q       Well, that's a very important piece. Because if I was to  
22       come to you, not knowing anything that's going on, and you  
23       were to tell me that they MATES was not functioning at 100  
24       percent, I would--being in the military, I would be like,  
25       "Well, have you failed an inspection." And then I would



1           assume that you would be able to point me to--to say,  
2           "Yeah, we failed a CLRT back in 2007." So can you point me  
3           in any one direction where you can show me that the MATES  
4           was not fulfilling their mission?

5   **A       We passed inspections, sir, on sometimes shady grounds;**  
6           **i.e., we got rid of a lot of equipment that went--that was**  
7           **put into the dumpsters. So, yes, in the end we did pass,**  
8           **but I can't say we all passed on legitimate grounds.**

9   Q       And those allegations were included in the anonymous  
10          letter; correct?

11  **A       I don't know. I didn't see the anonymous letter, sir.**

12  Q       Okay. You also mentioned something about them eating  
13          together in her office, the lunch, breakfast, and the shop  
14          joke was that "There they go again." Did they ever eat  
15          lunch anywhere but her office?

16  **A       I can't answer that with surety, sir.**

17  Q       Was the door ever closed?

18  **A       The door was open.**

19  Q       The door was always open? What about when they were doing  
20          PT?

21  **A       It was--the door was closed.**

22  Q       The door was closed. But that door normally closed?

23  **A       Normally closed, yes, sir.**

24  Q       Did you have--now I know you testified that you never  
25          worked out with Colonel Golnick or with her, but were you

1 ever in the workout room at the same time that they were?

2 **A Yes, on several occasions.**

3 Q Okay. But you didn't feel uncomfortable enough at that  
4 time to leave?

5 **A I left usually early because of the uncomfortableness,**  
6 **yes, sir.**

7 Q Okay. But did you--you did work out together--well, in the  
8 same space? You all were in the same area?

9 **A In the same area.**

10 Q I don't mean together like, you know, you all were helping  
11 each other. Concerning the NTV use, you say--and this is  
12 what I find interesting, because you don't necessarily say  
13 that her use of NTVs was not within the regulations. What  
14 you said was that the reason that you--you were not  
15 comfortable with her using NTVs was because others were  
16 denied the same opportunity?

17 **A Correct.**

18 Q Okay.

19 **A It'd be preferential treatment.**

20 Q So was it more that some were denied or was it more that  
21 it was inappropriate?

22 **A Both.**

23 Q Well, you mentioned something about the 1071st in Jackson,  
24 that you'd seen her down there one time with an NTV; is  
25 that correct?

1    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

2    **Q**    And did you--did you believe at that time that the use of  
3           the NTV at the Jackson Armory at that time was  
4           inappropriate?

5    **A**    **Yes.**

6    **Q**    For what reason?

7    **A**    **For the same reason you--when you're an NCO, you don't**  
8           **expect--you don't get--I keep losing that verbiage now. I**  
9           **had it. I wish I had my NCO Creed in front of me. It'd**  
10          **jingle my bell. Anyways, can you repeat the question now?**

11   **Q**    I'll rephrase. Why did you feel that her use--when you saw  
12          her down at the Jackson Armory with an NTV, why did you  
13          feel that it was not appropriate?

14   **A**    **As soldiers, we shouldn't be using vehicle usage to bypass**  
15          **using our own gas money essentially.**

16   **Q**    If I could direct your attention, ma'am, here to this  
17          exhibit, which is the reply that we furnished the Agency  
18          as an answer to the charges that were brought against  
19          Sergeant Reed, okay, the reason that she was  
20          terminated--she was given a letter telling her that she  
21          was terminated. And we provided a reply to those charges.  
22          All right? And the charges that were levied against her  
23          were largely based on the findings in the 15-6. Okay? And  
24          it's interesting that you mentioned the Jackson Armory  
25          because I have a statement here that I want you to read

1 from Captain, at the time, now Major Jeremy Ruby. If you  
2 could, just read his sworn statement that he provided in  
3 support of Mrs. Reed's answer.

4 **A Okay. So I read it.**

5 Q Okay. Good. Having read that--and I'll just--I'll just  
6 direct you to the last paragraph. And I'll just, you know,  
7 go over it real quick:

8 "During IDT weekends, I only witnessed Master  
9 Sergeant Reed using an NTV at the Jackson Armory  
10 once. The reason for the use was to transport a  
11 large amount of parts back to MATES after drill  
12 weekend. The parts that needed to be transported  
13 were excess shop supplies, parts that she received  
14 from FMS4."

15 Having read that statement--and I don't want to assume,  
16 but it's coincidental that Captain Ruby--or Major Ruby  
17 recalls seeing Ms. Reed with an NTV at the Jackson Armory  
18 one time, just as you've said you've seen her at the  
19 Jackson Armory at least once with an NTV. And he--and he--

20 **A But that doesn't mean they're the same incident, sir.**

21 Q Okay. But what I'm saying is is it a possibility that the  
22 reason that she was driving the NTV to the Jackson Armory,  
23 whether it was this time that Major Ruby, you know,  
24 testifies to, or whether it was whenever you testified  
25 that you've seen her--do you recall when that date was?

1    **A**       **I don't remember the date, sir, no.**

2    **Q**       Is it possible after having read this statement, that she  
3           had an official reason to have an NTV down there?

4    **A**       **On that particular weekend, sure.**

5    **Q**       On the weekend that you saw her, no? No possibility that  
6           it was official?

7    **A**       **Slight, I guess.**

8    **Q**       Do you know what she actually doing down there?

9    **A**       **The same as I was. We were at our drill weekend, sir.**

10   **Q**       Okay. Is FMS4 near the Jackson Armory?

11   **A**       **FMS4? Is that Wyoming?**

12                           CAPTAIN BEDELLES: I don't know.

13                           THE WITNESS: I'm not sure. I get my numbers  
14           all mixed up. There's Selfridge. There's Wyoming.  
15           There's--

16   BY MR. BANCHS:

17   **Q**       Is there an FMS near the Jackson Armory? There's numerous  
18           FMSs throughout the state; right?

19   **A**       **There is, sir, and I don't know which numbers go to which**  
20           **ones.**

21   **Q**       And in my experience, FMSs are usually co-located with an  
22           armory or near an armory.

23   **A**       **Sure.**

24   **Q**       And it's very possible--and we can verify this later on.  
25           But it's very possible--because I don't even know where

1 FMS4 is. But it's very possible that FMS4 is near the  
2 Jackson Armory?

3 **A It could be possible, sir.**

4 Q Could it be that she had an NTV the day you saw her or the  
5 drill that you saw her for the same reasons that Captain  
6 Ruby provided testimony here?

7 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I think she's asked and  
8 answered this twice now but--

9 BY MR. BANCHS:

10 Q I don't think so. She's dodging the question. Is it  
11 possible that when you saw her she had an official reason  
12 to have an NTV?

13 **A And I've already said slight possibility, yes, sir.**

14 Q Okay. Concerning the use of NTV, you--you said on at least  
15 two occasions here during your testimony that the use  
16 might be appropriate but not--but it--it could be  
17 appropriate but impermissible?

18 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: "Authorized" I think she--I  
19 think she said--she testified that it could authorized.

20 MR. BANCHS: But not permissible.

21 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Authorized by Lieutenant  
22 Colonel Golnick is what she testified to but shouldn't  
23 have been permissible. So it's what she testified to.

24 BY MR. BANCHS:

25 Q Okay. And then you elaborated and you said that higher

1 ranking NCOs--and I'm assuming officers--should not use  
2 NTVs to save gas money because lower ranking individuals  
3 could not use NTVs to save gas. Do you recall saying that?

4 **A I do.**

5 Q So I mean, it's--and I don't want to quote the regs, but  
6 there are--there's an Army Reg and there's a State SOP. Is  
7 there anywhere in the SOP that allows you, either lower or  
8 ranking individuals, to use NTVs just for the purposes of  
9 saving gas money--personal gas money?

10 **A No, sir.**

11 Q So why would you have an issue--why would it be okay for a  
12 lower ranking individual to use an NTV just to save  
13 personal gas money?

14 **A There's--there's no reason for any soldier to use an NTV  
15 just to save their personal gas money.**

16 Q Okay. But you made the statement. I just--I'm trying to  
17 clarify it.

18 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: And I think she's clarified  
19 it. That's the statement she just made.

20 BY MR. BANCHS:

21 Q Do you know for a fact that Sergeant Reed, when she was  
22 using the NTVs, she was using it just to save gas money?

23 **A The--not personal knowledge, no, sir. But there's hallway  
24 talk about it quite bit, yes.**

25 Q Hallway talk? So would you lend more credibility to the

1 hallway talk or this statement from Major Ruby that she  
2 had an official reason for using an NTV?

3 **A Well, Major Ruby can only attest to the time in Jackson,**  
4 **but that doesn't say anything about the times she had it**  
5 **up in the Grayling area on drill weekends for up there**  
6 **with Sergeant First Class Couterier. So, I mean, I can't**  
7 **just go on one instance from Major Ruby when there was**  
8 **more instances where she actually had the NTV.**

9 Q Are you--are you assuming that she was misusing the NTV  
10 when you saw her in Grayling? Or do you know for a fact  
11 she was misusing it?

12 **A Not factual. I don't know without a doubt.**

13 Q Is it just the hallway chitchat again?

14 **A It's--it goes back to the preferential treatment.**

15 Q Alleged preferential treatment. You say that--you say that  
16 you saw Colonel Golnick and Sergeant Reed walking around  
17 the MATES facility; correct?

18 **A Correct.**

19 Q And that that's not proper?

20 **A No, it's not.**

21 Q Just--were they holding hands?

22 **A No, sir.**

23 Q So is Colonel Golnick not allowed to walk around--let me  
24 rephrase this. Is the only person that Colonel Golnick  
25 walks around the MATES facility or used to walk around the



1 MATES facility was just Sergeant Reed?

2 **A Out in the big parking lots like that?**

3 Q Uh-huh.

4 **A She's the only one I saw.**

5 Q And how many times did you happen to see this?

6 **A Several different times, sir.**

7 Q About how many? Because you've been working there how many  
8 years?

9 **A Going on 25 years, sir.**

10 Q Okay. So in your 25 years, how many times did you see  
11 Colonel Golnick and Sergeant Reed walking around the  
12 facility?

13 **A Say a handful of times.**

14 Q Five times?

15 **A Five to ten.**

16 Q And how many times have you seen Colonel Golnick walking  
17 with anyone else other than Sergeant Reed?

18 **A Out in them same areas? Never.**

19 Q Never? Okay. You say that--real quick just to touch on  
20 that, and this is the last question I'll ask. But you said  
21 that it was not proper. By whose standard is it not  
22 proper?

23 **A Just general military standard.**

24 HEARING EXAMINER: Is what not proper?

25 BY MR. BANCHS:

1 Q Her walking around with Colonel Golnick.

2 **A The perception that it leads to, especially when there's**  
3 **lower enlisted involved, yes, it's not proper. I mean,**  
4 **anymore unfortunately in the military, perceptions make a**  
5 **huge statement.**

6 Q But just to be clear, she was still getting her job done;  
7 correct?

8 **A Yes.**

9 Q Okay. You stated that Master Sergeant Reed harassed you  
10 after you filed your EEO complaint. Can you explain to me  
11 the connection?

12 **A I cannot, sir. It just seemed uncanny the timeliness of**  
13 **it.**

14 Q Did you make allegations against Sergeant Reed in your EEO  
15 complaint?

16 **A No, sir.**

17 Q Okay. So why would she have occasion to, I guess,  
18 retaliate against you for you filing your EEO complaint?

19 **A That was her friend, sir.**

20 Q So just because she was loyal to Colonel Golnick?

21 **A That's what I got out of it, sir.**

22 Q You testified that Ms. Reed benefited from her  
23 relationship. One of the ways that you--that she benefited  
24 was because she would--she would take leave slips directly  
25 to Colonel Golnick, surpassing her first-line supervisor?

1    **A**     **Yes, sir.**

2    Q     But you had also testified that you really weren't sure  
3           who her first-line supervisor was. So how did you know--

4    **A**     **Not in rotating times, no, sir.**

5    Q     Okay. So when did you--

6    **A**     **But there was times when all the supervisors were there,  
7           and she still made a direct beeline right to his office.**

8    Q     But you testified unequivocally that you were not aware  
9           that Colonel Golnick was not her first-line supervisor. So  
10          how do you know that she was jumping chain?

11   **A**     **I guess it's a moot point, sir.**

12   Q     Did you know or not know?

13   **A**     **Not 100 percent, no, I did not know.**

14   Q     Okay. That's what I was looking for. Almost finished. In  
15          addition to--and I just want to touch on this GSA because  
16          I just want to make sure that--in addition to Major Ruby's  
17          statement--and I'll let you read these in a second. And  
18          you can flip through if you like, yeah. We have a  
19          statement from Casey Ellis. And if you'd like to read--let  
20          me just call the names out. We have Casey Ellis. We have  
21          Major Ruby. We have Sergeant Hoag. Am I pronouncing it  
22          correctly?

23                                MRS. REED: Hoag (pronouncing).

24   BY MR. BANCHS:

25   Q     Hoag and Colonel Perricane, who provided sworn statements

1           concerning either Ms. Reed driving NTVs to either IDT or  
2           AT for official reasons or witnessing Sergeant Reed drive  
3           her own POV to attend those same IDT periods. If you'd  
4           like, you can read all of them.

5   **A       I don't really need to read them all, sir.**

6   Q       Okay. And the question that I have is--I guess if you  
7           don't want to read them, you're going to have to take my  
8           word for it, that they--

9   **A       Well, I don't know which one you're talking about right  
10           now in particular, because I can look at them and--like  
11           this one is from Master Sergeant Hoag. It just says,  
12           "While attending IDT drill weekends at the Jackson  
13           Readiness Center, I have observed Master Sergeant Reed get  
14           in and out of her POV that she drives to and from IDT  
15           weekends." That doesn't--by omission it doesn't say  
16           anything, whether he did or did not observe an NTV down  
17           there.**

18  Q       Well, the--but the allegations have been made that  
19           Sergeant Reed drove an NTV to drill every weekend.

20  **A       I don't know about every weekend. I know I only saw it  
21           once.**

22  Q       Okay. Now, Colonel Perricane's, which is the next  
23           one--Colonel Perricane talks about annual training at Camp  
24           Grayling in 2012. And this could be one you might want to  
25           read. So, ma'am, is it--there is the possibility that

1           whether you saw her use NTVs or whether you heard that she  
2           was using NTVs, albeit some people make allegations that  
3           she was using them improperly, after having read these  
4           statements, is there a possibility that she did have  
5           official reasons for using those NTVs?

6   **A       Possibly.**

7   Q       Okay. I'll close with this. You along with others have  
8           testified that Sergeant Reed was an excellent PC. Would  
9           that be taking it too far, that she did her--she was good  
10          at what she did?

11  **A       Oh, she was very good at her job.**

12  Q       Do you think she should have been fired?

13  **A       That's not a role that I'm involved in, sir.**

14  Q       All right. Then I'll ask you a different way. If Sergeant  
15          Reed was to be reinstated, would you necessarily have an  
16          issue with that?

17  **A       I would be hesitant with saying I have no issues. But I  
18          can't see where--I don't know. I hadn't ever thought about  
19          it, sir.**

20                       MR. BANCHS:   Okay. Fair enough. I don't have  
21                       any questions at this time--nothing further.

22                       HEARING EXAMINER:   Captain Bedells?

23                       CAPTAIN BEDELLS:   Nothing further, sir.

24                       HEARING EXAMINER:   I'll remind you that you  
25                       remain under oath and that you are subject to recall to

1 this hearing until such time that it has been adjourned.  
2 Again, I will remind you not to discuss your testimony  
3 with anyone. And with that, you're free to go, and I thank  
4 you for your time.

5 THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

6 HEARING EXAMINER: And you can go for the--I  
7 mean, you don't need--you won't be recalled tonight.

8 THE WITNESS: Not tonight, sir?

9 HEARING EXAMINER: Right.

10 THE WITNESS: Okay. Very good. Thank you, sir.

11 HEARING EXAMINER: Thanks. We can go off the  
12 record.

13 (At 7:12 p.m., witness excused)

14 COURT REPORTER: We're going off the record.

15 The time is 7:12 p.m.

16 (Off the record)

17 HEARING EXAMINER: Back on the record, please.

18 COURT REPORTER: We're on the record. The time  
19 is now 7:23 p.m.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: Do you swear or affirm that  
21 the testimony you're about to give in this case is the  
22 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help  
23 you God?

24 MASTER SERGEANT COOPER: Yes, sir.

25 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised

1           that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
2           interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
3           testifying in this case.

4                           MASTER SERGEANT COOPER:

5                           HEARING EXAMINER: You may have a seat.  
6           Captain Bedells?

7                           CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

8                           MASTER SERGEANT THAD COOPER

9           (At 7:23 p.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

10   DIRECT EXAMINATION

11 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

12 Q       Master Sergeant, sir would you please state your full name  
13       for the record?

14 A       **Thad Clinton Cooper.**

15 Q       And, Master Sergeant Cooper, you testified last week in  
16       connection with this 15-6 that's in front of you; correct?

17 A       **Yes.**

18 Q       And your understanding was that had to deal with an  
19       administrative hearing with respect to determination of  
20       Master Sergeant Joe Smock; correct?

21 A       **Yes.**

22 Q       And do you understand that you're here today with respect  
23       to the same 15-6 investigation but as it pertains to the  
24       termination of Master Sergeant Renee Reed?

25 A       **Yes.**

1 Q Okay. Just to refresh my recollection, you are a--you are  
2 currently a QC inspector for MATES; is that correct?

3 A **No. I'm actually at FMS16 in the U.P., Ishpeming.**

4 Q Oh, that's right. I'm sorry. So prior to going to the  
5 Upper Peninsula, you were a QC inspector at MATES;  
6 correct?

7 A **Yes.**

8 Q And you had done that for about eight years?

9 A **Yes.**

10 Q And your first-line supervisor was Lieutenant Colonel  
11 McNamara; correct?

12 A **Yes.**

13 Q Okay. As you might surmise, the--one of the allegations  
14 concerning--that led to Master Sergeant Reed's termination  
15 was the relationship she had with Lieutenant Colonel  
16 Golnick. Are you familiar with that?

17 A **Yes, I am.**

18 Q We've heard a number of ways that this relationship's been  
19 described. And in your own words, can you tell the Hearing  
20 Examiner how you would describe the relationship that you  
21 viewed when you were down here at MATES between Lieutenant  
22 Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed?

23 A **Inappropriate.**

24 Q Okay. And you say "inappropriate" why?

25 A **The conversations that they had, the time they spent**



1           **together in the--in her office, the time she spent in her**  
2           **office, topics that they discussed.**

3    Q       Let's start with the conversations. Did you ever  
4           personally hear an inappropriate conversation between  
5           Master Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

6    A       **Yes.**

7    Q       Okay. Can you give us an example of what you deemed an  
8           inappropriate conversation between the two?

9    A       **Oh, anywhere from licking cookies to hanging bras and**  
10           **panties and--on vehicles and it just--there was kind of**  
11           **really no limit to the conversation.**

12   Q       This licking cookies, this sounds silly enough but--

13   A       **Yeah.**

14   Q       --I'm just curious. Did you hear that yourself? Or did you  
15           hear that through someone else?

16   A       **I'm pretty sure I heard it myself.**

17   Q       Okay. And the other comments that you just mentioned, did  
18           you hear those yourself as well?

19   A       **Yes, I believe I did.**

20   Q       Okay. Well, the way you categorize those conversations,  
21           you don't believe that there was a sexual relationship  
22           between Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant  
23           Reed, do you?

24   A       **No, I don't. I don't believe that, no.**

25   Q       Just inappropriate conversations; right?

1    **A**    **Correct.**

2    **Q**    Okay. You next said that the amount of time they spent  
3           together. Can you tell the hearing examiner, Master  
4           Sergeant Cooper, what you personally deemed as an  
5           inappropriate amount of time?

6    **A**    **Well, it just seemed that Colonel Golnick spent a lot of**  
7           **time in Renee's office. And when you were trying to find**  
8           **Colonel Golnick, to get a phone call for him or you had a**  
9           **question regards to the shop, he was often found in her**  
10          **office. So it almost--it almost became a running joke in**  
11          **the shop that, "Did you check his other office?" after you**  
12          **looked in the front office where his--you know, his home**  
13          **base was.**

14   **Q**    His other office meaning Master Sergeant Reed's office?

15   **A**    **Right.**

16   **Q**    Is that fair?

17   **A**    **"Look in the other office," right.**

18   **Q**    Okay. Now, was this conclusion that it was an  
19          inappropriate amount of time that these two spent together  
20          based on your personal observation or what you heard from  
21          others or a combination of both?

22   **A**    **Personal observation and the majority of the shop.**

23   **Q**    Okay. Explain to the Hearing Examiner, because what we're  
24          trying to establish is how is it that you had an  
25          opportunity to view how much time Master Sergeant--or how

1 much time Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant  
2 Reed spent together in her office.

3 **A Well, actually Renee and I would work on different**  
4 **projects together. I would ask her for help. She would ask**  
5 **me for help. And we exchanged data and worked nearly every**  
6 **day. I mean, there was inter-exchange between us so--**

7 **Q So while you were a QC inspector and she was a production**  
8 **controller--**

9 **A Right.**

10 **Q --there was daily interaction between the two of you?**

11 **A Absolutely, yes.**

12 **Q On more than one issue or just a single issue a day or--**

13 **A It just--I mean, it was--it varied from day to day. But I**  
14 **mean, there's supply parts. They're--you know, they're**  
15 **trying to find where the parts are, to, "Are they going to**  
16 **come in?" "Are they available?" I mean, we worked**  
17 **basically, you know, hand in hand almost so a lot of--**

18 **Q Did you have the need to actually go in to her office?**

19 **A Absolutely.**

20 **Q Why?**

21 **A Well, job orders, again looking up parts, trying to find**  
22 **parts, availability of parts.**

23 **Q How often would you have to go into her office on a**  
24 **typical day?**

25 **A It varied. I mean, some days it'd be maybe two or three.**

1           **Other days it might be ten.**

2    Q       And on occasion did you find--when you went into her  
3           office, did you find Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in there?

4    A       **Yes.**

5    Q       Okay. If you went in there--you said maybe once or twice,  
6           as much as ten times. Let's go the middle. Let's  
7           say--let's say you had reason to go into Lieutenant--or  
8           you had to go into Master Sergeant Reed's office on five  
9           occasions in a particular day. How many times would you  
10          establish you'd find Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in there?

11   A       **Fifty percent of the time or better.**

12   Q       He'd be seated in there?

13   A       **Sometimes seated, sometimes standing.**

14   Q       Well, is there--I understood--I understood that he--his  
15          title was shop superintendent. Correct?

16   A       **Yes.**

17   Q       And she was a production controller; correct?

18   A       **Yes.**

19   Q       Well, and how long did you work at MATES before going to  
20          the U.P.?

21   A       **Twenty-two years.**

22   Q       Okay, 22 years. In your experience, in the 22 years you  
23          spent there, is there a reason that the shop  
24          superintendent would be in a particular production  
25          controller's office this--the amount of time that you

1           witnessed him in there?

2   **A**    **No. I mean, there's a need for them to interact obviously,**  
3           **because her job, that job. There's a need to exchange**  
4           **information and reports and what have you, but just the**  
5           **amount of time wasn't--wasn't necessary.**

6   Q       Did you ever observe the two of them eating in her office?

7   **A**    **Yes.**

8   Q       Okay. Did you ever observe them eating breakfast in her  
9           office?

10 **A**    **Yes.**

11 Q       And that would be--let me characterize it because we  
12           talked about breakfast. But did you ever see Master  
13           Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick eating at the  
14           first break, eating--

15 **A**    **Yes.**

16 Q       --breakfast, whatever it is, the 9:00 o'clock break?

17 **A**    **Sure, yes.**

18 Q       Did you ever observe Lieutenant Colonel Golnick eating  
19           lunch in Master Sergeant Reed's office?

20 **A**    **Yes. They're both very healthy people. So when Renee got**  
21           **the juicer, they drank this green concoction of whatever**  
22           **it's called. I don't know what it is but, I mean, they**  
23           **would drink it together.**

24 Q       Okay. Well, as you sit here today, did--is it your  
25           testimony that they drank this concoction or ate lunch--

1    **A**    Well, they--  
2    Q    --every day together?  
3    **A**    I think they spent many, many days eating lunch together,  
4    if not every day, nearly every day.  
5    Q    Nearly every day eating lunch together?  
6    **A**    Yes.  
7    Q    How about breakfast? Did you have the same observation?  
8    **A**    I'd say about the same.  
9    Q    Okay. How many times--how many hours a day would you  
10   establish Lieutenant Colonel Golnick was in Master  
11   Sergeant Reed's office?  
12   **A**    I think I wrote in my statement about four or five, and I  
13   think that's probably pretty accurate.  
14   Q    You stand by that?  
15   **A**    Yes.  
16   Q    And on what basis would you--can you conclude four to five  
17   hours a day? I mean, clearly you weren't following  
18   Lieutenant Colonel Golnick around.  
19   **A**    No. But if there was a need--I'd be in the vault, I'd have  
20   to go down and talk to Joe Smock or walk by the office and  
21   here he is. Or I'd go down to the--I'd try to go down and  
22   talk to Renee, and she'd be hung up in there with Colonel  
23   Golnick, so I'd leave and then I'd come back, and he's  
24   still there. So I'd just--I'd say four or five hours is  
25   pretty accurate.

1 Q So when you say that you have to--you'd want to talk to  
2 Renee, you mean Master Sergeant Reed; correct?

3 A **Right, right.**

4 Q And he'd be in there, and you'd walk away? Is that your  
5 testimony?

6 A **I mean, at times--there was times that I'd stand there and  
7 wait for them to finish the conversation. And they'd--and  
8 they'd wouldn't, so I just got frustrated and left. And so  
9 I'll just come back later so--**

10 Q So is it fair to say it had an impact on at least the work  
11 you had to get done?

12 A **At times, absolutely.**

13 Q Now, I want to tell you something, Master Sergeant Reed  
14 Cooper, with respect to the work that Master Sergeant Reed  
15 had to get done, testimony from every witness has been she  
16 is an exceptional production controller.

17 A **Absolutely. Best in the state.**

18 Q Okay. But again it interfered with your work, not hers?  
19 She managed to get her work done?

20 A **Oh, it'd interfere with her work too.**

21 Q How so?

22 A **Well, she was distracted.**

23 Q Did she ever--did she ever say anything to you with  
24 respect to Lieutenant Colonel Golnick being in her office  
25 like, "Can you get the guy out of here" or any words to

1           that effect?

2   **A       No, I don't think so; no.**

3   **Q       Did you ever approach Master Sergeant Reed about--you've**  
4           **testified here that it was a problem. Did you ever tell**  
5           **her, "Hey, Renee, this is a problem"?**

6   **A       I think we talked a little bit about things and the**  
7           **relationship and the perceived relationship. And I just**  
8           **think her stance was, you know, he's nice to me, and**  
9           **that's how it's going to be so--**

10   **Q       Well, I mean, do you believe that she received, you know,**  
11           **special treatment from Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?**

12   **A       Well, you know, at times I think she did receive special**  
13           **treatment.**

14   **Q       How so?**

15   **A       She was brought in on comp time weekends to work. She was**  
16           **brought in on orders on weekends to work. She was--she was**  
17           **able to use his NTV Jeep to drive to drill so, I mean,**  
18           **there's--**

19   **Q       Did you personally observe her use Lieutenant Colonel**  
20           **Golnick's NTV to go drill?**

21   **A       Yes, absolutely.**

22   **Q       Where were you when you observed her use this NTV?**

23   **A       Well, there was many times when Renee had to drive to**  
24           **Jackson for drill for me to find her on a Friday**  
25           **night--she would leave at noon or 12:30 or whatever. And I**



1 always left for lunch, and I'd come back from lunch and I  
2 had seen them on countless occasions, you know, talking by  
3 his back office and there was--there was one particular  
4 time that the vehicle's running and the lights were on,  
5 and I went to open the door to shut it off, and I actually  
6 I seen Renee's purse on the front seat. So I of course  
7 closed it. But there were other times I had seen her leave  
8 at noonish or 12:30.

9 Q What was--what was--in this particular instance, what was  
10 the NTV that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick was assigned?

11 A It was a Jeep Patriot, his--I mean, he--he managed it. He  
12 controlled it. He held the logbook. He dispatched it on a  
13 monthly basis. Whenever he needed to go to camp, I mean,  
14 that was his vehicle.

15 Q And it's your testimony that you personally observed  
16 Master Sergeant Reed use this--use this NTV on more than  
17 one occasion to go to drill?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. Let me ask you, did you ever--were you ever afforded  
20 the opportunity to use Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's NTV to  
21 go to drill?

22 A No. But I drilled in Grayling so there was no need for me  
23 to use it.

24 Q Okay. How about lunch? Did you ever eat lunch with  
25 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

1    **A**     **Did I?**

2    Q     Yeah.

3    **A**     **No, negative.**

4    Q     Did you ever eat breakfast with Lieutenant Colonel  
5           Golnick?

6    **A**     **Never.**

7    Q     How about Master Sergeant Reed? Did you enjoy those  
8           smoothies with her or anything like that?

9    **A**     **No. I didn't really dig those smoothies too much. I'm not  
10           a grass guy, so I need more than grass to keep this figure  
11           so--**

12   Q     Did you ever observe Master Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant  
13           Colonel Golnick work out together?

14   **A**     **Yes, yes, absolutely.**

15   Q     Okay. Did you work out at the gym at MATES as well?

16   **A**     **I did, yes.**

17   Q     In your opinion, was it a pretty regular thing that these  
18           two worked out together?

19   **A**     **Yeah, absolutely; yeah. They were, you know, in good  
20           physical condition, and they worked out together.**

21   Q     Well, we've established that. They're good eaters, they're  
22           healthy people.

23   **A**     **Yeah, very healthy.**

24   Q     And very fit. Apparently she gets 290 on her PT test.  
25           She's incredibly fit.

1    **A**     **Right.**

2    **Q**     We've got that in the record.

3    **A**     **Yeah.**

4    **Q**     So how is it that you can say that you saw the two of them  
5           working out regularly?

6    **A**     **I would typically do PT at 3:30 in the afternoon. And**  
7           **many, many occasions I would walk in the PT room and**  
8           **that's--I mean, it's the only room that we have at our**  
9           **shop.**

10   **Q**     Right.

11   **A**     **And, you know, they would be in the room together so--**

12   **Q**     Working out?

13   **A**     **--I'd walk in--yeah. You know, sometimes they'd be running**  
14           **on the treadmill together or--not together but side by**  
15           **side or in the same--on the treadmill or ellipticals. At**  
16           **other times they were doing yoga and Jillian Michaels**  
17           **(phonetic) or whatever the aerobic stuff is so--**

18   **Q**     Okay. Now, one other person's testified that at least when  
19           she went in the workout--or the gym rather, that made her  
20           feel uncomfortable. I mean, did you feel uncomfortable in  
21           any respect, or did you just go in and do your thing and  
22           work out and--

23   **A**     **Well, actually at one occasion I was in stretching in**  
24           **this--the R3 room and Renee offered for me to join the**  
25           **yoga club for that day. And I declined. But shortly**

1           **thereafter actually Colonel Golnick had came in so I got**  
2           **out of there and did the treadmill thing so--or elliptical**  
3           **or whatever.**

4    Q       Okay. And there--are you familiar with that gym being  
5           designated the R3 room or something to that effect?

6    A       **Yes.**

7    Q       What is your understanding--and I didn't realize, but what  
8           is your understanding of the R3 room?

9    A       **It's the Renee Reed Room.**

10   Q       And do you know to your knowledge--I mean, is this  
11           something that's obvious for everyone to see who looks up?  
12           Okay. What would you--would everyone know that it's common  
13           knowledge that R3 means Renee Reed Room? Or could it mean  
14           something else?

15   A       **I don't know. I can't--I guess I can't answer for anyone**  
16           **else.**

17   Q       But that's what your understanding is?

18   A       **But I know what it stood for so--**

19   Q       Okay. Master Sergeant Cooper, there's also been testimony  
20           about a nickname that was designated to Master Sergeant  
21           Reed. Are you familiar with any nickname that was given to  
22           her?

23   A       **Yes.**

24   Q       What is your--how are you familiar with that?

25   A       **Well, the one specifically that I'm sure she was upset**

1           **about was the Princess one.**

2    Q       How do you know that she was upset about it?

3    A       **Because she had come to my boss--her boss actually,**  
4           **Colonel McNamara, and had complained about people in the**  
5           **shop calling her Princess. So we ceased.**

6    Q       Were you instructed to stop calling her Princess by  
7           Lieutenant Colonel McNamara?

8    A       **Yes, yes.**

9    Q       Did you call that name to her face?

10   A       **I think I may have on a couple occasions. I know Mr. Mack**  
11           **had.**

12   Q       Was it in gest you said it? Or was it--was it like  
13           "whatever, Princess"? I mean, in what context did you call  
14           her Princess?

15   A       **It was--it was joking. I really--in a joking way, I**  
16           **suppose. It wasn't--**

17   Q       But obviously she didn't take it as a joke?

18   A       **Well, I think she did for a while and then just became**  
19           **upset with it. I guess I don't know why, but I didn't**  
20           **think it was that big of a deal.**

21   Q       Okay. Now, you've testified, I believe, that you think  
22           that Master Sergeant Reed was receiving some form of  
23           preferential treatment. Am I correct you did testify that  
24           way?

25   A       **Sure.**

1 Q Well, did you? We're starting to--

2 A **Yeah.**

3 Q --blend together. It's late at night. We're on--

4 A **Yeah.**

5 Q --witness number ten.

6 A **Yes.**

7 Q I don't want to put words in your mouth.

8 MR. BANCHS: Why don't you let him read his  
9 statement? Objection. Can he read the statement? And then  
10 he can refresh his memory.

11 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLES:

12 Q No, no. Testified here today is what I meant. Have you  
13 testified here under oath today that--

14 A **Yes.**

15 Q --you believe Master Sergeant Reed received preferential  
16 treatment?

17 A **Yes, I said that earlier.**

18 Q Okay. Did you ever confront Lieutenant Colonel  
19 McNamara--strike that. Did you ever confront Lieutenant  
20 Colonel Golnick about your belief that that she was  
21 receiving preferential treatment?

22 A **Never.**

23 Q Why not?

24 A **You don't do that thing.**

25 Q Why not?

1    **A**       **He's the boss.**

2    Q        Okay. What about Lieutenant Colonel McNamara? Did you ever  
3            approach your first-line supervisor about--

4    **A**       **I think I complained to Colonel McNamara on multiple**  
5            **occasions about, you know, the comp time. I was in the QC**  
6            **office and being the QC office, we were responsible for**  
7            **issuing vehicles, log books, keys, managing that whole**  
8            **type of function. And because of the relationship with**  
9            **Colonel Golnick and Colonel McNamara was so toxic, that**  
10           **responsibility was taken away from the QC office. And the**  
11           **production controllers, Renee, Colonel Golnick, others**  
12           **absorbed that from our section.**

13   Q        And finally, how about Master Sergeant Reed? Did you ever  
14            confront her about what you perceived to be benefits or  
15            preferential treatment being bestowed upon her?

16   **A**       **No, I don't think so.**

17   Q        Master Sergeant Cooper, was it you who provided an account  
18            in your sworn statement about an incident involving Jim  
19            Teeple?

20   **A**       **Yes.**

21   Q        Was that you?

22   **A**       **Yes.**

23   Q        Can you tell the Hearing Examiner--explain to the Hearing  
24            Examiner what that--why you elected to put that in  
25            your--in your sworn statement.

1     A     Well, I had heard from Master Sergeant Fouts that Jim  
2           Teeples had witnessed Colonel Golnick and Renee parked  
3           alongside a road near his residence. We were--when we were  
4           questioned, Colonel Doolittle asked did we know or have we  
5           heard. So I had heard it, and I repeated it, and, you  
6           know, if it wasn't true then the investigator would  
7           obviously find that out. So I wrote this, the whole  
8           statement, how he had seen them parked alongside the road  
9           and had stopped and talked to Colonel Golnick and seen  
10          Renee in the vehicle and--once he went by. And then on  
11          April 22nd, I received a visitor at the MATES. It was Jim  
12          Teeples. And he was with Jeff Wiggins (phonetic) from camp,  
13          another Camp Grayling employee. And they came in the  
14          office and said, "I need to talk to you." I said, "Okay."  
15          So inside the QC office there's another office which is  
16          Colonel McNamara's office, and he started to go in with  
17          Jeff Wiggins. And I said, "Wait a minute. If you're going  
18          to have representation in the office, then I'm going to  
19          have someone too." So Mr. Mack was nearby, and I asked  
20          him, "Hey, can you come in here for a minute and just  
21          witness what's taking place here?"

22                         MR. BANCHS: Can I object to this, because  
23                         this is definitely not in evidence. And now he's  
24                         implicating a whole other witness to the Teeples  
25                         conversation.



1                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Well, I think he testified  
2                   that this reference to Jim Teeple is actually in his sworn  
3                   statement.

4                   MR. BANCHS: It is, but this is much more  
5                   elaborate than what's in there right now.

6                   THE WITNESS: Because it happened after I made  
7                   the statement.

8                   MR. BANCHS: Well, then that's--

9                   HEARING EXAMINER: April of this year?

10                  THE WITNESS: April 22nd of this year.

11                  MR. BANCHS: Well, then that's not admissible.

12                  HEARING EXAMINER: Well, is it related to--is  
13                  it related to--

14                  THE WITNESS: It is absolutely related, sir,  
15                  yes.

16                  CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I can--sir, I can first  
17                  establish--what I really was getting at was what did Jim  
18                  Teeple tell him. So I mean, that's the first question,  
19                  which is really what I was getting at. And I don't know  
20                  what this--where we're going with this April 22nd, but--

21                  HEARING EXAMINER: What did Jim Teeple tell  
22                  him when?

23 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

24 Q                What did Jim Teeple tell you that caused you to put in  
25                your sworn statement--

1   **A**     **Jim Teeple didn't tell me anything that I put in my**  
2           **statement.**

3                   HEARING EXAMINER:  He heard it from Fouts.

4                   THE WITNESS:  Fouts told me about what Teeple  
5           had witnessed, Colonel Golnick and Renee Reed parked  
6           alongside a road near his residence.

7  BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

8  Q       Okay.

9   **A**     **He come out--he found out about what I had wrote in my**  
10          **statement by I'm not sure who.**

11  Q       Okay. Hence you saying you want representation, so you  
12          threw me there. Okay. So you--

13  **A**     **Yeah. I just wanted somebody in the room with me to**  
14          **witness what was actually occurring and--**

15                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Okay. Well, I think Jim  
16          Teeple is going to be called tomorrow as a witness, so I'd  
17          be curious to hear what Jim Teeple--what Jim Teeple told  
18          my witness on April 22nd of this year. And then Jim Teeple  
19          can refute it tomorrow, I suppose, or corroborate it. I  
20          don't--I don't know which so--

21                   MR. BANCHS:  It's kind of putting--I mean,  
22          we're unable to defend any statement from Jim Teeple.

23                   HEARING EXAMINER:  Yeah, that's my concern  
24          is--

25                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Well, isn't the statement

1 in--so didn't Master Sergeant Fouts get the statement in  
2 as to what Jim Teeple said?

3 MR. BANCHS: It's the same thing that he's  
4 saying, but she (sic) just saw--she heard that Jim Teeple  
5 saw her--saw Golnick and Reed in a road.

6 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. And I presume that  
7 we're going to hear from Jim Teeple tomorrow. We can take  
8 him tomorrow as a rebuttal witness. It'll just prolong the  
9 process because I've got the right to call a rebuttal  
10 witness. So if Jim Teeple is going to come in and say,  
11 "Hey, this conversation never happened with Master  
12 Sergeant Fouts," then I'm going to call Master Sergeant  
13 Cooper as a rebuttal witness to say, "Hey, Jim Teeple says  
14 this conversation never happened." And then we need to get  
15 his account as to whether--

16 MR. BANCHS: Here's the thing, though. This  
17 conversation allegedly took--took place April 24 (sic) of  
18 this year, way after we submitted our reply. So we--you  
19 know, we're not even allowed to defend that. I mean, it  
20 doesn't matter what Jim Teeple did--said or not said. I  
21 mean, the Captain had made an issue before about the  
22 September 26 was the deadline to submit evidence. This is  
23 definitely new evidence. I mean, this isn't even expanding  
24 on what they had said before. This is a conversation that  
25 took place after the investigation finished.

1                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Well, okay. And Jim Teeple,  
2 I presume is going to come in tomorrow and say--

3                   MR. BANCHS: Well, no, I wouldn't presume  
4 anything.

5                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: --and say, "This  
6 conversation--I didn't say this." Hence, he's on your  
7 witness list. Sir, I think I've got a right to call a  
8 rebuttal witness to say hey, "On April 22nd Jim Teeple  
9 came in and said" whatever he said. We haven't heard it  
10 yet. So I can reserve it and call him tomorrow or we can  
11 press on tonight.

12                  HEARING EXAMINER: Here's--here's my interest.  
13 My interest is if whatever happened in April of this year  
14 is tied directly to what is--what was discovered in the  
15 investigation, on the one hand I'm interested in hearing  
16 it if it helps to further establish what happened. On the  
17 other hand, the Appellant hasn't--this is--the Appellant  
18 hasn't had a chance to respond up to this point.

19                  CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Well, he'll get a chance to  
20 cross-examine Master Sergeant Cooper on it, I suppose.

21                  MR. BANCHS: Well, if we--but if we--it's not  
22 Master Sergeant Cooper. Master Sergeant Cooper's statement  
23 is already in the record, and it is even--and, you know,  
24 we've been very lax, especially in the last case, with  
25 allowing new found testimony, whether it was because they

1 were jarred with their memory or whatever. But this is  
2 definitely like way beyond the--

3 HEARING EXAMINER: The only thing is, though,  
4 again I'm trying to figure out did this happen or not.  
5 Okay? If there's--if there's evidence that helps me  
6 determine that it happened--and I again appreciate the  
7 fact that you haven't had a chance to respond to that. But  
8 you will get a chance to cross-examine. I don't hear that  
9 there's any new--I'm not hearing that there's a new charge  
10 or there's new--my understanding is it's going to be  
11 information that further establishes what's already been  
12 captured in the 15-6.

13 MR. BANCHS: Okay. Well, I--

14 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I don't know that.

15 HEARING EXAMINER: No, I don't either. I don't  
16 either.

17 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I don't know what he's going  
18 to say, because I don't know about this April  
19 conversation. So I don't know.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: I would suggest  
21 we--Teeples on the witness list for tomorrow anyway?

22 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I believe he is. I believe  
23 he's the Appellant's--

24 HEARING EXAMINER: So let's hear what Teeple  
25 says tomorrow. And certainly you can reserve the right to

1 recall--

2 MR. BANCHS: How about this? What's in the  
3 record is that Master Sergeant Fouts alleges that she  
4 heard--

5 HEARING EXAMINER: Right.

6 MR. BANCHS: And he also alleges that he  
7 heard--

8 HEARING EXAMINER: From Fouts.

9 MR. BANCHS: --from Fouts that Tim Teeple saw  
10 Golnick and Reed at some road. I can't remember exactly  
11 what right--

12 HEARING EXAMINER: 15-6.

13 MR. BANCHS: Right?

14 HEARING EXAMINER: Yeah.

15 MR. BANCHS: And that's what he's going to  
16 testify to--

17 HEARING EXAMINER: Right.

18 MR. BANCHS: --whether he did see that or not.

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Jim Teeple?

20 MR. BANCHS: Teeple, yes.

21 HEARING EXAMINER: Right.

22 MR. BANCHS: Teeple, yes. I think he's the  
23 only Teeple that we're dealing with.

24 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: But you said "Tim" Teeple  
25 and I'm just making sure it's Jim Teeple.

1 MR. BANCHS: Well, I'll just stick with Tim.

2 CAPTAIN BEDELLES: Yeah.

3 HEARING EXAMINER: It's Jim.

4 MR. BANCHS: If Teeple testifies to anything  
5 other than that, then I don't have a problem in bringing  
6 him back.

7 CAPTAIN BEDELLES: No, that's not--that's  
8 not--I don't--I understand what your objection is, but if  
9 Jim Teeple testifies that this conversation never  
10 happened, and if I--"I never told Master Sergeant Fouts  
11 this" and Master Sergeant Cooper--I don't know what he's  
12 going to testify to, but my guess is he's going to testify  
13 to the effect that Jim Teeple came in with a buddy, "I  
14 called in Mack," and we had it out about what I"--you  
15 know, what he said. So it goes directly to whether Jim  
16 Teeple actually said this to Master Sergeant Fouts or not  
17 and specifically whether Master Sergeant Reed and  
18 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick were on some roadside. This  
19 really isn't a big part of the case, but I think it's  
20 important--

21 HEARING EXAMINER: Yeah, it is--it's kind of a  
22 small part, but I think it's important that we make sure  
23 we treat it properly. If there's a question tomorrow after  
24 Teeple testifies--if there's any question in my mind about  
25 the consistency of his testimony with what's already here,

1 I'd like to reserve the right to--

2 MR. BANCHS: Well, my only concern, sir, here  
3 is that what's in the record and what we responded to was  
4 his hearsay allegation that he heard from Sergeant Fouts  
5 that Tim Teeple--that she heard that Tim Teeple saw Reed  
6 and Golnick in some road. That's the only thing that's in  
7 the record.

8 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Well, tomorrow--

9 HEARING EXAMINER: Led me--let me ask this  
10 witness--would you look real quick at your testimony in  
11 the 15-6?

12 THE WITNESS: Yes.

13 HEARING EXAMINER: That sentence that refers  
14 to--I think it's just one sentence. Do you see the  
15 sentence that starts, "I have heard that Jim Teeple"--

16 THE WITNESS: Yes.

17 HEARING EXAMINER: Actually it's a couple  
18 sentences. "I've heard that Jim Teeple, a state employee  
19 at Camp Grayling, spotted Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
20 parked along the road near his residence. He had driven by  
21 once and had only seen Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in the  
22 vehicle. After leaving his residence and passing by on the  
23 return trip, he noticed both Master Sergeant Reed and  
24 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in the vehicle." Let me ask  
25 you, is that the end of your testimony regarding that--or



1 end of your statement regarding that particular incident?

2 THE WITNESS: Yes.

3 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Without getting into  
4 what happened in April of this year, is there any new  
5 information--if we assume just for a second that that  
6 happened, is there any new information that's different  
7 from what's here?

8 THE WITNESS: No, it's not different, sir.

9 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. So what I'll--here's  
10 what we'll do. Let's hear Teeple tomorrow. And if there's  
11 any question about his testimony, if it's inconsistent, we  
12 can consider--if we need additional information to  
13 establish one way or the other what the truth is, then we  
14 can--I would at that point consider--I'll talk to both you  
15 guys about it before I do that though. But for now let's  
16 just leave--let's leave that until we talk to Teeple  
17 tomorrow.

18 MR. BANCHS: Okay.

19 HEARING EXAMINER: Is that okay?

20 MR. BANCHS: That'll work absolutely.

21 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Well, in light of that, I  
22 don't have any further questions. Thanks, Master Sergeant  
23 Cooper. Now Mr. Banchs is going to have some questions on  
24 cross-examination, and I'm sure you'll tell him he's going  
25 to have to stand by tomorrow. Correct?

1 HEARING EXAMINER: Yes.

2 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: This witness is one we're  
3 going to have to hold back. Okay.

4 CROSS-EXAMINATION

5 BY MR. BANCHS:

6 Q Sergeant Cooper, when you started your questioning, you  
7 indicated that you felt that the relationship between  
8 Colonel Golnick and Sergeant Reed was inappropriate. And  
9 part of your assertion of that is because they were having  
10 inappropriate conversations. But you said that they were  
11 not of a sexual nature and there was never any sexual  
12 relationship implied?

13 A I never said that they had a sexual relationship.

14 Q Okay. So--and were the conversations of a sexual nature?

15 A At times they were.

16 Q And other than licking cookies and bras and panties, can  
17 you elaborate?

18 A No.

19 Q So they're just inappropriate because you felt they were  
20 inappropriate?

21 A Yes.

22 Q You said that it seemed that Colonel Golnick spent a lot  
23 of time in her office. You also said that you had  
24 occasion--or you had daily interactions with Sergeant  
25 Reed?

1    **A**    **Yes.**

2    Q    How many interactions per day would you say that you had  
3       with Sergeant Reed?

4    **A**    **I've already told you it varied from day to day. Sometimes**  
5       **it'd be two or three. Sometimes it'd be ten.**

6    Q    Okay. Were they mostly in the morning, in the evening?

7    **A**    **There was no set schedule.**

8    Q    Throughout the day?

9    **A**    **Sure.**

10   Q    And the reason I'm asking is because you said that Golnick  
11       was in her office about 50 percent of the time or better.

12   **A**    **Sure.**

13   Q    But you said there was no need for her to interact with  
14       him that much or for him to interact with her that much?

15   **A**    **That's correct.**

16   Q    So he's the facility superintendent, and she's the  
17       production controller, and he has no business talking to  
18       the production controller?

19   **A**    **I never said that.**

20   Q    Okay. There would be a work-related reason for Colonel  
21       Golnick to be--

22   **A**    **Sure.**

23   Q    --in the production--and what would that work-related  
24       reason be--or what the work-related reasons be?

25   **A**    **If he wanted her to run a report or had a question about**

1           **shop stock or the inventories or whatever, it'd be--there**  
2           **would be a need for him to be there.**

3    Q       But is it--is it your opinion that that's the only types  
4           of conversations that they should be having?

5    A       **No.**

6    Q       So if--if in the process of asking for a report on  
7           production, they happen to, you know, tell a joke about  
8           licking cookies or bras or something, would that  
9           necessarily make it an inappropriate relationship?

10   A       **It'd be an inappropriate conversation.**

11   Q       Because?

12   A       **He's a superintendent.**

13   Q       Okay. You say that you work in the same office as Colonel  
14           McNamara?

15   A       **Yes.**

16   Q       For how long?

17   A       **I've worked in there since '06. I'm not sure when Colonel**  
18           **McNamara was actually hired for that position.**

19   Q       And you're a Master Sergeant; correct? And so is Sergeant  
20           Reed?

21   A       **Yeah.**

22   Q       And Colonel McNamara's a Lieutenant Colonel and so was  
23           Colonel Golnick?

24   A       **Yes.**

25   Q       And in the time that you spent with Lieutenant Colonel

1           McNamara in the same office, did you guys ever have  
2           conversations that went outside the scope of work?

3    **A       Absolutely.**

4    Q       And can you elaborate on some of those conversations?

5    **A       No.**

6    Q       Maybe--you know, maybe about social events, maybe about  
7           football?

8    **A       Sure.**

9    Q       You know, it's a bunch of guys in there, so, you know,  
10           maybe some conversations might have turned, you know, a  
11           little bit inappropriate along a sexual nature, talking  
12           about women or anything like that?

13   **A       Sure.**

14   Q       So what makes her--what makes your relationship with  
15           Colonel McNamara appropriate versus Colonel--

16   **A       Hers or mine?**

17   Q       What makes you and Colonel McNamara's relationship  
18           appropriate? Well, let me ask you this. Did you think your  
19           relationship with Colonel McNamara was inappropriate?

20   **A       My relationship with Colonel McNamara appropriate?**

21   Q       Your interactions with him.

22   **A       Interactions, yes, they were appropriate.**

23   Q       Okay. But you guys were having--according to what you just  
24           told me, you guys were having the same types of  
25           conversations that Sergeant Reed and Colonel Golnick were

1 having, work-related and nonwork-related.

2 **A Yeah, you don't--you just don't cross that line though,**  
3 **which--**

4 **Q** What line?

5 **A --is superintendent--**

6 **Q** Okay. I get it.

7 **A Okay.**

8 **Q** But if there was no sexual relationship going on and it  
9 was just talking about work and other nonwork-related  
10 issues, what makes her relationship inappropriate and  
11 yours not?

12 **A He crossed the line.**

13 **Q** I want to know what line that is, sir.

14 **A Inappropriate conversation.**

15 **Q** Is it just because she's a female?

16 **A I don't know.**

17 **Q** You say that the fact that Colonel Golnick was in Sergeant  
18 Reed's office for four to five hours a day impacted your  
19 work. Can you--can you refresh my memory how it impacted  
20 your work?

21 **A How it would impact my work?**

22 **Q** Yes, sir. How did it negatively--

23 **A Well, if I was trying to get something from Renee that I**  
24 **needed to use to find out whatever she was wanting me to**  
25 **find, parts, item managers, whatever, I wouldn't be able**

1           **to do that if she was distracted.**

2       Q       Were you ever not able to do your job--were you ever--did  
3           you ever get in trouble for not doing your job because of  
4           Colonel Golnick's presence in the office?

5       A       **No, I never got in trouble for it; no, no.**

6       Q       Okay. And you also testified that it had to be a  
7           distraction on her as well. Did you know this for a fact?  
8           Did she tell you this, or are you just making assumptions?

9       A       **I think I've actually heard her say on days when Colonel  
10          Golnick wasn't at work she said, "Oh, good, the boss isn't  
11          here. Maybe I can get something done."**

12      Q       But you and others--and in fact I think you--you were the  
13          most unequivocal so far. You said Reed is the best in the  
14          state?

15      A       **Yeah. She's good. She's great at her job. She'd be really  
16          really good if she didn't have so many distractions.**

17      Q       Okay. But she's the best--and so she's already better than  
18          all the other PCs in the state?

19      A       **Probably, yeah.**

20      Q       Even though she's distracted?

21      A       **Yes.**

22      Q       You also testified that even though you did not--that you  
23          found the relationship inappropriate, you didn't confront  
24          Colonel Golnick. And you said because he's the boss?

25      A       **That's right.**

1 Q And nobody confronts Colonel Golnick?

2 A **That's right.**

3 Q Well, would it be plausible that maybe Mrs. Reed was in  
4 the same boat, that she--that obviously she was not going  
5 to his office; correct?

6 A **She--she was going to his office.**

7 Q But the testimony, including yours so far, is that he was  
8 the one who spent the bulk of his time in her office?

9 A **That's true. But she also went to his office as well.**

10 Q And you've also testified that she said that, "God, (sic)  
11 he's not here today. Maybe I can get some work done."

12 A **Uh-huh.**

13 Q Could it be that she didn't want him in the office as well  
14 and she just couldn't confront him--

15 A **I don't know.**

16 Q --just like you didn't feel you could confront him?

17 A **Ask her.**

18 Q I'm asking you, sir.

19 A **I don't know. I can't answer that question.**

20 Q Is it possible--

21 A **Ask her.**

22 Q --if you--I'm not saying you were afraid of Colonel  
23 Golnick. But it's been stated here by yourself and others  
24 that Colonel Golnick ran with an iron fist. He ran the  
25 shop with an iron fist.



1    **A**        **It was just--it was his way.**

2    Q        But it--

3    **A**        **And if you didn't like it, then you can go find a job**  
4            **somewhere else. I mean, that's just how it was.**

5    Q        So it could be--

6    **A**        **You didn't confront the boss.**

7    Q        Could it be that Mrs. Reed was also in that same position  
8            where she didn't feel she could confront the boss? She  
9            couldn't feel as if she could tell Colonel Golnick "I  
10           don't want you in my office anymore"?

11                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  He's asked and answered.  
12                    He's answered it three times now.  He doesn't know.

13                    THE WITNESS:  I don't know and I can't answer  
14                    that.

15  BY MR. BANCHS:

16  Q        You talked about special treatment, comp time weekends.  
17            Have you ever done comp time weekends, sir?

18  **A**        **Have I ever?**

19  Q        Yes, sir.

20  **A**        **Yes, I have.**

21  Q        Okay.  And on what occasion do you remember coming in for a  
22            comp time weekend?

23  **A**        **I was--I think I had two weekends in 2013 maybe.**

24  Q        And what was the--

25  **A**        **And prior to that, it was none for years actually to--**

1 Q And in 2013 what was the policy for somebody to do a comp  
2 time weekend?

3 A **What was the policy?**

4 Q Yes.

5 A **I don't know if there was a policy. Colonel Golnick I  
6 guess would tell the supervisor or pick out somebody who  
7 was going to work the weekend.**

8 Q And then did somebody post a volunteer list that people  
9 could sign up for?

10 A **Not that I seen, not for my section. I can say that, not  
11 for my section.**

12 Q You testified that the special treatment was that Ms. Reed  
13 would come in on comp time weekends. How was that special  
14 treatment?

15 A **Again, when the QC section was responsible for the  
16 logbooks and the keys and the hand receipts of equipment  
17 and on drill weekends when units came in to drop those  
18 off, it was the QCs responsibility to gather that data,  
19 turn in dispatches, what-have-you, and we were removed  
20 from that position for the most part for many, many years.**

21 Q All right. But my question is, how is your performing comp  
22 time weekends appropriate--

23 A **Because--**

24 Q --and not special treatment and hers were?

25 A **Because actually I should have been--my section should**

1           **have been the one working comp time, and they weren't.**

2    Q       Okay. Well, so what was Ms. Reed doing on that comp time

3           weekend?

4    A       **She was doing what we were supposed to do as a QC section.**

5    Q       She was--does the QC issue parts?

6    A       **Do I issue parts? No. Like I've already told you probably**

7           **three times, we've got logbooks, dispatches, keys, and**

8           **make sure the hand receipts were proper and, you know,**

9           **accounted for, everything's turned in properly.**

10   Q       So if Ms. Reed was doing comp time weekend--if she was on

11           a weekend earning comp time, and she was issuing parts,

12           was that part of her duties?

13   A       **Parts, yes.**

14   Q       Okay. So that wouldn't be special treatment?

15   A       **No, but that's--she didn't only do the parts though. She**

16           **also did like--do I keep saying this?--the logbooks, the**

17           **keys, the dispatches. She also gathered that, took it in**

18           **from the units.**

19   Q       Did you have access to the parts cage?

20   A       **Did I? No, no.**

21   Q       Okay. Did she?

22   A       **Yes, of course.**

23   Q       Well, then would that be a reason that she was doing that

24           job?

25   A       **Are we talking parts here or are we talking dispatches and**

1           log--

2                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Yeah, I--

3                   MR. BANCHS:  I'll rephrase. I'll rephrase--

4                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  I'm going to--

5                   MR. BANCHS:  I'll help you out here. Was--

6                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  I'm going to object.

7                   MR. BANCHS:  Was Mrs. Reed--

8                   HEARING EXAMINER:  Hold--

9                   MR. BANCHS:  Was Ms. Reed--

10                  HEARING EXAMINER:  Hold--

11                  CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  I just want to place an

12                  objection.

13                  MR. BANCHS:  Oh, I'm sorry.

14                  CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Master Sergeant Cooper has

15                  answered several times now that there were two components

16                  to these comp time weekends. One was issuing parts for

17                  which he has no issue with Master Sergeant Reed doing that

18                  part of it. He's also testified that there were duties

19                  that should have belonged to his section, the QC

20                  department, and that she was also doing those.

21                  MR. BANCHS:  Allegedly.

22                  CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  So his--

23                  MR. BANCHS:  But what I'm asking--

24                  CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  It's his testimony. So I

25                  think he's asked and answered it several times now, and

1 he's getting frustrated. It's late so--

2 MR. BANCHS: Well, you don't have to protect  
3 the witnesses--

4 HEARING EXAMINER: What's your question--

5 BY MR. BANCHS:

6 Q But let me ask it another way. Was she doing anything  
7 other than--than National Guard related work when she was  
8 coming in on comp time weekends?

9 A **I don't know. I wasn't there.**

10 Q So how was it special--

11 A **I wasn't allowed to go on comp time. I wasn't permitted to  
12 go on comp time. She was. Or on orders for that matter.  
13 Whatever she wanted, that's--**

14 Q Well, how come--

15 A **--she was given the option to go either on comp time or on  
16 orders that weekend.**

17 Q Okay. Now, you testified that you did, what, two comp time  
18 weekends in 2013?

19 A **I'm guessing. That's probably pretty close to accurate.**

20 Q So how many did Ms. Reed do?

21 A **I can't even answer that.**

22 Q More than two?

23 A **Many.**

24 Q Many?

25 A **Many weekends, yeah.**

1 Q Do you know that for a fact?

2 A **Sure.**

3 Q How do you know that?

4 A **Well, I live near the shop, and I tend to travel by it on**  
5 **weekends. And I always seem to look at the shop when I**  
6 **drove by, and I happened to notice when certain vehicles**  
7 **are parked there. So it's pretty obvious that they're**  
8 **working there.**

9 Q Did you ever happen to see her LES or maybe a time and  
10 attendance sheet?

11 A **No, I did not.**

12 Q Were other cars there? Were other employees doing comp  
13 time weekend as well?

14 A **Sure.**

15 Q Okay. So she was not the only one?

16 A **No.**

17 Q You said that you have firsthand knowledge that she used  
18 his, Colonel Golnick's NTV for drill. You mentioned in  
19 Jackson. And were there any other occasions where she  
20 used--or that you were aware of that she used an NTV to go  
21 to either drill--any kind of IDT period?

22 A **Any other IDT periods?**

23 Q IDT is annual training or drill?

24 A **IDT is not annual training or drill.**

25 Q Okay. Well--

1 A You want IDT weekends, or do you want annual training?

2 Which one do you want?

3 Q Either one, annual training or--

4 A IDT weekends, yes. IDT weekends, yes, she used it. And,  
5 yes, she used it during an AT period. As a matter of fact  
6 I think it was this last '13's AT period, yeah, '13.

7 Q And how--I mean, but how was it used inappropriate?

8 A How was it used inappropriate? I'm not sure if it was used  
9 inappropriately. I'm just saying that she was given a  
10 vehicle to use during AT periods.

11 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I think his question was how  
12 was the use inappropriate, not how it was used--is that  
13 fair to--

14 MR. BANCHS: Yes.

15 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: How was--how was--

16 BY MR. BANCHS:

17 Q How does it go against the regulations, in other words?

18 A Regulation or Colonel Golnick's policy?

19 Q Well, okay, since you broached the subject, what is the  
20 governing policy for NTV use?

21 A It's probably AR 58-1 for one but--

22 Q Is there another--

23 A --Colonel Golnick would typically allow or set battalion  
24 commanders up with NTVs for AT periods, BC's or above  
25 typically is how it normal works. You never--you rarely

1           **ever seen if ever if you see anybody below a 05 allowed to**  
2           **use a NTV for AT.**

3    Q       Just for AT? What about drill?

4    A       **Well, there was people who used NTVs on drill weekends for**  
5           **sure, yes.**

6    Q       Okay. Would Dean Miller be one of those at the SMOs  
7           office?

8    A       **It's very possible, yes.**

9    Q       Tim Sheldon?

10   A       **Yes, yes. That's--yes, that's probably possible, yes.**

11   Q       Jim Piper?

12   A       **That's possible.**

13   Q       Troy Herblet?

14   A       **Yes.**

15   Q       Okay. So in addition to Mrs. Reed, there were other  
16           individuals that worked at MATES that used NTVs for drill  
17           per se?

18   A       **I'm not sure what--they used them on drill weekends. I**  
19           **don't know if they were going on different missions,**  
20           **different trips, inspections throughout the state. But,**  
21           **sure, they used them.**

22   Q       You mentioned using an NTV to go to Jackson, and I'm going  
23           to show you a few statements that we have here to read--

24   A       **I've already read them. Save your breath. It doesn't mean**  
25           **anything to me at all.**



1 Q You've read the statements that were provided--

2 A **Absolutely.**

3 Q --the sworn statements that were provided on her behalf?

4 A **Yes, I have.**

5 Q And what is your characterization of these statements?

6 A **I don't--I don't believe that at all.**

7 Q So you don't believe Casey Ellis?

8 A **I don't know Casey Ellis, but I don't believe that**  
9 **statement's accurate.**

10 Q She's an E7.

11 A **Okay.**

12 Q Do you believe Captain at the time, now Major Jeremy  
13 Ruby's sworn statement?

14 A **I don't--I don't remember--really remember what he said in**  
15 **his statement.**

16 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Master Sergeant Cooper, I  
17 know you don't want to read them, because you've  
18 apparently seen them. But before you testify, I'd  
19 encourage you to read them. He's giving you the  
20 opportunity to read them. And I know it's late but you  
21 might want to take an opportunity to look at them.

22 THE WITNESS: Well, Major Ruby mentioned  
23 something about using an NTV during annual training.

24 BY MR. BANCHS:

25 Q If you read the second paragraph--

1    **A**    **Yes, where he was--well, that doesn't mean that it didn't**  
2           **happen, I guess. I mean, just because he didn't witness it**  
3           **doesn't mean it didn't happen.**

4    **Q**    Well, he did witness her using an NTV at Jackson.

5    **A**    **Right, on one occasion, well, when Master Sergeant**  
6           **Reed--once, yes.**

7    **Q**    And she was using it to transport parts?

8    **A**    **Okay.**

9    **Q**    Okay. So would that be an appropriate use of an NTV?

10   **A**    **Sure.**

11   **Q**    The next statement, from Sergeant Hoag--and it's very  
12           short. He testifies that he has actually seen Master  
13           Sergeant Reed use her POV at drill weekend.

14   **A**    **Uh-huh.**

15   **Q**    Okay? The next one is Colonel Perricane.

16   **A**    **Yeah. I read it, yeah.**

17   **Q**    And he talks about annual training and--

18   **A**    **Yes, I remember that one; yeah.**

19   **Q**    Okay, good. And just to refresh your memory, you said that  
20           you had no use for these statements.

21   **A**    **I don't, because I know I seen Renee Reed get in a**  
22           **vehicle--in Colonel Golnick's NTV on countless occasions**  
23           **at the shop on a Friday afternoon going to drill so--**

24   **Q**    And none of those occasions might have been one of these  
25           times?

1    **A**     **Well, you said it only happened once. Right.**

2    Q     Well, it's not just to drill. It's also AT but--

3    **A**     **Well, she would go to AT at Camp Grayling so--**

4    Q     So you don't believe these statements?

5    **A**     **I--just what I seen, that--her leaving in an NTV from**

6           **MATES, and it was Colonel Golnick's NTV that he allowed**

7           **her to use so--**

8    Q     You talked about meals with Colonel Golnick, Sergeant Reed

9           eating--and a lot of people have made issues about eating.

10    And again I'll refer you to your office situation with

11    Colonel McNamara. Did you ever eat breakfast, lunch,

12    dinner, anything with Colonel McNamara?

13   **A**     **Breakfast, sure.**

14   Q     In the office or in the break room?

15   **A**     **Office.**

16   Q     Was that appropriate?

17   **A**     **I didn't go to the break room so that's where I ate my**

18           **breakfast.**

19   Q     But you eating--you as a Master Sergeant eating with a

20           Lieutenant Colonel--

21   **A**     **He's not the superintendent.**

22   Q     But he's still your boss and he's--

23   **A**     **Sure.**

24   Q     --still in the chain of command. So is that appropriate?

25   **A**     **I guess it was.**

1 Q Okay. You talk about Sergeant Reed and Colonel Golnick  
2 doing PT together?

3 A **Uh-huh.**

4 Q You mention they are healthy and fit. But you saw them  
5 working out together. But I just want to be clear when you  
6 say they were working out together, they weren't  
7 physically working out, they were just working out next to  
8 each other; correct?

9 A **Uh-huh.**

10 Q Whether it was on a treadmill, whether it was doing yoga?

11 A **Uh-huh.**

12 Q Were they ever--and this kind of goes to her office too.  
13 Was her door ever closed when they were eating in the  
14 office?

15 A **When they were in the office?**

16 Q Yes, sir.

17 A **Oh, sure.**

18 Q It was closed?

19 A **Sure.**

20 Q Not the PT room. In her office?

21 A **Oh, I'm sure, yeah.**

22 Q Are you sure, or are you just assuming? Do you remember  
23 the door--

24 A **Oh, I'm sure I walked by that office and the door was  
25 closed with the two of them in there, sure.**

1 Q Would you be surprised to know that you're the only one  
2 that's testified that their door was closed--her office  
3 door was closed?

4 **A No, I guess--no, it doesn't surprise me.**

5 Q The PT room door is always closed; right? So if they're--

6 **A The main PT room door, yes, in the hallway--**

7 Q Yes.

8 **A --that's typically closed, yes.**

9 Q The one that's across the hall from Sergeant Fouts's  
10 office?

11 **A Yes.**

12 Q That door is always closed. So if they were in there and  
13 the door was closed, that was no big deal because the door  
14 is always closed?

15 **A Uh-huh.**

16 Q All right. But you--but did they ever lock the door?

17 **A No.**

18 Q And you've testified that you worked out in there with  
19 them at the same time--not with them but in the same room?

20 **A In the--well, there's two rooms in the PT room. You have  
21 to understand that. There's the yoga room, then there's  
22 the elliptical and treadmill room. So I was in the  
23 treadmill part of the room.**

24 Q And you were--and you testified that at one time you were  
25 stretching and Renee offered--or asked you if you wanted

1 to join the yoga club or whatever that was called?

2 **A Yeah. You go and do yoga for the day, yes.**

3 Q Right. And that was--and so I guess what I'm trying to get

4 at is how is it inappropriate for them to do PT together

5 if not only were they not locking the door but they were

6 also inviting others like you to join them in whatever

7 they were doing?

8 **A They didn't invite me. She invited me.**

9 Q Okay. Well, she invited you?

10 **A Yeah.**

11 Q So I mean, if they were having an inappropriate

12 relationship, then it--wouldn't it stand to reason that

13 maybe they didn't want anybody else around?

14 **A Uh-huh.**

15 Q But they invited you; correct--or she invited you?

16 **A She invited me, yes. And then shortly thereafter Colonel**

17 **Golnick came in, and that was basically my cue to, you**

18 **know, depart so--**

19 Q How so? Did he ask you to leave?

20 **A No, no.**

21 Q Did he give you a dirty look?

22 **A Probably not.**

23 Q Did she ask you to leave?

24 **A No.**

25 Q So you just left on your own account?

1    **A**    **Yes, yeah.**

2    **Q**    All right. Concerning the nickname Princess, how did you  
3           find out--or let me ask you this. You testified that  
4           Lieutenant Colonel McNamara asked you to stop?

5    **A**    **Yes.**

6    **Q**    Why was that?

7    **A**    **Because Renee had came to Colonel McNamara and asked him**  
8           **to tell everybody to stop using that name.**

9    **Q**    Did you ever personally talk to Renee about that issue?

10   **A**    **I'm not sure. I don't recall that.**

11   **Q**    Do you recall a conversation that she had with you that  
12           she approached you and told you that she heard from Brian  
13           Harter (phonetic) that you're were calling her Princess  
14           behind her back?

15   **A**    **That might be. Yeah, I guess I do recall that now that you**  
16           **say that, sure.**

17   **Q**    Okay. And she came to you and she told you that her  
18           feelings were hurt because you guys were friends?

19   **A**    **Yeah.**

20   **Q**    And that you told her that the rumors that she was hearing  
21           were not true and that you would never say because you all  
22           were friends?

23   **A**    **Say that one more time.**

24   **Q**    She approached you after Brian Harter told her that you  
25           were calling her Princess behind her back?

1   **A**    **Yeah.**

2   Q       Okay.

3   **A**    **I think it was--**

4                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Is this in evidence?  I mean,  
5       you were reading from a statement.  I mean, is this--is her  
6       statement in evidence to this effect?

7                    MR. BANCHS:  Is her statement in evidence?

8                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Yeah.  Does she have a sworn  
9       statement in evidence right now stating what you're  
10      stating right now?

11                   MR. BANCHS:  No.  But he--he attests to it.  He  
12      said it happened.

13                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Okay.

14                   MR. BANCHS:  He could have certainly said it  
15      didn't happen.  I wouldn't have never questioned him  
16      further.

17  BY MR. BANCHS:

18  Q       Did you--did she tell you that her feelings were hurt  
19       because you all were friends?

20  **A**    **Yeah, she may have; yeah.**

21  Q       How long have you been knowing Sergeant Reed?

22  **A**    **Ever since she started working at the shop.**

23  Q       You guys were in the same unit together, the 1071st?

24  **A**    **We were.**

25  Q       Okay.  Did you--have you guys had--other than at the MATES



1           what have been your interactions with Sergeant Reed,  
2           perhaps on a TDY, outside of work?

3   **A       Yeah, yeah. We went TDY to Texas a few years ago.**

4   Q       And was that a technician trip, or was that a military  
5           trip?

6   **A       Technician, yeah.**

7   Q       And did you guys--what was the--what was the TDY for?

8   **A       Learn a program.**

9   Q       And during the course of that--how long was that trip?

10 **A       A week maybe, three or four days.**

11 Q       And was that--was your interactions with her strictly  
12          work-related, or did you all socialize outside of work?

13 **A       We socialized outside, yeah. We went down to the**  
14 **restaurant downstairs and had some beers and ate dinner**  
15 **probably together and--**

16 Q       By yourselves or was there other people around?

17 **A       --we were traveling together. There was other people**  
18 **around, yeah.**

19 Q       And that was okay?

20 **A       Yeah, I guess.**

21 Q       Was there any kind of inappropriate tone to the  
22          relationship that you and Sergeant Reed had?

23 **A       Inappropriate tone? I don't think so, no.**

24 Q       Well, you all were eating together, you all were  
25          socializing together?

1    **A**    **Yeah.**

2    Q    Okay. Did you complaint to Sergeant Reed about Master  
3        Sergeant Fouts's use of NTVs?

4    **A**    **I guess I don't recall that.**

5    Q    You and Sergeant Reed were--would you say that you all  
6        were--well, you all were definitely more than coworkers  
7        because you've said that you guys were friends. Would you  
8        say that you all were good friends?

9    **A**    **Fairly good friends. I mean, we didn't hang out after work  
10       but we associated with each other at the shop. We'd  
11       interact with each other at the shop. I mean, it was a  
12       need because of our jobs. And she's a pretty pleasant  
13       person so, yeah.**

14   Q    She's a pleasant person. She was your friend. And she's  
15       the best PC in the state?

16   **A**    **Sure.**

17   Q    And I know that--look--listen, and I'm not patronizing  
18       you, because I know this is hard. Okay? But I'm going to  
19       ask you, do you think that she should have been fired?

20   **A**    **I'm not sure about that.**

21   Q    Well, if you want to expand, you're more than welcome to.  
22       But if you don't, that's fine, but I'll--then I'll ask you  
23       this way. If Sergeant Reed was to be reinstated, would you  
24       necessarily have an issue with that?

25   **A**    **It wouldn't affect me at all. I mean, it would be--it is a**

1 true loss to the state that her knowledge--her knowledge  
2 base isn't being utilized to the--you know, her capacity.  
3 It's very unfortunate. The whole circumstance is very  
4 unfortunate. That's it. We were good friends. I just think  
5 she made some bad choices. And I know she got--I don't  
6 know what to say after that.

7 MR. BANCHS: Fair enough. Thank you, sir.

8 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

9 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No further questions until  
10 tomorrow, I guess.

11 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. I'll remind you that  
12 you remain under oath and that you are subject to recall  
13 to this hearing until such time that it has been  
14 adjourned. And I will remind you not to discuss your  
15 testimony with anyone. Thanks for your time.

16 THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

17 (At 8:20 p.m., witness excused)

18 HEARING EXAMINER: Let's go off the record,  
19 please.

20 COURT REPORTER: It is 8:20 p.m., and we are  
21 off the record.

22 (Off the record)

23 COURT REPORTER: The time is now 8:25 p.m.,  
24 and we are on the record.

25 HEARING EXAMINER: Chief, do you swear or

1 affirm that the testimony you're about to give in this  
2 case is the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the  
3 truth so help you God?

4 CHIEF MACK: Yes, sir.

5 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Further, you are  
6 advised that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
7 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
8 testifying in this case.

9 CHIEF MACK: Yes, sir.

10 HEARING EXAMINER: With that, you can have a  
11 seat. And I will turn it over to Captain Bedells.

12 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

13 CHIEF JOEL MACK, JR.

14 (At 8:25 p.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

15 DIRECT EXAMINATION

16 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

17 Q Sir, would you please state your full name for the record?

18 A **Joel Mack, Jr.**

19 Q Okay. Chief, up until recently, you worked at the MATES  
20 facility; correct?

21 A **Yes, sir.**

22 Q And I understand you left and you're now at Selfridge;  
23 right?

24 A **Yes, sir.**

25 Q Is that at FMS4?

1    **A**     **Two, sir.**

2    Q     Where is FMS4; do you know?

3    **A**     **FSM4 is Grand Rapids.**

4    Q     Wyoming?

5    **A**     **Wyoming, yes.**

6    Q     Okay, great. Prior to leaving and while you worked at--for

7         Selfridge and while you worked at MATES, did you have

8         occasion to interact with Master Sergeant Reed?

9    **A**     **Absolutely. She was the PC at MATES.**

10   Q     The production controller?

11   **A**     **Yes, sir.**

12   Q     What did you think of her as a production controller?

13   **A**     **She did a outstanding job as a production controller.**

14   Q     Okay. And what was the frequency with which you would

15         interact with Master Sergeant Reed in her capacity as

16         production controller?

17   **A**     **Several times a day.**

18   Q     Several times a day?

19   **A**     **Absolutely.**

20   Q     Everyday?

21   **A**     **The days I was there. I worked four days a week so--**

22   Q     Okay. And what was your job again?

23   **A**     **A wage leader.**

24   Q     Wage leader?

25   **A**     **Yes, sir.**

1 Q Okay. While you were at MATES--and did you happen to ever  
2 observe Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in Master Sergeant  
3 Reed's office?

4 A **Yes, sir.**

5 Q And you indicated you were in there several times a day.  
6 How often would you--how would you characterize your--the  
7 times in which you witnessed Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in  
8 Master Sergeant Reed's office? Frequent, infrequent?

9 A **Frequently.**

10 Q Okay. Give me an example. On average, how many times would  
11 you be in Master Sergeant Reed's office?

12 A **Four or five times a day, easy that.**

13 Q Let's say if you were there on five separate occasions on  
14 a particular day, how many times do you think you would  
15 see Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in her office?

16 A **If it was the morning, I'd see him in the morning more  
17 than the afternoon or evening time. And out of, say, three  
18 times in the morning, I'd probably see him three times.**

19 Q Okay. So he was in there most of the morning according to  
20 your testimony?

21 A **He was there--he was there a lot, sir, yes.**

22 Q Okay. And how long--before going to Selfridge, how long  
23 did you work at MATES?

24 A **Eighteen years, sir.**

25 Q Eighteen years. And can you--as you sit here today, is

1           there any reason that you can--that you can imagine that  
2           the shop superintendent would be in one of the production  
3           controller's offices for most of the morning?

4   **A     Not that often, sir, no.**

5   Q     Okay. And is the case that you didn't see Lieutenant  
6           Colonel Golnick in the afternoon because you just weren't  
7           there in the afternoon typically?

8   **A     A lot of times I wasn't there in the afternoon as much as**  
9           **I was other than to turn in timesheets around 1400 to**  
10          **1600. And we just dropped them in the box.**

11 Q     Did it--did Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's presence in  
12          Master Sergeant Reed's office in the morning interfere  
13          with your job in any respect?

14 **A     It was inappropriate (sic). It was inappropriate. I mean,**  
15          **it's not--that's not the relationship that a production**  
16          **controller and a shop superintendent should have by no**  
17          **means.**

18 Q     Okay. Did it make you feel uncomfortable in that respect?

19 **A     At times it was awkward to be in there, yes, sir.**

20 Q     And I think--I think you actually stated that in your  
21          sworn statement. Correct?

22 **A     Yes, sir.**

23 Q     That you were uncomfortable?

24 **A     That's been a while ago, but--**

25 Q     Right.

1    **A**       **--the sworn statement has it.**

2    Q        Would you have a reason to doubt me if I said it was in  
3            your sworn statement--

4    **A**       **No, sir, I would not; no.**

5    Q        --you said it was uncomfortable? Okay. Did you  
6            ever--again, you said you were there mostly in the  
7            morning?

8    **A**       **Yeah.**

9    Q        Did you ever observe the two of them eating breakfast in  
10           Master Sergeant Reed's office?

11   **A**       **Yes, sir.**

12   Q        And how frequent would that be?

13   **A**       **It was often if I was there during break time at 9:00**  
14           **o'clock break.**

15   Q        Did you--did you ever observe Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
16           and Master Sergeant Reed eating lunch in her office?

17   **A**       **I'm not positive on that. I mean, I know--I don't know if**  
18           **it was at lunch time. I've gone in there at lunch time and**  
19           **break time before and actually he had made a comment about**  
20           **me being in there and it was break time, Colonel Golnick**  
21           **did.**

22   Q        What comment did he make?

23   **A**       **That it was break time or lunchtime and that I needed to**  
24           **come back afterwards.**

25   Q        Okay. But he was in there?



1    **A**     **Yes, sir.**

2    Q     Well, do you know what he was talking about?

3    **A**     **No.**

4    Q     Did you overhear any of the conversation?

5    **A**     **No, sir.**

6    Q     So he was in there talking to Master Sergeant Reed during

7         break time and told you, "Hey, it's break time"--if it's--

8    **A**     **Yeah, "come back"--**

9    Q     --work-related--

10   **A**     **Yeah, "come back afterwards" is what he told me.**

11   Q     Okay. How did that make you feel?

12   **A**     **I was--I was pissed. I mean, I was there to do a job and**

13         **do my work, and I wasn't real happy with it. But I**

14         **continued on and did what I needed to do, get my job**

15         **orders. And actually Master Sergeant Reed answered what I**

16         **was asking her for. I don't remember exactly what it was**

17         **at the time but--**

18   Q     Well, you're pissed. Did you confront Lieutenant Colonel

19         Golnick about this?

20   **A**     **No.**

21   Q     Well, why not?

22   **A**     **Because he was the superintendent.**

23   Q     Okay. How about Master Sergeant Reed?

24   **A**     **We talked--**

25   Q     Did you confront her?

1    **A**        --frequently--we talked--not at that time, no. She  
2            actually told him to not be that way.

3    **Q**        Okay. Did you consider Master Sergeant Reed to be a  
4            friend?

5    **A**        **Yeah.**

6    **Q**        So on that occasion you didn't--you didn't confront her  
7            about this relationship that you--

8    **A**        **No.**

9    **Q**        --deemed inappropriate?

10   **A**        **No, no. I--we had talked one day if that's what you're**  
11            **looking as--she was upset one day because they**  
12            **were--what'd they call her? Princess or something I think**  
13            **it was. And we had talked--we had talked about it in there**  
14            **and just talked about the relationship and why people were**  
15            **calling her Princess at work, that Colonel Golnick was in**  
16            **there all time and they considered her his Princess.**

17   **Q**        Okay. And you explained that to her?

18   **A**        **Yes, sir.**

19   **Q**        And what was her reply if you recall?

20   **A**        **She--she was upset of course. You know what I mean, with**  
21            **the whole thing going on.**

22   **Q**        Upset like angry, like raising her voice?

23   **A**        **No, like--no, no, not that way, like emotional.**

24   **Q**        Crying?

25   **A**        **Yeah.**

1 Q Okay.

2 A And we just--we talked about it briefly, about, you know,  
3 the reason it is is that he's in here and this and that.  
4 And she felt uncomfortable with the whole thing of him  
5 being in there. She really didn't know how to deal with  
6 it. And I brought up that maybe she needs to go higher or  
7 whatever with it, and that was it. That's--I think that's  
8 really the only time we ever talked about it, because she  
9 was upset about it.

10 Q Well, did you ever think to tell her yourself that you  
11 viewed it, in your words, as inappropriate and maybe it  
12 needs to change, that relationship?

13 A I don't know if that's the exact verbiage I used. I mean,  
14 maybe I should have and said it that way. But I just said  
15 that that's why everybody's saying it. That's what they're  
16 seeing. It is--it is inappropriate. I mean, it's like I  
17 said before, it's GS9 employee which is a production  
18 controller, and a superintendent should not be down  
19 at--it's not the norm that was going on at--I mean, the 18  
20 years I'd been there, that's not the norm for the  
21 superintendent to be sitting in the production  
22 controller's office by no means.

23 Q I mean, you would concede the point, would you not, Chief,  
24 that there's actually a reason that the production  
25 controller and the shop superintendent might have to talk

1 on occasion; right?

2 **A Oh, absolutely. I'd go down and see my production**

3 **controllers all the time. I'm in and I'm out. I have my**

4 **own SAMS computer to do what I need to do versus going**

5 **down there all the time.**

6 Q Okay. But at least what you viewed in terms of the amount

7 of time they spent together was inappropriate in your

8 words?

9 **A Absolutely.**

10 Q Now, have you ever had breakfast with Lieutenant Colonel

11 Golnick?

12 **A Not--**

13 Q In his office or your office?

14 **A No, sir; no, sir.**

15 Q How about lunch in his office or your office?

16 **A No, sir; no, sir.**

17 Q Okay. Are you aware of Lieutenant Colonel Golnick doing

18 any favors on behalf of Master Sergeant Reed?

19 **A He just helped her paint her mother's deck.**

20 Q And how do you know that?

21 **A It was just talked about at the shop. I don't--it was--**

22 Q You didn't personally observe it?

23 **A Absolutely not, no.**

24 Q Did she personally tell you that?

25 **A No.**

1 Q Did Lieutenant Colonel Golnick tell you that?

2 A No.

3 Q Okay. So it was just shop talk?

4 A Yeah, it was just shop talk, because I think that she took  
5 the day off to do that or whatever, and then he took the  
6 day off at the same time.

7 Q Do you think--do you think Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
8 treated Master Sergeant Reed differently than he treated  
9 other employees at MATES?

10 A Yeah, I do, absolutely.

11 Q In what respect?

12 A She--there was decisions made like PC decisions as they're  
13 going down the road, lots more communication to her than  
14 versus where she should be--or he should be doing, what  
15 the supervisors or the wage leaders--GSA usage for sure. I  
16 mean--

17 Q So is it your--so explain to the Hearing Examiner what you  
18 mean by GSA usage.

19 A Or GSAs or NTVs. There's more NTVs. Our Jeeps that we have  
20 are NTVs, and she'd use it for drill or whatever. They  
21 went out and looked at new sites out to like the ranges or  
22 whatever was going on for out at the ranges, the--like  
23 building maintenance and stuff out to the 30 complex and  
24 stuff like that.

25 Q Okay. Did you personally observe or do you have personal

1 knowledge of Master Sergeant Reed using an NTV to go to  
2 drill?

3 **A Like physically seeing her at drill? No. I didn't drill**  
4 **with--**

5 Q Physically seeing her maybe leave in an NTV on her way to  
6 drill?

7 **A No.**

8 Q Or by personal knowledge I mean asking her, "Hey, where  
9 are you going, Master Sergeant Reed?"

10 **A No.**

11 Q "Well, I'm going to drill in this NTV"?

12 **A No, I didn't see her leave in an NTV. Just like I said,**  
13 **the talk of what's going on and the NTVs leaving.**

14 Q So, again, no personal knowledge--

15 **A No, sir.**

16 Q --and you didn't witness that? Okay. And then you had just  
17 mentioned that you had--I believe you said you had  
18 observed Master Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel  
19 Golnick leave in an NTV to go observe sites?

20 **A They talked about that in their office that they wanted to**  
21 **go look at that. Actually Master Sergeant Reed initiated**  
22 **to go look at it. She wanted to get out of the office to**  
23 **go look at the projects out at the range, because Colonel**  
24 **Golnick was talking about the projects going on at the**  
25 **range. And she said, "Well, let's go check it out."**

- 1 Q Okay. And to your knowledge, did they go check it out?
- 2 A **I have--no, sir, I have no idea. I left her--**
- 3 Q Would there be any reason for her to go check--I mean, as
- 4 a production controller, any reason for her--
- 5 A **Not to my knowledge.**
- 6 Q --to check out sites?
- 7 A **That's why I said their relationship is inappropriate.**
- 8 **That's not--**
- 9 Q Is there any reason for him to go check out the sites?
- 10 A **I don't know what his position was at the time, if he was**
- 11 **on the project side of this at MTC. I don't know that. I**
- 12 **don't know what is--you know, he moved around. He was out**
- 13 **here at range control and that's maybe why he did--I have**
- 14 **no idea.**
- 15 Q Okay. Here's--
- 16 A **But he never took none of the supervisors and no one else**
- 17 **on a staff ride if you want to call it or whatever you**
- 18 **would call that.**
- 19 Q So this is at least another instance in which you believe
- 20 Master Sergeant Reed was getting treatment that was
- 21 different than other employees; correct?
- 22 A **Yes, sir.**
- 23 Q From Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?
- 24 A **Yes, sir.**
- 25 Q To your knowledge, was Lieutenant Colonel Golnick Master

1           Sergeant Reed's first-line supervisor?

2   **A**     **No, sir.**

3   Q       Do you know who was?

4   **A**     **Yeah.**

5   Q       Who?

6   **A**     **It was Master Sergeant Herblet at first, and then it was**

7           **Lieutenant Colonel McNamara.**

8   Q       Okay. Did you happen to work in close proximity to

9           Lieutenant Colonel McNamara?

10 **A**     **I was in the hallway.**

11 Q       But you didn't work in the same office like where Master

12          Sergeant Cooper did; correct?

13 **A**     **No, absolutely not, sir.**

14 Q       Okay. Was Lieutenant Colonel McNamara also your

15          supervisor?

16 **A**     **When I was in the vault, I was--he was my supervisor.**

17 Q       Would that be at any--would that be at the same time he

18          was Master Sergeant--

19 **A**     **No; no, sir.**

20 Q       And if you had to sum up your characterization of the

21          relationship of--between Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and

22          Master Sergeant Reed, is it your testimony that it's

23          inappropriate--

24 **A**     **Absolutely, sir.**

25 Q       --as you testified? Okay. No further questions.



1 HEARING EXAMINER: Mr. Banchs?

2 MR. BANCHS: Okay. Thank you.

3 CROSS-EXAMINATION

4 BY MR. BANCHS:

5 Q Chief, you mentioned at the onset that--that Sergeant Reed  
6 was an outstanding PC?

7 A **She was. I actually have a sworn statement that said that  
8 her ethic at work was great.**

9 Q I know. I'm going to get to that. Don't worry. But you  
10 reiterated that statement today under oath--because this  
11 was not under oath as the Captain likes to point out. But  
12 you did feel that she was outstanding in her job?

13 A **Uh-huh.**

14 Q And that's been the consensus here amongst most people,  
15 actually everyone that's testified. You also testified  
16 that several times a day, up to four or five times a day,  
17 you were in her office. Was this all for work-related--

18 A **Yes.**

19 Q --issues?

20 A **I'd go in there sometimes when I would get paperwork and  
21 talk to her too.**

22 Q Now, were you guys strictly coworkers? Or did you guys  
23 interact outside of work?

24 A **We interacted a couple times outside of work.**

25 Q How long have you been knowing Ms. Reed?

1   **A**    **I don't know, six years. I'm not positive on that**  
2           **honestly.**

3   **Q**    Other than work what other--because you did go--I mean,  
4           out of the folks that have testified at least today,  
5           you're one of the ones that--that according to you had a  
6           job-related reason to be in her office at least four to  
7           five times a day.

8   **A**    **Absolutely.**

9   **Q**    So other than work-related issues, what else would you  
10          guys talk about when you were in there?

11   **A**    **We talked about--I don't know--**

12   **Q**    Football or fishing?

13   **A**    **Yeah, we talked about foot--no, no fishing.**

14   **Q**    Partying?

15   **A**    **No. Just--**

16   **Q**    General things?

17   **A**    **Just general, yes.**

18   **Q**    Nonwork-related?

19   **A**    **Yeah.**

20   **Q**    Okay. So work-related and nonwork-related. How long do  
21          you--have you ever hung out with Renee or her husband  
22          socially?

23   **A**    **Yeah. Years ago her husband actually came out to our deer**  
24          **camp briefly with another mutual friend.**

25   **Q**    About how many times have--has Ms. Reed been to your

1 house?

2 **A Once.**

3 Q Just once?

4 **A Yes, sir.**

5 Q How many times have you been to her house?

6 **A Once.**

7 Q Do you recall the conversation that you and Ms. Reed had

8 in the summer of 2012 where she told you that she was

9 tired of being called a Princess?

10 **A Yeah. I referred to that earlier.**

11 Q Okay. And you told her that she needed to do what?

12 **A What I just told him.**

13 Q What did you reply to her when she told you she was being

14 tired--that she was tired of being called Princess?

15 **A To push it up.**

16 Q How did that conversation come about?

17 **A Because she was crying, and I said that earlier.**

18 Q Right. But was--were you guys in her office? I'm sorry I

19 forgot. I didn't write it down. Where did the conversation

20 take place?

21 **A In her office. That's where she was crying at.**

22 Q Okay. And what--

23 **A I went in there to get paperwork and she was in there**

24 **crying. I asked her what was going on.**

25 Q Oh, okay. All right. I'm sorry. So you walked in and she

1 was already crying?

2 **A Yes, sir.**

3 Q And she told you the reason she was crying was because she  
4 was tired of being called a Princess?

5 **A Uh-huh. Well, she--people were--tired of people talking  
6 behind her back or that effect--**

7 Q All right. And you advised her that she should take it up  
8 the chain?

9 **A If she has--if that's the problem, that's what's going on.**

10 Q To your knowledge, did she?

11 **A I have no idea, sir.**

12 Q I think you also testified that Colonel Golnick was--he's  
13 a hard individual to approach. Would that be accurate?

14 **A When I was younger, it was, yeah. But I was much--**

15 Q Not as much now?

16 **A No.**

17 Q So you have no problem confronting Colonel Golnick?

18 **A No.**

19 Q Did you ever confront him about this?

20 **A No.**

21 Q And why is that?

22 **A I don't know. It was brought up higher to the SMOs office.**

23 Q By you?

24 **A No. It was initiated by somebody else.**

25 Q You stated that in your opinion there was really no reason

1 for Colonel Golnick to be in Mrs. Reed's office, that it  
2 was inappropriate?

3 **A That amount of time, correct.**

4 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Yeah. That's a  
5 mischaracterization. He didn't say that it was  
6 inappropriate. He said the amount of time was  
7 inappropriate.

8 BY MR. BANCHS:

9 Q Okay. The amount of time that Colonel Golnick was spending  
10 in her office in your mind was inappropriate?

11 **A Yes, sir.**

12 Q But Captain Bedells also asked you, because he's  
13 preempting my questions, whether there was a work-related  
14 reason for Colonel Golnick to actually be in the PC's  
15 office.

16 **A For that amount of time, no.**

17 Q Well, in your--in your opinion, what is the appropriate  
18 amount of time for a superintendent of the MATES to be in  
19 a PC's office?

20 **A He could run--pretty much run all the reports or print it  
21 off and he was getting them via email anyways.**

22 Q Copy that. But is there a legal--a regulatory requirement  
23 that those reports be exchanged strictly via email or any  
24 other method?

25 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: If you know.

1 THE WITNESS: I was going to say, I'm not  
2 positive how to answer that.

3 BY MR. BANCHS:

4 Q So maybe Colonel Golnick preferred to have his reports be  
5 given to him face-to-face?

6 A **Or he could have got his SAMS computer and done it too.**

7 Q Oh, absolutely. But it is possible that that's how he was  
8 receiving his reports?

9 A **That's perception--can just be making stuff up.**

10 Q I mean, we're not. I'm asking you, is it possible too that  
11 he had a work-related reason to be in the office?

12 A **Well, yeah.**

13 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: He's already testified that  
14 there's--that there was a work-related--

15 MR. BANCHS: He--he's--

16 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: He asked and answered it.

17 MR. BANCHS: He's tap-dancing all over my  
18 question.

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No, no. He's asked and  
20 answered it. There is work-related reasons to be there. He  
21 said it on direct.

22 THE WITNESS: I said that when he asked me  
23 that. So I'm confused right now.

24 BY MR. BANCHS:

25 Q So it would be the same reasons that you would be in

1           there; right? Work-related? In the course of your  
2           work-related interactions with her, you also had  
3           nonwork-related conversations with her; right?

4   **A     Check.**

5   Q     Was that appropriate or inappropriate?

6   **A     Some of it was appropriate or I probably wouldn't have  
7           done it.**

8   Q     Okay. And you're a Warrant Officer; right? You're a  
9           higher-ranking individual than she is?

10  **A     Yeah.**

11  Q     So it's okay for you to have nonwork-related conversations  
12          with Mrs. Reed, and that's not--that's not inappropriate?

13  **A     Daily hours at a time, I didn't do that.**

14  Q     Well, is there a limit? Is there anywhere in the  
15          regulations that said that--that says that a  
16          higher-ranking individual is only allowed to have five  
17          minutes' worth of nonwork-related conversations with a  
18          lower-ranking individual?

19  **A     Is there not a regulation? You're asking me the question.  
20           I'm asking you one back. Is there not a regulation that  
21           tells him what he's supposed to be doing?**

22  Q     No, there isn't. No, there is no limit on how much a  
23          higher-ranking individual can socially or non-work related  
24          interact with a lower-ranking individual.

25  **A     So then why'd you ask me that question if you knew the**

1           **answer?**

2    Q       Because you're saying--because you're saying that their  
3           relationship is inappropriate where yours isn't or the  
4           conversation--forget relationship. The conversations--the  
5           nonwork-related conversations that you had with Sergeant  
6           Reed you don't deem to be inappropriate.

7                        CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  He's already--

8                        THE WITNESS:  No.

9                        CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Again, he's already answered  
10          that.

11                      MR. BANCHS:  I'm not asking him. I'm telling  
12          him this is what he said.

13                      CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  Well, look, then I'm going  
14          to object to your testifying. You ask him questions. It's  
15          getting late. You ask him questions. You don't testify.  
16          It's not--you don't put evidence in the record.

17                      HEARING EXAMINER:  I think I can ask the  
18          question. I think I can ask the question that you're--what  
19          you're trying to get to.

20                      MR. BANCHS:  Okay, good, because Captain  
21          Bedells is--

22                      CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  It's late.

23                      HEARING EXAMINER:  You characterized the  
24          conversations that Master Sergeant Reed and Colonel  
25          Golnick had to be excessive?



1 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

2 HEARING EXAMINER: And I just used that word.  
3 You haven't used that word but--

4 THE WITNESS: Check.

5 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. What--is the  
6 difference not only excessive but also excessively  
7 involving non-related--nonwork-related conversation?

8 THE WITNESS: I guess what you're--you're  
9 getting at is so you don't go into the office and  
10 socialize at all. I go in, do my paperwork and get out. Is  
11 that what you're--I mean, I just--

12 HEARING EXAMINER: Where in your mind is the  
13 line crossed between--

14 THE WITNESS: When you're sitting there for  
15 hours, the line is definitely crossed. I may go in there  
16 for 15 minutes and talk to Master Sergeant Reed, and I'm  
17 in and out. I mean, I'm in there several times a day. I'm  
18 getting job orders. Some days it'll be more. Some days  
19 would be less.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: So what I'm hearing, Ben,  
21 is that's what he's--he's saying it's in his opinion  
22 excessive, not necessary.

23 BY MR. BANCHS:

24 Q Right. And that's what I was trying to get at. But what I  
25 was trying to get at because what I--what I was also going

1 to ask him is how long were you in the office for at any  
2 given point in time with Master Sergeant Reed? Because you  
3 went there four to five times a day.

4 **A Yeah, at least that. Sometimes she wasn't in there.**

5 **There's--she would maybe not be there that day. I was in**  
6 **there to see the other production controllers, whoever is**  
7 **running that computer at the time.**

8 **Q Well, we've had testimony that she was the one in that**  
9 **office.**

10 **A That's not true. She has days off and Ryan Bower would be**  
11 **in there. Was Colonel Golnick in there at that times? No.**

12 **Q Okay. So there are actually two people that use Mrs.**  
13 **Reed's office?**

14 **A At the time, yes, because she--when she's gone, somebody's**  
15 **got to fill in. You don't just stop progress at the shop.**

16 **Q Well, when she's there though, she's the only one in the**  
17 **office?**

18 **A Check.**

19 **Q Okay. Much has been made about the meals, whether it's**  
20 **breakfast, lunch, dinner, whatever. And you say that you**  
21 **have seen them eating breakfast; is that correct?**

22 **A Yes, sir.**

23 **Q What is inappropriate about that?**

24 **A Like I said, it's not normal for the superintendent to be**  
25 **down there having breakfast with the PC.**

1 Q Do you eat with your subordinates?

2 A **In the break room, yeah, not in their office.**

3 Q Again, and I don't want to go down this rabbit hole again,  
4 but how is your eating with your subordinates any more  
5 appropriate?

6 A **Because that's the break room. It's not--it'd be like me  
7 going to Colonel Golnick's office or my boss's office and  
8 sitting there eating breakfast. It doesn't happen.**

9 Q Okay. But Sergeant Reed is certainly a subordinate of  
10 Colonel Golnick. In fact, all of you all were; correct?

11 A **Check.**

12 Q But this is okay, this is not?

13 A **It's a break room. Where am I supposed to go to eat lunch?**

14 Q Okay. Did you--you said that--you said that when you  
15 walked into her office that you--and she was crying and  
16 she told you why she was crying, you said that she should  
17 take it up the chain?

18 A **First I asked her why she was crying. And then she--she  
19 told about all the backstabbing or whatever and that they  
20 were calling her Princess. So I told her--she said she was  
21 uncomfortable with it. I said to either take it up the  
22 chain or talk to Colonel Golnick about it.**

23 Q And she was upset and emotional?

24 A **That's why I asked her.**

25 Q And she--and you said that she said that she didn't know

1           how to deal with him? I'm assuming it was Colonel Golnick.

2   **A       Well, I'm sure it was uncomfortable. You have a Lieutenant**  
3           **Colonel in your office. I mean, it's going to be**  
4           **uncomfortable.**

5   Q       Now, other than you, everybody else that I can remember  
6           has testified that--not necessarily afraid of Colonel  
7           Golnick but nobody wanted to confront Colonel Golnick  
8           directly because he was Colonel Golnick and it was his way  
9           or the highway.

10  **A       That's--that's how he acted, yeah.**

11  Q       So is it plausible that Sergeant Reed was also under the  
12           same intimidation, that she could not confront him Colonel  
13           Golnick?

14  **A       Well, then that kind of goes back to what you asked me,**  
15           **why didn't she go to somebody else too?**

16  Q       I'm asking you. It's just a "yes" or "no" question. I  
17           mean, if you want to expand, I'm sure--I'm more than  
18           willing to but he's going to jump all over me. Okay? So if  
19           you could just answer the questions that I'm asking you,  
20           we can get--

21  **A       It's possible. There's a lot of things possible.**

22  Q       Because he was an intimidating individual?

23  **A       Okay.**

24  Q       Was he?

25  **A       You're telling me. I told you before at first he was. He**

1           **wasn't when I was there longer.**

2    Q       So you were not intimidated by Colonel Golnick?

3    A       **No.**

4    Q       Okay. You never confronted him though?

5    A       **No.**

6    Q       The only--let's see. Well, I think it was the only  
7           favor--other than the GSAs, the only nonwork-related favor  
8           that you say that Colonel Golnick bestowed upon Sergeant  
9           Reed was that he allegedly helped her paint her mother's  
10          deck, but you have no firsthand knowledge of this.

11         Correct?

12   A       **No, absolutely not, sir. That's what I--**

13   Q       And this is just hallway chitchat?

14   A       **Yeah. Actually she talked about it the day before she was  
15          taking the day off to paint her mother's deck or clean it  
16          and do whatever she had to do. That's all it was, was  
17          absolutely hallway chitchat.**

18   Q       You also had no firsthand knowledge of her using GSAs?

19   A       **Other than just the talk.**

20   Q       Were there other individuals, to include yourself, that  
21          have used GSAs to either go to drill, AT or anywhere else  
22          that was work-related?

23   A       **Anywhere else? Well, yeah, you're allowed to go  
24          interviews, DA photos, and running stuff down, if you got  
25          a DA photo you'd take the GSA down to drop CAL or whatever**

1           **off.**

2    Q       Okay. So--

3    **A       But drill? No, not to my knowledge.**

4    Q       Now, you don't have firsthand knowledge of her actually

5           using a GSA or NTV but you heard?

6    **A       Check.**

7    Q       And what did you hear she used the NTV for?

8    **A       Drill. And that was one of the questions that was actually**

9           **in the investigation.**

10   Q       Have you used an NTV to go to drill?

11   **A       No.**

12   Q       How about the folks that work at the SMOs office like

13           Chief Miller? Do you know of him ever using an NTV to go

14           to drill?

15   **A       He may have. I don't know what they were requested to--**

16   Q       I won't go down the list of names. Is it possible that an

17           employee of MATES would use an NTV to go to drill?

18   **A       If they're traveling around, yes.**

19   Q       Would it be authorized?

20   **A       As long as it's approved.**

21   Q       AT?

22   **A       Not to my knowledge, nobody's--**

23   Q       Okay. Maybe--how about in conjunction with drill but to

24           pick up parts at an FMS?

25   **A       Yeah, that's possible.**

1 Q I'm going to show you some statements here, Chief. These  
2 statements were submitted on behalf of Sergeant Reed by  
3 individuals that worked for the Michigan National Guard  
4 concerning Mrs. Reed's use of NTVs. And who do you have in  
5 front of you right now?

6 A **I have Major Jeremy Ruby.**

7 Q Actually why don't you flip to--flip to the front. Flip  
8 one I think and tell me who's in front of you now--one  
9 more.

10 A **Ellis.**

11 Q There you go. Let's start with that. If you don't mind  
12 reading that one real quick, unless you've already read  
13 it.

14 A **Okay.**

15 Q Having read that statement, is it plausible that your  
16 secondhand hearsay that you heard from other people saying  
17 that she used NTVs or GSAs, that it was actually an  
18 appropriate use of the GSA and not inappropriate?

19 A **I don't know what she did with the GSA. I have no idea.  
20 Just because--I have no idea what she did at AT. I wasn't  
21 there to see where the NTV went. So I guess if we're going  
22 back to the--if it's plausible, then anything's plausible.**

23 Q Okay. So let me ask you a different way. And the reason  
24 that we're asking you this--or I'm asking you this is  
25 because in response to the question that Captain Bedells

1           asked you, whether Sergeant Reed was given preferential  
2           treatment, you indicated that she was receiving  
3           preferential treatment when it came to using GSAs and  
4           NTVs.

5   **A     Okay.**

6   **Q**And that you didn't have any firsthand knowledge--

7   **A     Check.**

8   **Q**--but that you heard that?

9   **A     Right.**

10   **Q**Okay. So is it possible that you might have heard a rumor  
11           but the rumor wasn't true? Because she certainly was using  
12           NTVs, not unlike other people at the MATES, but she might  
13           have had an official reason to use that NTV.

14   **A     And in my statement I said--I think I say that I didn't**  
15           **see the emails for the requests to those emails--or a**  
16           **request of use of the NTV. I don't see--**

17                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Chief, listen to his--listen  
18           to his question, because I think his question is actually  
19           pretty clear. He's just asking if it's--well, I'm not  
20           going to characterize his question.

21                   MR. BANCHS: Are you being nice to me now?

22                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Yeah. Just getting--

23                   THE WITNESS: Is it possible--

24                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: --my second wind now. Look  
25           out. We're going to go right through the--



1 HEARING EXAMINER: He had a donut.

2 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: His question's pretty clear.  
3 And I don't think you have to allude to emails or anything  
4 like that. Just listen to his question and answer it as  
5 best you can.

6 MR. BANCHS: I thought you were going to ask  
7 him the question again.

8 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No. I don't want to ask him.  
9 It's your question. I'm just saying if you want to--

10 BY MR. BANCHS:

11 Q All right. Let me start over. I really wasn't joking.  
12 Okay. In response to Captain Bedells' questions as to  
13 whether Ms. Reed curried any special favors from Colonel  
14 Golnick, one of the things that you mentioned was that she  
15 was using NTVs and GSAs, that you didn't have any  
16 firsthand--inappropriately using GSAs and NTVs. You didn't  
17 have any firsthand knowledge of this, but it's just what  
18 you were hearing, hallway chitchat, shop talk, whatever it  
19 was.

20 A Uh-huh.

21 Q Now, I just showed you one statement from an E7 in the  
22 Michigan National Guard that does confirm that on a  
23 certain date, or at least a month and year, that she did  
24 happen to use an NTV to go to annual training. Would that  
25 be an appropriate use of an NTV--

1    **A**     **Appropriate? Yeah.**

2    Q     --by Sergeant Reed?

3    **A**     **Yeah.**

4    Q     Okay. If you don't mind flipping the page, sir, and the  
5           next statement is going to be from then Captain, now Major  
6           Ruby. If you don't mind reading that statement--

7    **A**     **Okay.**

8    Q     Is it possible that this is yet another occasion--now,  
9           this is a different date. If you recall Sergeant Ellis's  
10          statement, that was April 2012.

11   **A**     **Uh-huh.**

12   Q     This is March--from March 2012 all the way to June of 2013  
13          when he was assigned to the 277nd RSG and he recalls  
14          during annual training Master Sergeant Reed working for  
15          him using an NTV for annual training support. And he also  
16          remembers her on an IDT weekend actually during IDT  
17          weekends that he only witnessed Master Sergeant Reed using  
18          an NTV at the Jackson Armory once, and it was to transport  
19          parts. So is it possible the hallway chitchat was just  
20          that and that she was actually using NTVs appropriately?

21   **A**     **It is possible.**

22   Q     Okay, great. And we can go to the last two statements. One  
23          is from Hoag, who testified to actually seeing Master  
24          Sergeant Reed actually use a POV for a change going to  
25          drill. That's a very short statement. And then the last

1           one, if you don't mind, sir, turning to Colonel Perricane,  
2           who goes into a little more in-depth. But he also talks  
3           about Master Sergeant Reed's use of an NTV during annual  
4           training at his request. Do you have any reason to doubt  
5           any of those statements?

6   **A       No.**

7   **Q**Would that change your mind as to your opinion of Master  
8           Sergeant Reed's use of NTVs, whether it was appropriate or  
9           inappropriate?

10 **A       No.**

11 **Q**You still think that her uses were inappropriate?

12 **A       Yes, sir.**

13 **Q**And that's based on the hallway chitchat?

14 **A       Yes, sir.**

15 **Q**Okay. Fair enough. I guess I just have one more question  
16           for you, sir. You mentioned that you been knowing Renee  
17           for how many years?

18 **A       Six years. I'm not positive of--**

19 **Q**Six years. And you consider your relationship with her not  
20           just as a coworker but also as a friend--

21 **A       Yeah.**

22 **Q**--at least at one time? And you also interacted with her  
23           as a coworker and socially. Did you go TDY with her ever?

24 **A       Yeah, went to Germany.**

25 **Q**Okay. And in Germany, what were your respective ranks if

1           you don't mind me asking?

2   **A       I was candidate at the time.**

3   Q       And she was?

4   **A       E6.**

5   Q       Okay. So she was an NCO. Did you guys have occasion to

6           hang out during--

7   **A       Yeah.**

8   Q       --work and after hours?

9   **A       Yeah. There were several of us that did.**

10  Q       And what did those after-hour activities include?

11  **A       We'd go down to the bar or we went around Bamberg,**

12           **Germany.**

13  Q       So hanging out, drinking?

14  **A       Yeah.**

15  Q       Okay. So you knew her socially. You're old friends. You

16           think she was an excellent PC. Do you think she should

17           have been fired?

18  **A       I don't know the whole investigation. My recommendation in**

19           **the audio that I'm sure you have was that it--no, I**

20           **didn't. I didn't think she should have been.**

21  Q       Could your recollection of the audio--you know what? I

22           won't even go there because your--it's been a few months

23           and your recollection could be not very good. But I'm

24           asking you today as we sit here, do you think she should

25           have been fired?

1    **A**        **No. And I told her that the day after it happened and we**  
2                **were at jury duty. I said I was surprised that she got**  
3                **fired. But I don't know the whole investigation. I don't**  
4                **know what--I know what happened with me. So for me to say**  
5                **it shouldn't have happened, I don't know everything to**  
6                **really give you that answer.**

7    **Q**        **No, but that's--**

8    **A**        **In my opinion, no.**

9    **Q**        **So she shouldn't have been fired. So the follow-up**  
10               **question to that is, if she shouldn't have been fired,**  
11               **then you obviously would be okay with her being**  
12               **reinstated?**

13   **A**        **Well, that's kind of obvious, isn't it?**

14                        HEARING EXAMINER: Is that a question?

15   BY MR. BANCHS:

16   **Q**        **Would you be okay with her being reinstated?**

17   **A**        **Yeah. But I don't think she should have been fired but**  
18               **like I said, I still don't know everything else that**  
19               **happened in this investigation.**

20                        MR. BANCHS: Okay. I don't have any more  
21                questions.

22                        HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

23                        CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No, sir.

24                        HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Let me just read this  
25                to you before you go. I'll remind you that you remain

1 under oath and that you are subject to recall to this  
2 hearing until such time that it has been adjourned. And I  
3 will remind you not to discuss your testimony with anyone.  
4 And with that, you're free to go. I thank you for your  
5 time.

6 CAPTAIN BEDELLES: Thanks, Chief.

7 HEARING EXAMINER: And you won't be recalled  
8 tonight--

9 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

10 HEARING EXAMINER: --so you're free--

11 THE WITNESS: Tonight? I hope not.

12 HEARING EXAMINER: No.

13 THE WITNESS: All right. You guys have a good  
14 night.

15 HEARING EXAMINER: You can go. We're not done.

16 THE WITNESS: All right.

17 (At 9:00 p.m., witness excused)

18 MR. BANCHS: Who's left?

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLES: Burrell and Fitzpatrick.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: There's two more. Let's go  
21 off the record for just a second.

22 COURT REPORTER: It is 9:00 p.m. We are off  
23 the record.

24 (Off the record)

25 HEARING EXAMINER: Raise your right hand,

1 please.

2 MAJOR BURRELL: yes, sir.

3 COURT REPORTER: We are on the record, and the  
4 time is 9:06 p.m.

5 HEARING EXAMINER: Do you swear or affirm that  
6 the testimony you're about to give in this case is the  
7 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help  
8 you God?

9 MAJOR BURRELL: Yes, sir.

10 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
11 that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
12 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
13 testifying in this case.

14 MAJOR BURRELL: Okay.

15 HEARING EXAMINER: With that, you can have a  
16 seat. And I will turn it over to Captain Bedells.

17 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

18 MAJOR BRIAN BURRELL

19 (At 9:06 p.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

20 DIRECT EXAMINATION

21 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

22 Q Sir, will you please state your full name for the record?

23 A **Brian K. Burrell.**

24 Q Major Burrell, how are you currently employed?

25 A **I work at the MATES full time as--**

1 Q I'm sorry.

2 A **I work at the MATES full time as a QC-PC supervisor.**

3 Q Okay. And how long have you worked at the MATES facility?

4 A **August of '99 is when I was hired in there.**

5 Q And how long have you been a QC-PC supervisor?

6 A **Just a short time, maybe a couple months.**

7 Q Prior to that, what was your role?

8 A **Supervisor for the one of the teams on the floor.**

9 Q Have you had an opportunity to observe or interact with

10 Master Sergeant Reed?

11 A **Absolutely.**

12 Q Did you have an opportunity to interact with and observe

13 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

14 A **Yes, sir.**

15 Q I'm going to ask you real quickly--real quickly to take a

16 look at what is marked as Tab 9 to Exhibit 1 of the Reed

17 case file and ask you to read 1-a.

18 A **Okay.**

19 Q Following exhibit--Exhibit 9--or Tab 9 and ask you does

20 that--is that your answer that you provided in connection

21 with the 15-6?

22 A **Read it out loud or to myself?**

23 Q Just read it to yourself.

24 A **All right. Right. That's my statement.**

25 Q Okay. And you typed that yourself?



1    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

2    Q        So I just want to hit some bullet points here real quickly  
3            because Colonel Dawkins has advised us to move along.

4    **A**    **Okay.**

5    Q        But in no way shortchanging us on the record. So it's  
6            your--it's your testimony if you will that Lieutenant  
7            Colonel spends more time in Master Sergeant Reed's office  
8            than any other supervisor's office; is that correct?

9    **A**    **Yes, sir.**

10   Q        Okay. And it's your testimony that on occasion if you were  
11            looking for Lieutenant Colonel Golnick, you might find him  
12            in Master Sergeant Reed's office--

13   **A**    **Yes, sir.**

14   Q        --correct?

15   **A**    **Yes, sir.**

16   Q        And it's your testimony that in fact according to that  
17            statement a majority of Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's time  
18            was actually spent in Master Sergeant Reed's office?

19   **A**    **Yes, sir.**

20   Q        That's in the statement?

21   **A**    **Essentially, yes, sir.**

22   Q        Okay. And by majority of the time, would you say like of  
23            an eight-hour day, maybe five hours was spent in Master  
24            Sergeant Reed's office?

25   **A**    **At times I would say, you know, it could reach up to that,**

1           **yes, sir.**

2       Q       Okay. You also testified that the situation was and still  
3           is uncomfortable?

4       **A       Yes, sir.**

5       Q       I understand it no longer is, correct, because he's not  
6           there?

7       **A       Right.**

8       Q       But at the time you wrote that statement, the relationship  
9           between these two made you uncomfortable?

10      **A       Absolutely.**

11     Q       In what respect, sir?

12     **A       Just I don't want to be any part of that. I mean, it  
13           just--you know, fraternization is the word that I would  
14           have related to. I didn't agree with it. It's nothing that  
15           I could, you know, make it change. I had no control over  
16           it. But the perception of the shop and myself, it just  
17           wasn't a situation I wanted to be around.**

18     Q       And you--you actually wrote in there that this  
19           relationship appeared to be more personal than business;  
20           correct?

21     **A       At times to me, that's what my perception was.**

22     Q       Okay. And in fact at the close of your statement there,  
23           you said that it reminded you of a middle school  
24           boyfriend-girlfriend relationship. And you witnessed that;  
25           correct?

1    **A       Yeah, I seen them.**

2    Q       Okay. Now, to your knowledge, was there--did you ever  
3           personally witness anything sexual in nature between these  
4           two?

5    **A       No, absolutely not.**

6    Q       Did you happen to believe that there was anything sexual  
7           in nature?

8    **A       No, not really.**

9    Q       Okay. Not yourself?

10   **A       Not myself.**

11   Q       So inasmuch as this relationship made you uncomfortable  
12           and you're a field grade officer, did you ever think to  
13           approach Master Sergeant Reed about it?

14   **A       Did I think about approaching her with it? Yeah.**

15   Q       Did you in fact approach her about it?

16   **A       No, I did not. She was not my direct employee.**

17   Q       Whose direct employee was she to your knowledge?

18   **A       Colonel McNamara was her supervisor.**

19   Q       Did you ever think to approach Lieutenant Colonel McNamara  
20           about it?

21   **A       It had been discussed.**

22   Q       Well, it was discussed that you thought about approaching  
23           him? Or you actually did approach him?

24   **A       I approached him, yes, sir.**

25   Q       Okay. So you approached Lieutenant Colonel McNamara about

1 the relationship between Master Sergeant Reed and  
2 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

3 **A About my feelings about what I perceived of the**  
4 **relationship.**

5 Q And what did you tell him?

6 **A I told him exactly what I thought, you know, just it**  
7 **wasn't right and, you know, didn't sit well with the shop**  
8 **and the climate of the facility. And, again, it was his**  
9 **employee, and it wasn't really my realm to step in and I**  
10 **didn't feel it was right for me to step in to that**  
11 **situation and say something to her when it's his employee.**

12 Q Okay. Did you expect him to go to Lieutenant Colonel  
13 Golnick with your thoughts?

14 **A Absolutely not.**

15 Q Why not?

16 **A There was no relationship there between either of the**  
17 **Lieutenant Colonels that they would, you know, even**  
18 **discuss something like that.**

19 Q But you went to him because you understood Lieutenant  
20 Colonel McNamara to be Master Sergeant Reed's supervisor?

21 **A Right.**

22 Q Okay. Was there really, sir, a de facto supervisor for  
23 Master Sergeant--strike that. In reality, was Lieutenant  
24 Colonel McNamara Master Sergeant Reed's supervisor--

25 **A No, no.**

1 Q --or was it someone else?

2 A **It was Colonel Golnick.**

3 Q Did you think to approach Lieutenant Colonel Golnick about  
4 the relationship then?

5 A **Yes. I considered it but I approached him on multiple  
6 occasions before on different things, and it wasn't going  
7 to go nowhere for me. So I, you know--I didn't even think  
8 about it any further.**

9 Q Nothing good was going to come of it if you go to him?

10 A **Exactly.**

11 Q Got it; check. Okay. And I'm almost finished. One final  
12 question here. Do you think that Master Sergeant Reed  
13 derived any benefits as a result of this relationship she  
14 had with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

15 A **Yes, I do.**

16 Q Okay. Well, then that wasn't my final question. So what  
17 benefits do you think she derived?

18 A **I think, you know, because of the situation, there was  
19 some preferential treatment there. Again, it was my--my  
20 perception that there was preferential treatment, you  
21 know, utilization of things that I don't know that would  
22 be afforded to other employees. So--**

23 Q Such as?

24 A **You know, NTVs. I believe that I can count on two to three  
25 occurrences where I believe she was allowed the use of an**

1 NTV where another employee in a similar situation probably  
2 wouldn't have been able to use one so--

3 Q Okay. Did you ever observe--well, in light of the  
4 instruction I got, I'm not going to go there.

5 A Okay.

6 Q I was going to ask you about lunches and dinners but we're  
7 all getting hungry. So I've got no further questions, sir.  
8 Thanks.

9 A Yeah.

10 HEARING EXAMINER: Mr. Banchs?

11 CROSS-EXAMINATION

12 BY MR. BANCHS:

13 Q Major, did you ever supervise Sergeant Reed?

14 A Yes, I did, on the military side.

15 Q How about as a technician?

16 A I don't believe so.

17 Q Did you ever approve leave for Sergeant Reed?

18 A Yes, I have.

19 Q On how many times?

20 A Maybe at least a dozen times.

21 Q And during the course of what year to what year, sir?

22 A I'd say--let's see. Renee was hired 2005 maybe, somewhere  
23 in that realm. I would say probably at least for several  
24 years, at times I would see her leave slips cross my desk.

25 Q So was it closer to the time she got hired? Or was it

1 closer to the time she got fired?

2 **A I would say probably from the mid point to the end.**

3 **Q** Okay. And at this time, Colonel Golnick was the  
4 superintendent of the facility as well; right?

5 **A Yes, sir.**

6 **Q** Were you ever under any--from Colonel Golnick to approve  
7 Sergeant Reed's leave?

8 **A Yes.**

9 **Q** Okay. Did she ever bypass you?

10 **A Well, I don't know if she bypass--she never bypassed me,**  
11 **no. But Colonel McNamara was her, on paper, supervisor.**  
12 **So--**

13 **Q** Be if you weren't her supervisor, why would she come to  
14 you for leave?

15 **A That's a great point. A lot of times there's only four or**  
16 **five supervisors at the shop. You know, I might be gone,**  
17 **so my employees that I'm directly responsible for would go**  
18 **to Colonel McNamara or Colonel--even Colonel Golnick at**  
19 **times would have to approve those leave slips.**

20 **Q** So now you--you wouldn't--I would say that in your written  
21 statement, you did go pretty in-depth as to why you were  
22 uncomfortable in your perception of the relationship being  
23 inappropriate. But at the very beginning of your  
24 statement, you say the bottom line up front there is a  
25 perception but no known facts that you know of?

- 1    **A**     **Correct.**
- 2    Q     So how do you--how do you wrestle with that?
- 3    **A**     **I guess it's the time that I saw with the climate that I**  
4         **felt as a result of that. And that's--that's where my**  
5         **perception was stemmed from.**
- 6    Q     And when you say "climate," sir what do you mean?
- 7    **A**     **My peer group and, you know, those that, you know, I**  
8         **discussed the situation with were somewhat similar in how**  
9         **we--what we felt and what we believed.**
- 10   Q     And now, you said that your perception was that the  
11         relationship was more personal than work-related. But  
12         certainly, work was taking place?
- 13   **A**     **Absolutely. At times it was, yes, sir.**
- 14   Q     And this is--I don't think I'll get challenged on this.  
15         Everybody that's testified so far today has said that  
16         Sergeant Reed was an excellent PC.
- 17   **A**     **Absolutely.**
- 18   Q     So was the relationship interfering with her work?
- 19   **A**     **I don't--I don't know if that's true or not. I think it--a**  
20         **lot of times it tied in with the work. That's my**  
21         **understanding, my belief.**
- 22   Q     Her job--and in other words--I'll rephrase it. Her job was  
23         not--the quality of her work was not diminished because of  
24         what was going on?
- 25   **A**     **I don't think so.**



1 Q Okay. How about the facility as a whole? Did MATES suffer  
2 insofar as not being able to perform the mission because  
3 of what was going on here?

4 A **No, sir.**

5 Q Now, when you--when you talk about--you characterized it  
6 as fraternization but you said there's "nothing I could  
7 change." Could you expand on that, sir?

8 A **Yeah. I'd been the supervisor since roughly 2001, probably**  
9 **before Renee was hired. I had approached Colonel Golnick**  
10 **multiple times on different things, and Colonel Golnick,**  
11 **in my opinion, wasn't a very strong supporter of the**  
12 **supervisors in my shop.**

13 Q Yes, sir.

14 A **So that's where--that's where--that's what my intention**  
15 **was with that statement.**

16 Q He was just a hard person to deal with?

17 A **At times.**

18 Q Would it be out of line for me to characterize it as his  
19 way or the highway?

20 A **I guess so, yeah.**

21 Q Okay. So would it be fair to say that--before I ask this  
22 question, the--who was in whose office? Was it more the  
23 case that Colonel Golnick was in Mrs. Reed's office versus  
24 her being in his office?

25 A **Correct.**

1 Q And this is speculative but--well, before I speculate, was  
2 it ever the case that Mrs. Reed was in his office that you  
3 know of?

4 A **She was there on business purposes before. I seen her**  
5 **conduct day-to-day operations in there, infrequently**  
6 **though.**

7 Q But would it be the case that she would be in his office  
8 all day?

9 A **No.**

10 Q Okay. So had Colonel Golnick not gone to Mrs. Reed's  
11 office, would she have gone to his?

12 A **Probably not.**

13 Q Well, you know what, I'll get directly to the point. You  
14 testified that he was quote, unquote, "hard person to deal  
15 with." If she would have asked him to stop coming in his  
16 (sic) office, do you think he would have?

17 A **I don't know that he would have.**

18 Q Okay. Fair enough. And this goes along the same lines, but  
19 I just want to reiterate. You did discuss this with  
20 Lieutenant Colonel McNamara. You testified that you  
21 discussed your feelings with him, and the reason you did  
22 that, one was because he was on paper her direct  
23 supervisor?

24 A **Right.**

25 Q But then you also testified that there was no chance that

1 Colonel McNamara was ever going to approach Colonel  
2 Golnick. And that was for what reason, sir?

3 **A The relationship between the Lieutenant Colonels was not a**  
4 **good relationship. And that was my point there. My hope**  
5 **was that Colonel McNamara would go to that employee,**  
6 **Renee, and talk to her directly. Whether or not that**  
7 **occurred, I don't think it did but--**

8 Q Okay. And then the last thing that we'll touch on, sir, is  
9 the preferential treatment. And you said that it was your  
10 perception that at least concerning the use of NTVs that  
11 on a few occasions that Sergeant Reed was allowed to use  
12 NTVs where other individuals might not have?

13 **A Correct.**

14 Q But even on those occasions where--where the use of--was  
15 the use of NTVs by Sergeant Reed not in accordance with  
16 the regulations?

17 **A The vehicle that I believe she used in those--on those few**  
18 **occurrences that I believe that are fact, they were not**  
19 **through the appropriate or right channels. They were--I**  
20 **believe she used Colonel Golnick's direct vehicle.**

21 Q And this is based on what? Is it firsthand knowledge, sir?  
22 Or is it just--

23 **A Yeah, based on what my observations were.**

24 Q Okay. But did--was it that she didn't sign it out  
25 appropriately or--

- 1    **A**    Again, it's that perception of preferential treatment.  
2            "Hey, I've got my vehicle here. Why don't you take this"  
3            versus going through the correct channels, where the  
4            correct channels would have been, "Hey, my supervisor,  
5            Colonel McNamara, I'd like to take this vehicle for these  
6            purposes" and sign it out through this office.
- 7    **Q**    So the issue was with the requisition of the vehicle, not  
8            necessarily what it was used for?
- 9    **A**    Well, in addition to that. The use of the vehicle was on  
10           normally an IDT weekend or a drill weekend. A lot of  
11           soldiers drive long distance. You know, I drove to the  
12           U.P. for multiple years, and I didn't use NTVs from the  
13           shop. I drive downstate also.
- 14   **Q**    Yes, sir.
- 15   **A**    So that's my point, is that--that's when it was used was  
16           on an IDT weekend and it was channeled through, you know,  
17           the wrong lane, I guess it would be.
- 18   **Q**    Roger that. Now, are there any other employees at the  
19           MATES in addition to Sergeant Reed that would use NTVs or  
20           even GSAs to either go to drill, AT or any other  
21           official--
- 22   **A**    **Yeah.**
- 23   **Q**    --function?
- 24   **A**    **Yeah. I've seen other employees do it also.**
- 25   **Q**    Okay. So the use of NTVs or GSAs in conjunction with

1           either military or technician duties is not something that  
2           is strictly--that Sergeant Reed was the only one that was  
3           doing it?

4    **A       No, I wouldn't say that she was the only one.**

5    Q       Okay. Fair enough, sir. What is your current position now,  
6           sir?

7    **A       Quality control supervisor.**

8    Q       Have you had occasion at all to review the results of the  
9           15-6, or are you aware of the investigating officer's  
10          report of investigation?

11   **A       No, not that I can recollect. I don't remember looking at**  
12          **any of those.**

13   Q       Well, I can show you because it's in the record but--in  
14          the investigating officer's recommendations, he actually  
15          recommended that you become the facility superintendent.  
16          Were you aware of that?

17   **A       No.**

18   Q       Okay. Well, having that knowledge--and I know that's not  
19          what's going on now, sir, because--

20   **A       Right.**

21   Q       --some other people have been selected.

22   **A       Right.**

23   Q       But you are still in a position of trust and supervision;  
24          correct?

25   **A       Yes, sir.**

1 Q Okay. Had you become the superintendent or even in your  
2 current position--before I ask you that, would you  
3 have--do you think that Sergeant Reed should have been  
4 fired based on your knowledge of what was going on?

5 A No.

6 Q Would you care to expand on that?

7 A I worked with Renee Reed at the shop for multiple years. I  
8 worked with her on the military side. I was her direct  
9 supervisor on the military side just out of a fluke the  
10 last six to twelve months. She's a great worker, great  
11 work ethic. I just think she was in a--again, my  
12 perception of the situation she was in was--you know, she  
13 wasn't in a good spot. No, she shouldn't have been fired.

14 Q Well, and the follow-up--the question that I originally  
15 was going to ask you was, had you been the superintendent  
16 or even in your current position, would you have an issue  
17 with Sergeant Reed being reinstated as an employee at the  
18 MATES?

19 A No.

20 MR. BANCHS: Thank you very much, sir.

21 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

22 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No further questions.

23 HEARING EXAMINER: Before you go, I'll remind  
24 you that you remain under oath and that you are subject to  
25 recall to this hearing until such time that it has been

1 adjourned. Again, I will remind you not to discuss your  
2 testimony with anyone else.

3 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

4 HEARING EXAMINER: And with that, you're free  
5 to go.

6 THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

7 HEARING EXAMINER: Thanks for your time.

8 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

9 (At 9:23 p.m., witness excused)

10 HEARING EXAMINER: Are you guys ready for the  
11 next one?

12 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Yes, sir.

13 MR. BANCHS: Yes, sir.

14 HEARING EXAMINER: Who is that?

15 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Fitzpatrick.

16 MR. BANCHS: Is this the last one?

17 HEARING EXAMINER: For tonight.

18 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: But I'm not going to close  
19 my proofs, because I still have McNamara to go tomorrow.  
20 So I don't know how you want to do that. And he won't be  
21 available until--

22 HEARING EXAMINER: You said you don't want to  
23 do a closing--

24 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No. I don't want to close my  
25 proofs. I mean, I--

1 HEARING EXAMINER: Oh, yeah, yeah, yeah.

2 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I still have the case to put  
3 on and McNamara needs to testify tomorrow.

4 HEARING EXAMINER: Right. Yeah, we're just--

5 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: We'll just take them out of  
6 order tomorrow.

7 HEARING EXAMINER: We'll just--we'll just  
8 adjourn for the night--

9 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay.

10 HEARING EXAMINER: --and pick up in the  
11 morning. Chief, stand for just a second and raise your  
12 right hand. Do you swear or affirm that the testimony  
13 you're about to give in this case is the truth, the whole  
14 truth, and nothing but the truth so help you God?

15 CHIEF FITZPATRICK: I do.

16 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
17 that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
18 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
19 testifying in this case. And with that, you may have a  
20 seat.

21 CHIEF FITZPATRICK: Thanks.

22 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

23 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

24 CHIEF ROBERT FITZPATRICK

25 (At 9: 26 p.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

Q Chief, I'm going to--first, would you state your full name for the record? And you can sit down. State your full name for the record.

**A Robert Fitzpatrick.**

Q Okay. You're about to be hugely disappointed, Chief, because you've sat here all day, and I'm going to ask you about three questions. So sorry about that in advance. And one of them is your name, so I'm already through one.

**A Good deal.**

Q Take a moment to read your--read what's been marked as Tab 10 to Exhibit 1 in this matter, which is the MATES 15-6 Book 1. And I would like you to read, Chief, what has been--what is included as your sworn statement, paragraph 1. Okay?

**A Okay. You want me to read the whole thing?**

Q Just one. You don't even--

**A Just 1?**

Q --need to read 2.

**A The whole thing of 1?**

Q Correct.

**A Okay. Inappropriate relations--**

Q No, not out loud, just to yourself.

**A Okay.**

1 Q Sorry. It's been a long day as you know.

2 A Okay.

3 Q Chief, as you read that statement, do you recall writing

4 that statement in connection with this investigation?

5 A Yes, sir.

6 Q Okay. So those are your own words?

7 A Yes, sir.

8 Q Including your answer that you believe the relationship

9 between Master Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel

10 Golnick, and I'm quoting, "degrades the professional

11 stature of MATES and affects the morale of the employees"?

12 Is that correct? That's the last sentence of your

13 statement.

14 A Okay.

15 Q Do you see that?

16 A Yes.

17 Q Do you stand by those words?

18 A Yes, sir.

19 Q Okay. And in light of that, I understand you spoke with

20 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick about this, the fact that it

21 degraded the professional stature of MATES? Is that

22 correct?

23 A Yes, sir.

24 Q And what did you tell Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

25 A I just, right--the subject had come up between I think

1           **several people in his office one day.**

2    Q       Yeah.

3    A       **I asked him about it. He said it didn't happen and denied**  
4           **it. At that point it was--I dropped it at that point.**

5    Q       Okay. How about--how about Master Sergeant Reed? Did you  
6           talk to Master Sergeant Reed about this relationship that  
7           in your estimation degraded the professional stature of  
8           MATES and affected the morale of the employees?

9    A       **I don't recall an actual place, but I'm sure that we spoke**  
10           **about it. And she also denied it. And at that point I also**  
11           **dropped it.**

12   Q       Okay. Fair enough. Now, did it affect your morale?

13   A       **No, sir.**

14   Q       Why not?

15   A       **Because I don't feel there was anything going on.**

16   Q       So who told you that it affected their morale then?  
17           Because you concluded that it affected the morale of  
18           employees.

19   A       **You could see that it--the people--I mean, people stopped**  
20           **what they were doing and talked about it. So they--you**  
21           **know, they would stop doing their job. They would stop**  
22           **moving forward. Basically it was an interruption in the**  
23           **workflow of the day and the progress of the MATES. And**  
24           **perceived, I guess, you know, showed that it was a**  
25           **disruption to the shop.**

1 Q You still work at MATES; right?

2 A **Correct, sir.**

3 Q Are those disruptions still happening now that Lieutenant  
4 Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant Reed aren't there?

5 A **As far as--**

6 Q Is there any more talk about it that disrupts the  
7 workforce?

8 A **Just this investigation, yes.**

9 Q Okay. I don't have anything further.

10 A **Okay.**

11 HEARING EXAMINER: Mr. Banchs?

12 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I told you you'd be  
13 disappointed.

14 THE WITNESS: Okay, thanks.

15 MR. BANCHS: Thank you.

16 CROSS-EXAMINATION

17 BY MR. BANCHS:

18 Q Sir, you just testified that you wrote this statement but  
19 that you don't believe anything was going on?

20 A **No, sir, not that I could see.**

21 Q And you said that people would--and in answer to Captain  
22 Bedells' questions about your statement, that the  
23 perceived relationship degrades professional stature of  
24 the MATES and affects the morale of employees, not yours  
25 but others. And that was because they would--they were

1           stopping what they were doing?

2   **A**       **They would have their own little groups that they get**  
3           **together and talk about it and poke fun and, you know, not**  
4           **be professional about it.**

5   Q        Would it be fair to characterize it as a distraction?

6   **A**       **I guess, yes.**

7   Q        I mean, it didn't actually stop work at any point in time,  
8           did it?

9   **A**       **It would if they stopped and talked. They weren't working**  
10           **while they were talking.**

11   Q        Granted. But did it actually stop MATES from performing or  
12           accomplishing the mission?

13   **A**       **No. But I think it kept--you know, no, I don't think it**  
14           **stopped them from--**

15   Q        Okay. What was--what is your job, sir? I don't think we  
16           established that. What do you do at the MATES?

17   **A**       **I'm supervisor of the auto--it's now auto-1, which is now**  
18           **the main floor.**

19   Q        And are you WM or WS?

20   **A**       **WS.**

21   Q        WS what, sir?

22   **A**       **WS11.**

23   Q        Eleven? Okay. And did you ever have occasion to supervise  
24           Sergeant Reed?

25   **A**       **No, sir.**

1 Q Do you know that--do you know Sergeant Reed outside of  
2 work?

3 A **Just a little bit, not very much.**

4 Q Just around town?

5 A **Yeah.**

6 Q All right. And everybody who has testified so far today  
7 did attest to Sergeant Reed's--Sergeant Reed being an  
8 excellent PC. Some said excellent, outstanding, the best  
9 one in the state.

10 A **Yes.**

11 Q Would that be a fair characterization of her  
12 qualifications?

13 A **That'd be very fair.**

14 Q Even those there was this perception--I'll ask it a  
15 different way. You know, I'll just get straight to the  
16 point, sir. Do you think Sergeant Reed should have been  
17 fired?

18 A **No, sir.**

19 Q Okay. And why is that?

20 A **My personal opinion is it's not what it looks--I mean, if  
21 you take that into consideration, when everybody left here  
22 last week to go to lunch, would it be safe to assume the  
23 same stuff was happening? I don't think so. So I think it  
24 was unfair. You know, I think you need to look a little  
25 deeper than what it looks like on the outside and just not**

1 go ahead and assume. And that's what a lot of people do.  
2 They just assumed, and then it became--some people did a  
3 vindictive way of looking at it. Other people used it as  
4 joking thing. You know, I don't know why people do what  
5 they do but I find, you know, it doesn't help, so why go  
6 through with it. And I personally have other things to do  
7 during the day than worry about that kind of stuff.

8 Q Roger that. And the follow-up question to that, sir, is,  
9 were Sergeant Reed be reinstated to her job as a  
10 technician, would you have any issue with that? Or would  
11 you have an issue with her working at the MATES?

12 A **No, sir.**

13 MR. BANCHS: Thank you very much, sir.

14 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

15 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I have a follow-up.

16 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

17 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

18 Q Chief, when you say people assume stuff, okay, you  
19 didn't--you testified yourself you didn't assume anything;  
20 correct? Well, what did you assume they were assuming?

21 A **They there was something inappropriate going on.**

22 Q Like what inappropriate?

23 A **I would hate to even guess.**

24 Q Well, you must have guessed because you said, "I'm not  
25 going to assume."

1    **A**    **I'm not going to assume that--**

2    Q    But you've assumed what other people were assuming.

3            Correct? In other words,--

4    **A**    **I don't know if I follow your question, sir.**

5    Q    Okay. Well, do you think other people were assuming there

6            was a sexual relationship going on?

7    **A**    **Maybe some did.**

8    Q    And that's what you thought was improper; correct?

9    **A**    **That they were having--I would have no proof of that.**

10   Q    No. I understand that. Is it the case that what you

11           thought was improper was people were assuming there was a

12           sexual relationship going on? Correct?

13   **A**    **I guess. I just--you know, they mostly from--you know,**

14           **they shouldn't--I don't know. Maybe they thought they**

15           **shouldn't be together. Maybe they thought there was stuff**

16           **going on outside. I don't know. All I know is they would**

17           **come to me and say, "Well, they have a relationship."**

18           **Maybe they don't.**

19   Q    A sexual relationship they would say?

20   **A**    **Some of them would, yes. They assumed--**

21   Q    Okay. Because I'm going to tell you, Chief, you might find

22           this surprising at this late stage of the day. No one's

23           testified today that there was any sort of sexual

24           relationship whatsoever. So you were assuming something

25           that other people weren't even assuming. Is that fair to



1 say?

2 **A I guess if you're saying I was assuming something, but**  
3 **like I said I had no proof of anything.**

4 Q I'm trying to find out, Chief, what you were assuming. So  
5 you've testified that you didn't want to think there was a  
6 sexual relationship and you think other people were  
7 assuming that. But I'm telling you that no one's testified  
8 that way today. So does that surprise you?

9 **A Yeah.**

10 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. Then no further  
11 questions.

12 HEARING EXAMINER: Recross?

13 RECROSS-EXAMINATION

14 BY MR. BANCHS:

15 Q Well, to be fair, Chief, not everybody that works at the  
16 MATES has testified in this proceeding.

17 **A Okay.**

18 Q So just to follow up on the Captain's question, who did  
19 you talk to who made you think that they thought there was  
20 a sexual relationship going on? Do you recall? And if you  
21 don't recall, that's fine.

22 **A It's been too long.**

23 Q So the possibility is that the person told you or made you  
24 think there was a sexual relationship going on, they maybe  
25 have not testified in this proceeding?

1    **A       They may not have been questioned at all.**

2                   MR. BANCHS:   Okay. Thank you very much.

3                   HEARING EXAMINER:  All right. Chief, I'll  
4       remind you that you remain under oath and that you are  
5       subject to recall to this hearing until such time that it  
6       has been adjourned. I will remind you not to discuss your  
7       testimony with anyone else.

8                   THE WITNESS:   Okay. Thank you.

9                   HEARING EXAMINER:  And with that, thanks for  
10      your time and you're free to go for tonight.

11                  THE WITNESS:   Thank you.

12                  (At 9:36 p.m., witness excused)

13                  HEARING EXAMINER:  We will reconvene at 08:00  
14      tomorrow morning, and with that we can go off the record.

15                  COURT REPORTER:  It is now 9:36 p.m., and we  
16      are off the record.

17                  (At 9:36 p.m., proceedings concluded)

18                                       -0-0-0-

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

RECORDER'S CERTIFICATE AND NOTARIZATION

I do hereby certify that on the date and at the place set forth on the title page hereof, there did personally appear before me, a Notary Public, the witness named on the title page; that I did swear said person to tell the truth and did then electronically record their testimony, the same being later reduced to typewriting, and that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcription of said electronic recording.

I further certify that I am not related to or employed by any party to this cause or their respective counsel.

Teresa A. Sotuyo



Teresa A. Sotuyo

Notary Public - CER - 4812

My commission expires: 2/26/2020